

**June 2011**

**Editorial**

*Mission history*

Larry Nemer

---

**Larry Nemer**, SVD, has a doctorate in Mission History from Cambridge University and has been teaching Mission History for over forty years in the United States, the Philippines, London, Vietnam and Australia. He presently is lecturing at Yarra Theological Union, Box Hill.

---

The major but not exclusive theme of this issue is Mission History. This is an important and integral part of mission studies that is often neglected. We need to know what happened in the past not only to understand the missionaries of the time and the people to whom they went but also to search out the working of the Holy Spirit in the development of the local Churches.

Mission Historians of late have become very conscious of the fact that so many of our stories are based on the documents we find in the archives of Mission Societies and Agencies and the letters of missionaries. But this is only one part of the story. We need to hear the experience of the people to whom the Gospel was proclaimed – what was understood, what was accepted, and what was rejected. But this is more difficult to recover. Many of these peoples were not literate, and so there would be only oral accounts of their experience. Historians today are most interested both in using such sources and in preserving them. As these sources become available we will be able to assess not only the remarkable things that missionaries did but also those things for which we have to say “sorry”. I try to address this topic in the lead article of this issue.

The reader will find a broad spectrum of articles covering mission in the past on Nagasaki, Mongolia, New Zealand, and Melanesia. There are also articles which cover “contemporary history” on Mission in Asia, Church Leavers, Chaplains in State Schools, and Crossway’s Mission. Finally there are two reflection papers on the recent Lausanne Conference in South Africa.

We think you will find the reviews of the four books presented in this issue interesting, competent and stimulating. They no doubt will make you want to buy the books for yourselves: *Women in Mission*. *From the New Testament to Today*; *Blood and Fire*; *Letters and Sketches from the New Hebrides*; *Facing the Future*.

Happy reading.

## Treasures old and new: A historian's reflections on contemporary Catholic mission theology

Larry Nemer

---

**Larry Nemer**, SVD, has a doctorate in Mission History from Cambridge University and has been teaching Mission History for over forty years in the United States, the Philippines, London, Vietnam and Australia. He presently is lecturing at Yarra Theological Union, Box Hill.

---

*Through the study of mission history we can come to appreciate the guidance of the Holy Spirit in the life of the Church. What does it mean? Why is it important not only to study the past but to dialogue with it? This article explores, in a tentative way answers to these questions. It examines the mission theology in the decades since the end of Vatican II: presence and witness as part of the mission task; the importance of local cultures in creating local Churches; a respect for other religions and a call for dialogue; ecology; reconciliation; and globalisation. Dialoguing with the past means letting the missionaries of the past tell us how they saw what they were doing and why – their work and their spirituality. But it also means listening to the people responding to the missionaries, recognising and accepting the “baggage” from the past and being ready to ask forgiveness. In this way we can be proud of past accomplishments even while realising their limitations.*

---

I have been teaching Church History for forty plus years. I have truly enjoyed it and felt that I learned many new things with each course that I taught. Since most students came with a certain bias against history, I found that I had to persuade them of its importance. I gave them many reasons why they should study it and why they would find it interesting. Among the goals that I always listed was to come to appreciate the guidance of the Holy Spirit in the life of the Church (although one Filipino seminarian, after hearing me talk about the Arian controversies, thought I did not even believe in the Holy Spirit). But it is only in the last few years that I have been asking myself the question: what do I mean by that? And why do I constantly repeat that it is important for us not only to study the past but to dialogue with it - and what do I mean by that? I am hoping to explore in a tentative way answers to these questions in this article. This is just a superficial (but accurate - at least in terms of our present understandings, I hope) glance at our mission history.

I had two somewhat recent experiences which challenged me to pursue this topic. One was my commission to write two articles for the revised **New Catholic Encyclopedia** (2003): **Mission and Missions**, and **History of Christian Mission (Catholic)**. As I struggled to summarise the two topics, I began to realise how even in my own thinking it is so easy to keep the two topics apart: to talk about Mission and Missions in its contemporary understanding without even a nod in the direction of history; and to look at history as if it is something in the past which has no impact on our present understandings and activity. A second experience was offering a Seminar on Missionary Spirituality in 2001 at the Missionary Institute London. Eight of the ten students were from Africa. One of the exercises in the Seminar was to have them talk about their missionary heroes and heroines. As the Africans did this, I was surprised not only at what I thought were caricatures of missionaries that were presented (and they were talking about their own experience and not that of their parents) but also at the deep resentment that was felt at the way the missionaries treated their cultures and their religious traditions in the past. I guess I expected that since they had been in formation programmes already for several years they would have had a more sympathetic understanding of what the missionaries were doing. It made me realise that dialogue with the past was not going to be an easy thing to do - nor was it always going to be pleasant.

### **A historian's look at contemporary mission theology – Or, where have we come from and where are we going?**

Mission theology, like Jacques Brel, is alive and well and living not only in Paris but also in the six continents. A historian might describe the situation under three headings: developments that have come out of Vatican II; developments due to changing circumstances; and finally the recognition and

acknowledgement of the important role that the Holy Spirit plays in the development of mission and therefore of mission theology today.

Many of the developments of mission theology in the decades since the end of Vatican II can be grouped according to the three "new" insights that came out of **Ad Gentes** and **Nostra Aetate**.

The first "new" insight for Catholics was that presence and witness is already part of the mission task. For centuries, missionaries had been concerned about the corporal works of mercy; but these were often seen as pre-evangelisation or a means of making converts. However, **Ad Gentes** pointed out, and Paul VI later developed this in **Populorum Progressio**, that missionaries must be concerned about the full development of peoples for the sake of the Kingdom, even when the Gospel cannot be preached. This led mission theologians in the late sixties and early seventies to develop the theology of development. Not only were missionaries in this period taken up with development projects, but some theologians were even suggesting that development was the new name for mission. Under this heading could be put liberation theology. It was the recognition that development as it was being practised in the western nations and by western missionaries was not working in Latin America that led Gustavo Gutierrez and others to realise that what was needed was not more development but a change of unjust structures - liberation. The literature of mission theology in the seventies and eighties was filled with books and articles that explored liberation theology, not only as it was developing in Latin America, but also in the African-American Community in the United States, the women's communities in the West, and the minority communities in Asia.

A second "new" insight of **Ad Gentes** that impacted the development of mission theology was that local cultures were good things and these are what made the Church local. This meant two things. First, the new Christian communities were to be citizens of their countries, active in its political development (a missionary in China in the early nineteen-hundreds would have been surprised to hear this). Secondly, they were to be at home in their culture and allow their Christian faith to be enriched by their cultural traditions and understandings. This was a sea-change in missionary thinking from the nineteenth century when missionaries were still constricted by the condemnations resulting from the Rites Controversy. The basis for this new respect for the local cultures was the acceptance of Justin's teachings about the "seeded Word of God". Since the early nineteen-eighties discussion on this topic has come under the heading of inculturation.

The third "new" insight of Vatican II that impacted mission theology in the subsequent decades was found in **Nostra Aetate**: a respect for other religions and a call for dialogue. This was accepted in principle. Again, the theological basis offered was Justin's "seeded word of God". Guidelines have been laid down for dialogue; but an accepted theology of religious pluralism is still being worked out. This is evident from the controversy surrounding the work of Jacques Dupuis and of the Congregation for the Faith's **Dominus Iesus**. If inculturation seems to be the preoccupation of African theologians, then religious pluralism could be said to be the preoccupation of Asian theologians.

A second category of developments in mission theology since Vatican II could be described as issues that do not come from the insights of Vatican II, but from a changed situation in the world in which mission is lived and done.

The first issue which has attracted the attention of some mission theologians, especially since the late nineteen-eighties, is ecology. At every international meeting of missiologists since the early nineteen-nineties this topic has at least been on the agenda of the meeting if it has not actually dominated the meeting. The concern comes from the damage that is being done to our universe and the danger this poses for future generations. Australian Catholic theologians such as Denis Edwards and Tony Kelly continue to develop this theology.

A second issue which does not come out of the insights of Vatican II, but which has become prominent in the writings of mission theologians such as Robert Schreiter, is reconciliation. Over the past decades there has been an increase of violence due to ethnic and racial hatred. The constant remembrance of the Holocaust is meant to make sure that something like that never happens again. Yet it has; and it has left peoples with a hatred for one another that makes reconciliation very difficult. Many mission theologians, along with Robert Schreiter and Claude-Marie Barbour, are working not only to develop a theology that would underpin this ministry but also a spirituality that would support one in carrying it out.

A third issue that has turned up in almost every recent missiological meeting is globalisation. Perhaps it is too early to summarise the thoughts of mission theologians on this topic. There is still a large variety of definitions; and there seems to be no agreement on its impact on the world and the Church. That such a process is taking place and that it is causing a cultural and identity crisis for peoples seems obvious; what one is to think about it does not.

A final point in a historian's summary of contemporary mission theology is that, in the writings of mission theologians since Vatican II, there is a more explicit acknowledgement that mission theology like missionary activity itself is under the guidance of the Holy Spirit. Mission theology is always bound to be one of the most exciting disciplines to study because its agenda is set not by the needs of the Church and the interests of theologians but by the work of the Holy Spirit in the world. This can possibly be seen in the leadership of John Paul II in his dealings with the Jews and other religious leaders. He does not seem to have been guided by theological insights carefully worked out, but rather has gone forward and invited religious leaders to pray with him for peace at Assisi and prayed with the Jews at the Western Wall of the Temple; he has left it to theologians to figure out on what theological basis he could do this.

### **Dialogue with the past: are there foundations for what we are doing?**

What is meant by dialogue in this case? It means letting the past talk to us and our having a willingness to listen. We must be ready to let the actors in history describe, declaim, and explain their experience. We must listen to them describe what they were doing and why -- in a non-judgmental way. Our purpose is to know, understand and appreciate them and their activity. When we do this we find that there are indeed foundations in our tradition for contemporary mission theology.

There are many different experiences that might be considered but in this article I would like to focus on just three characteristics of missionaries in the past that provide foundations for what we are doing in mission today: concern for individuals; openness to circumstances; and emphasis on a profound spirituality.

In the long history of missionary activity, there are many examples of missionaries being concerned about the peoples to whom they went, concerned not only for the salvation of their souls, but also for the improvement of their lives. From the Irish and Benedictine monks who built their monasteries in the swamps and forests of Europe in order to develop the land and teach people farming to the Franciscans, Dominicans and Augustinians who went to Latin America and the Philippines and established their "conventos" with their schools to teach people reading, singing, and the industrial arts, these missionaries sought to improve the lives of the people even when they were slow to become Christians. Francis of Assisi was willing to let his friars go and serve among the Moslems even though he knew they could not preach Christ. Francis Xavier, on his arrival in Goa, before preaching or baptising, went to the hospital to look after the dying.

But it was especially in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries that the missionary movement took on this characteristic of care for the physical well-being of individuals. One has only to open the mission magazines of these times to read the stories about and see the photos of schools, clinics and hospitals. While some Sisters came to Canada already in the mid-sixteen hundreds, it was not until the eighteen-hundreds that women began to go out in large numbers. Some congregations of women were founded specifically to serve in the foreign missions (as they were then called); others, like the Daughters of Charity, simply took the ministry they were doing in Europe and transferred it to wherever they were going, building schools, orphanages, clinics and hospitals. Their story is only beginning to be told now.

It was not only women who were engaged in this ministry of witness - development - liberation. Brothers also began to go out in the nineteenth century and establish schools and trade shops. They would educate young men to read and write as well as to develop skills that they might need to make a living in the developing colonies. Sometimes these Brothers would go to areas where there was little hope of making converts, but not always by their own choice as can be seen in the Holy Cross Brothers' work in Bangladesh (Pope Pius IX would only give final approval to their Congregation if they accepted the mission in Bangladesh). However, they were there to improve the life of the people.

No doubt every missionary congregation can point to one or more of their missionaries who were engaged in this kind of ministry. One well-known example of this would be Damian de Vuester. His volunteering to stay on Molokai with the lepers changed their lives. Where there was hopelessness and a disregard for their own lives, he brought the desire to care for themselves, to build houses, to respect one another, and eventually to bring a hospital that would stop the development of the disease.

These are just some of the people who in the past have shaped the identity of missionaries and with whom there must be dialogue. Perhaps the rapidity with which the Catholic Church embraced the missionary tasks of witness - development - liberation can be understood when their past history is considered.

In the past, there were also missionaries who for the most part have been open to unexpected circumstances and have adjusted their missionary task, or at least the focus of it, accordingly. The ancient Irish monks might fit into this category. They left Ireland not to convert peoples but to "wander for the sake of Christ" - the highest form of asceticism that an Irish monk could practice. But once they settled in Scotland, northern England, or on the Continent, they quickly found that for their own security they had to Christianise the people around them. Boniface might be a better example of a person who had to adapt to a missionary task he had not set out to do. He went to the continent from England to convert his Saxon cousins. However Rome directed him to reform and organise the Church in the Frankish Kingdom instead. And this he did in a most faithful way.

However, one need not look to the long-distant past to find missionaries who adapted to unexpected circumstances and developed new and creative ways of doing mission. No doubt every missionary congregation, male and female, can tell stories of such people. The case of Constant Lievens, SJ, is not exceptional. He worked in northeast India at the end of the nineteenth century. When he found that Indian landlords were oppressing the tribals, he studied law and then took the landlords to court to win the rights of the tribals. Missionaries went out to preach and found themselves establishing institutions of higher learning. Sisters went out to heal and found themselves establishing teaching hospitals and training nurses. In Nigeria in the late nineteenth century, a group of Spiritan missionaries were not sure what to do about the young men who were becoming Christians but felt dislocated in their own villages, so they set up an institution to teach them farming. The English government was so impressed by this that they were even willing to give these French Catholic missionaries financial subsidies and government awards.

The stories of men and women who did remarkable but unexpected things in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries are legion. Missionaries became explorers, road-builders, well-diggers, farmers, nurses, doctors, airplane pilots, university professors, kindergarten teachers, etc, etc. This willingness to do whatever the circumstances demanded became a characteristic of modern missionaries.

Finally, missionaries of the past often talked about their spirituality. Their love of God and commitment to save souls prompted them both to go and to stay. Down through the centuries they would talk about it differently. The Irish monks would focus on their asceticism and their commitment to auricular confession. The friars going to Latin America would talk of their commitment to the poor and to the service of the truth (even if it meant using the Inquisition). Francis Xavier wrote many letters to Ignatius articulating the spirituality he had developed through the Spiritual Exercises. Isaac Jogues spoke openly of his desire for martyrdom. Each of these would have reflected both the spirit of the times and the formation they received.

The missionaries of the nineteenth and twentieth centuries also talk about their spirituality, and it is one that was very much shaped by the devotional life of the times. They were dedicated to the Sacred Heart, a devotion they would spread around the world. French missionaries before leaving for their mission would visit several Churches in Paris. In each of them there was a statue or picture of Mary which had spoken or cried or smiled; no missionary would venture forth without a deep devotion to Mary. There were also visits to the Blessed Sacrament - a desire to keep Jesus, the "prisoner of love" in the tabernacle, company. This form of devotion was often incorporated into the rules of many missionary congregations that were founded at this time. These were the devotions that nourished, refreshed, and strengthened them, especially in difficult times. They were deeply spiritual people.

So dialogue with the past will put us in touch with missionaries who had some remarkable characteristics - a great concern for people, an openness to circumstances, and a deep spirituality. The expressions of these characteristics may not be suitable for contemporary persons and times. But in them there is found a basis for what the Catholic Church does today in mission. One can be grateful not only for what they did but also for the example they have given. Dialogue with the past can both refresh and strengthen today's missionaries.

### **Dialogue with the past: is there "baggage" that we must acknowledge and accept?**

Dialogue with the past which focuses only on the good that was done and the sincerity and dedication of missionaries is, however, only a selective dialogue. In many ways it is hearing only one voice. As mission is carried out in the future there must be constant dialogue not only with other persons, religions, and cultures in today's world, but also with those who in the past were the people the missionaries approached.

In exploring this aspect the book of Rowan Williams *Lost Icons: Reflections on Cultural Bereavement* can be helpful. In his second chapter entitled **Remorse**, he says: "Remorse involves thinking and imagining my identity through the ways in which I have become part of the self-representation of others, groups or individuals; and so learning to see me (or our) present style of self-presentation as open to question. It is in some degree to make internal to myself what I have been in the eyes of another." (p110)

Rowan Williams is saying that we all have a self-representation of ourselves in which we see our motives and our actions through our own eyes. But generally we do not connect with our identity or personal history the impact that we have on others as they see it. He suggests that when we can do this, our response often will be remorse.

In our dialogue with the past, it is important that we look not only at the missionaries' self-representation through their own eyes but also at their actions through the eyes of those on whom they have had an impact. Three examples can serve as illustrations of what this means.

Throughout missionary history, with some exceptions along the way, missionaries have had an enthusiasm to make converts. They used a variety of means - and always for a good purpose. When Charlemagne gave the Saxons the choice of "baptism or death" or when the Crusaders drove the Wends into the river with their swords to be baptised, it was because they believed that a Christian prince could rule only over Christians and so they had to be either baptised or killed. They saw nothing evil in this; baptism would be to the benefit of those upon whom it was imposed.

Missionaries going out in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries also were enthusiastic for converts. The sword was no longer used. But often their service was provided in a way to entice converts. Orphanages were established not only to care for abandoned children but also to raise and form good Christians. Famine relief at the times of the terrible famines in China (9 million died in the famines of the late nineteenth century) and India was meant to provide for the sustenance of the Christian communities. They felt obliged to help out their own first; and if this encouraged others to become Christians - rice Christians, as they were known - this was fine with them. They built schools and funded teachers to educate the children; however, becoming a Christian was often a pre-requisite for entering the school. And the list could go on.

This is not to criticise the missionaries. It is important to understand their thinking and put them in their context. But in dialogue with the past it is important to see the missionaries not only as they saw themselves also as others saw them. And the people who observed them, unfortunately, did not always say: See how they love one another and provide for one another. Rather they often said: If I want what they can provide I must first become a Christian. Because of their need they felt they had no choice. For this behaviour we need to feel remorse. *Ad Gentes* insisted in the most explicit terms that charity must be charity and people must not be enticed to become converts. In some ways the judgment on this manner of acting can be seen in the violence which is sometimes expressed towards Christians in the former mission territories.

A second example of the missionary approach which might have been seen differently by the missionaries and by the people they approached would be the nationalism and sense of cultural superiority which the missionaries communicated. This did not just begin in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries. It was present already in the arguments that Remigius of Rheims used to persuade Clovis to become Christian in the fifth century, in the cultural impositions that the German priests and bishops made on the Moravians in the ninth century, in the letter the Pope sent to the Khan in the twelfth century inviting him to submit to the papacy, in the Spanish language, culture and even city planning that the missionaries brought to Latin America and the Philippines, etc.

But this attitude was especially prevalent in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries. Missionaries for the most part went out under, if not actually wrapped in, their national flags. They claimed lands and people for their national sovereigns. They believed the people had no culture, or a very underdeveloped one, and so they meant to provide them with one. One can smile today at the instructions given to a group of Anglican missionaries who were going to Uganda in the late nineteenth century as they were told to be sure to play cricket regularly because it would have a "humanising effect" on the natives. But it was the conviction of the missionaries that the more the people they approached became like them, the more civilised and cultured they would be. They even presumed quite regularly that these people were impoverished by having no history of their own and so they wanted to enrich them by sharing their own history.

This is offered not to judge the missionaries; in our dialogue with the past it is important to see them in the context of their times. But this dialogue with the past must be not only with the missionaries as they saw themselves but also with those they approached as they saw them. In their eyes the missionaries not only put down their culture but also robbed them of their history. If they were to be Christians, it would be at the price of accepting the missionaries' judgment on their culture. It is clear from research on the early development of the Catholic Church in Western Africa that the earliest converts came from those who were marginalised in their society - those who had nothing to lose culturally by becoming Christians. The resentment to what missionaries did through this attitude is still felt today among many Christians. And for the damage that was done there is a need to feel remorse.

A final example of a missionary approach that might have been seen differently by the missionaries and those they approached would be their judgments about the religious attitudes and expressions of the people to whom they were reaching out. The missionary movement, with some rare exceptions, does not have a good record on this point. The advice of Gregory the Great to Melitus not to destroy the sacred places but just change their content is often quoted. The approach of Roberto de Nobili who identified himself with the Brahmin caste, became a sannyasi, and studied the Vedas, is offered as an example of cultural sensitivity. But for the most part Catholic history is one of violent destruction, from Martin of Tours in the fourth century who cut down sacred trees and tore up sacred groves, through Cortes in the fifteenth century who forced Moctezuma to empty his temple so that he could put a shrine to Mary there, to Francis Xavier in the sixteenth century who had the children bring out their parents' sacred pictures or images so that he could burn them when he was on the Fisheries Coast of India.

This attitude continued to be expressed by the missionaries who went out in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries. They were not in a position always to destroy the sacred images or desecrate the sacred places; but they could attack the people for being idolatrous and superstitious. Often without understanding the religious significance of certain customs and rituals they would simply forbid them (one thinks about the veneration of ancestors). One can understand the conviction of the missionaries who believed that they alone had the truth and that all other worship was false and idolatrous. But one can also understand how the people perceived this, seeing their traditions despised and their religious experiences discounted. And one can feel remorse for the hurt that was done as one listens to the pain that is expressed.

## **Conclusion**

In the last part of the paper, I have focused on the way missionaries have been seen by others and the remorse that can be felt. I think this is important. Rowan Williams writes:

...what is most fundamentally required...is the relinquishment of an identity placed beyond challenge or judgment, and the moving into a sense of identity that admits not simple guilt but the manifold ways in which we are real in the language and narrative of others rather than in a

privately scripted and controlled story. This admission is unavoidably and painfully a loss of power." (p111)

One of the characteristics of today's missionary movement is that missionaries for the most part undertake their task not from a position of power but of weakness. This is true in a political sense. Missionaries in the past would have found themselves supported and protected by the colonial or national powers. The missionaries' claim to this protection might not always have been as blatant as it was at the time of the French Religious Protectorate in China. But today's missionaries are coming from countries that are politically weaker than the countries to which they are going.

This is true also in an economic sense. Previously, missionaries coming from Europe and the United States could sense the power they had from their economic resources. They not only could support themselves, but they could erect buildings, develop programmes, pay mission personnel and exercise economic control. But this too is no longer true, at least among Catholic missionaries. Today's and tomorrow's missionaries are coming from poor African and Asian countries. These are facts, and it is important that missionaries embrace this loss of power. It is a difficult position to be in. But through dialogue with our past and through the remorse that needs to be felt it is possible to accept, if not actually embrace, this loss of power.

There are also two other conclusions that can be drawn from dialogue with the past. First, the missionaries today can reclaim its heroes and heroines from the past without embarrassment and be grateful for the example they have given. Dialogue with the past means not only letting the impact of the missionaries' actions on others in the past become part of our story and thus sense remorse, but it also means putting the missionaries in the past in their own context and appreciating them for who they were in themselves. Today's missionaries can be challenged by their commitment to serve and their flexibility and creativity in the way they served, and they can be inspired by their deep spirituality.

Finally, a sincere dialogue with the past will give missionaries a new freedom to choose new and different paths in going forward. For it is only in their sincere dialogue with the past that they can find the freedom to follow the Spirit wherever it might lead. We have learned from history that the guidance of the Spirit does not mean missionaries will never make mistakes. These must be recognised when they happen and there must always be an openness to a questioning that suggests they might happen again. But the guidance of the Spirit does mean that missionaries will be nourished in their commitment and be creative in their ways of bringing the Gospel to others.

#### **Further Readings:**

BEVANS, S and SCHROEDER, R, **Constants in Context: A Theology of Mission for Today,**

(Maryknoll, New York: Orbis Books, 2004)

KRABILL, JR, SAWATSKY, Walter, and VAN ENGEN, Charles (eds), **Evangelical, Ecumenical, and Anabaptist Missologies in Conversation, Part I: Mission History in Global Perspective,** (Maryknoll, New York: Orbis Books, 2006)

MARNELL, W H, **Light from the West: the Irish Mission and the Emergence of Modern Europe,**

(New York: Seabury Press, 1978)

NEMER, L, **Anglican and Roman Catholic Attitudes on Missions,** (St Augustine: Steyler

Verlag, 1981)

WALLS, A, **The Cross-Cultural Process in Christian History: Studies in the Transmission and Appropriation of Faith,** (Maryknoll, New York & Edinburgh: Orbis Books T&T Clark, 2002)

WILLIAMS, R, **Lost Icons: Reflections on Cultural Bereavement,** (Edinburgh: T & T Clark, 2000)



## Signs of Bosch's Ecumenical paradigm of mission in Asia

Ross Mackinnon

---

**Ross Mackinnon** is the current Editor of *The Australian Journal of Mission Studies*. Now retired, he was formerly a teacher, technical school inspector and teacher registration officer in Victoria. He is an active member of the Glen Waverley Uniting Church and is an occasional lecturer at Yarra Theological Union, Box Hill, Victoria.

---

*This paper measures the issues discussed by four key Asian Christian bodies at their Conferences in 2000-2001 against the key features of South African missiologist David Bosch's postmodern paradigm of mission as outlined by him in Transforming Mission (1991). It concludes that the features Bosch describes are evident in mission thinking in Asia at the turn of this century. The thinking provides interesting nuances and some significant enhancements to Bosch's paradigm. The paper is a condensed version of a thesis accepted for a Master of Theology degree by the Melbourne College of Divinity.*

---

### Introduction

In his book *Transforming Mission* published in 1991, South African theologian David Bosch (1929-1992) traces the history and theological emphases of Christian mission from Christianity's beginning to the publication date of his book. Bosch discerns six paradigms of mission within that timeframe. At the time of publication, Bosch contended that the sixth paradigm, the "postmodern" or "ecumenical" paradigm, was beginning to emerge, and the final third of his book describes this emerging paradigm.

Bosch contends that disenchantment with the Enlightenment worldview has surfaced since World War II and a new approach to reality is being sought.<sup>1</sup> The new reality is shaped by seven major changes, and the emerging paradigm has thirteen main elements.

In 2000-2001, four key Christian groups – the Federation of Asian Bishops' Conferences, Christian Conference of Asia, Congress of Asian Theologians, and the World Evangelical Alliance – held major conferences in Asia. Would a study of their conference papers reveal an emerging ecumenical model of mission and would it be what Bosch envisaged?

### Federation of Asian Bishops' Conferences (FABC)

FABC, formed in 1972, is "...a voluntary association of [Catholic] episcopal conferences in South, Southeast, East and Central Asia...Its purpose is to foster among its members solidarity and co-responsibility for the welfare of Church and society in Asia, and to promote and defend whatever is for the greater good."<sup>2</sup> It has its roots in the Second Vatican Council where many Asian bishops, meeting for the first time, realised they had a common identity.

This paper focuses on the Seventh Assembly (FABC VII) held in Thailand in 2000. This gathering gives us a snapshot of FABC's thinking almost 30 years after its establishment. The Assembly theme was "A Renewed Church in Asia: A Mission of Love and Service."

FABC papers 90, 91, 92 (a) to (t) and 93 constitute the key documents<sup>3</sup> for FABC VII and indicate issues considered important in 2000. The papers show particular concern for church ministries, social justice, laity, religion in the Asian context, religious life and formation, mission, and religious dialogue and co-operation.

As expected, the papers are written from an Asian viewpoint; they concentrate on Asian realities (historical, religious, cultural, economical, social and environmental). With each issue, the

fundamental question is asked – How can the Church assist here? and, what ministries and actions are needed to address the issues?

The FABC papers cover several issues. First, Christianity is seen to be a tainted product of Western colonialism; therefore, an Asian approach to theology is needed because European Christology is inappropriate to Asia. In developing an Asian theology, the experiences of people, especially women, need to be noted.<sup>4</sup>

Asia is the birthplace of many of the world's great religions and is home to 85% of the world's non-Christians. Given that Christianity is a minority religion in Asia, FABC sees dialogue as the appropriate way to proclaim the gospel there.

As Asia is home to two-thirds of the world's population, population growth and urbanisation are important issues. Rapid social and technological changes have led to serious dehumanising social situations such as child labour, caste and feudal systems, refugees, and drug trafficking. Of special concern is the place of women in Asian society. There are also dehumanising economic issues. Some countries have made rapid economic progress; others suffer degrading poverty.<sup>5</sup>

The papers raise political issues. Although many countries have adopted democracy, there is still widespread political corruption in Asia, and authoritarian, oppressive regimes remain part of Asia's political scene.<sup>6</sup>

On the positive side, the papers report a growing awareness of human rights issues in Asia.<sup>7</sup> FABC is concerned with human promotion - the integrity and dignity of the person so that all people might have fullness of life.<sup>8</sup>

The papers show concern for the environment and a need for a theology of ecology. Harmony is needed between the natural world and humankind.<sup>9</sup>

The papers emphasise the need for social justice as justice is now understood to be a constituent element of the Christian faith. The church is called to be prophetic in the face of corruption and to be an advocate for the oppressed and disadvantaged.<sup>10</sup>

A more involved laity is important. The authors of the papers express the desire for a church where ministries are shared. Consequently lay training is a top priority, especially training for lay women leaders.<sup>11</sup>

### **Concept of mission**

For the FABC, the primacy of mission is proclamation. The church in Asia wants to proclaim Christ, and to proclaim what Jesus proclaimed – the Reign of God, a new social order.<sup>12</sup> Proclamation involves the sharing of faith in dialogue.<sup>13</sup>

The mission of the church is one of love and service to all.<sup>14</sup> To carry out its mission, the church in Asia must be Asian<sup>15</sup> and can only be Asian if it addresses the Asian realities. This means being a prophetic church which advocates social justice.<sup>16</sup>

To answer God's call, the Asian church needs new theologies such as economic theology, inter-religious theology, and theologies which liberate the Third World from the First World.<sup>17</sup>

Mission is the responsibility of all church members who must demonstrate Christ in their lives via presence, harmony, compassion, dialogue, and peace.<sup>18</sup>

### **Christian Conference of Asia (CCA)**

CCA's General Assembly met in 2000 in Indonesia. Inaugurated in 1959, CCA was originally called the East Asia Christian Conference. Like FABC, it is an umbrella organisation, but its members come from different Christian denominations, and include members from Australia, New Zealand and East Timor.

Its main objectives are promotion and strengthening of church unity in Asia, encouragement of Asian contributions to Christian thought, development of effective Christian responses to societal changes, development and promotion of relationships with other faiths, protection of human dignity and caring for creation.<sup>19</sup>

CCA's General Assembly meets every five years. It is basically a business meeting which elects officers, receives reports on the previous five years' activities and sets goals for the next five years. The 2000 Assembly included presentations from three prominent Asian academics on the Assembly theme "Time for Fullness of Life for All." The 2000 Assembly Minutes provide a summary of CCA's activities and give a snapshot of its thinking and directions.

There are several recurring issues from the 2000 Assembly, many being in common with FABC, beginning with globalisation. Globalisation promotes economic development but has many disadvantages, for example, it increases dependence on foreign capital and trans-national corporations, the poor get poorer, and natural resources and lands are exploited.<sup>20</sup>

Another recurring issue is international debt, a legacy of the 1990s Asian economic crisis. CCA affirms that basic human needs, the rights of individuals and communities, and environmental protection should take precedence over debt repayments.<sup>21</sup>

The issues of violence against and oppression of women are raised. Women have been silenced and oppressed because of patriarchal culture and religion, and violence against women in all its forms – physical, emotional intellectual and structural is condemned by CCA.<sup>22</sup>

CCA is involved in various struggles for social justice. The rural economy and economic justice, the impact of globalisation on communities, the needs of workers in trans-national companies, and self-determination of indigenous and minorities have received special attention.<sup>23</sup>

Religious fundamentalism in South Asia is of special concern as religious minorities are facing serious threats by fundamentalists from the major religions in all South Asian countries.<sup>24</sup>

CCA is concerned about ecological issues and deplores the environmental degradation taking place. Creation is God's gift to be cared for.<sup>25</sup>

The CCA documents express concern for the areas of conflict in Asia and emphasise the churches' role in peacemaking. CCA advocates dialogue/negotiation as the way to peace, and Christians should take the initiative here.<sup>26</sup>

HIV/AIDS is a special area of concern and the work done on increasing awareness of HIV/AIDS is noted.<sup>27</sup>

An Asian church with Asian theologies is needed. The papers emphasise the need to throw off colonialism's shackles and to be weaned from the West, especially financially.<sup>28</sup>

Despite the multiplicity of problems, CCA, like FABC, does not shirk the call to work for the implementation of fullness of life for all. "Bringing about this fullness of life into everyone's life is indeed the mission of the church."<sup>29</sup>

### **Concept of Mission**

Mission is seen in several different ways. Mission is proclamation; in Asia's pluralist context, this means dialogue. Future directions in mission must also include mission and unity, and mission in the context of globalisation, poverty, and violence against women and children.<sup>30</sup> Mission is affected by context and the Asian context now is economic and financial globalisation, profound political changes and inter-faith relationships.

Mission means justice and peace. Society's issues should be the church's issues – the church needs to be involved in the struggles of the people.<sup>31</sup> Mission is "prophetic action and witness; and solidarity with victims."<sup>32</sup>

Mission means protection of the environment.<sup>33</sup>

Mission involves local congregations, and these need a new perspective on mission which includes commitment to justice, peace and the integrity of creation, and developing simple, non-patriarchal, inclusive, neighbourly lifestyles.<sup>34</sup>

The key issue is how to be God's people in the midst of all God's peoples.<sup>35</sup>

The views on mission say little about proclamation but much about the Asian context and Asia's needs. Mission is about improving quality of life and bringing the gospel values of solidarity with the poor and oppressed to fruition. These aims are seen to be a joint venture with people of other faiths.

### **Congress of Asian Theologians (CATS)**

CATS was established jointly by FABC and CCA in 1997. The main objective is to deepen the theological foundations of the Ecumenical movement in Asia in order to develop a new Asian theological vision.<sup>36</sup> It meets biennially, and had its third meeting (CATS III) in Indonesia in 2001. Representatives from various faiths attended and made presentations.

The CATS III theme - "Envisioning New Life among the Religions of Asia" – picks up the ubiquity and pluralism of religions in Asia and their centrality to Asian life and theology.<sup>37</sup>

Keynote speaker at the 2001 Meeting, Wesley Ariarajah, itemised three key theological needs in Asia. First, an Asian Christian theology of religions is needed. Current Asian Christian theology affirms the Asian spiritual heritage, but grudgingly accepts God's presence in other religions for they are seen as rivals rather than co-pilgrims.

Second, an Asian Christian theology of mission is needed. Ariarajah offers the following missional affirmations: witnessing to God together with others; all people have stories of their lives with God; bringing healing, wholeness, and new life to all; recognising that religions are different, but making room for mutual witness; working to break down barriers; and seeking justice and dignity for all.

Third, an Asian theology of community is needed. Ariarajah perceives an emerging inter-faith movement which redefines the concept of a "religious community." He sees an urgent need to forge these inter-faith communities in Asia.<sup>38</sup>

CATS III considered new and emerging theologies. Korean theologian Chung Hyun Kyung offers eco-feminism for consideration. as it connects the oppression of women to the oppression of nature and all living beings.<sup>39</sup>

Ignorance of other religions was an important issue for CATS III. Thomas Michel, Jesuit priest and Arabic scholar, outlines the liberating aspects of Islam little known to Christians.<sup>40</sup> Muslim scholar Dr Ibrahim Abu-Rabi wants to see the liberationist Islamic worldview renewed in our day.<sup>41</sup>

Dialogue is one way to overcome our ignorance of other religions and this features in the CATS III papers. Christians and Muslims should be talking about their ideals, efforts, failures, experiences of God's love and their selfish refusal to share that love.<sup>42</sup>

The Asian theologians clearly link dialogue with the Asian realities. However, dialogue on theological niceties and doctrine avoids reality. All people of faith want relief from human suffering, peace and security, and universal fullness of life. The issue is how to realise these things.

Asian theologies, Christian and otherwise, featured in CATS III discussions. Dalit, Minjung and Tribal theologies were discussed. New areas for exploration included theology of life, women's issues, and theological interpretations of space and land.<sup>43</sup>

Another key issue was grassroots communication, an issue common to FABC and CATS. Disturbingly, Asian theology has little or no impact on preaching and the laity. Asian theologies are treated as exotic in Asia as well as the West, and local congregations know little of the new thinking on attitudes to other religions.<sup>44</sup>

The negative impact of colonialism and its Western style of Christianity is mentioned. Fundamentally, Christianity is seen to be arrogant, and other religious groups only see the proselytising version of Christianity.<sup>45</sup> Despite this, CATS III concludes that Christian relationships and mission to the people of other faiths is changing and for the better.<sup>46</sup>

As with FABC and CCA, CATS III sees globalisation as an important Asian issue. For Kyung, it is one of the most important theological challenges to be faced.<sup>47</sup> Abu-Rabi comments that that throughout the Muslim world globalisation is regarded as the latest and most lethal form of colonialism.<sup>48</sup>

Fundamentalism was not a dominant issue, but important, especially when religious fundamentalism causes serious conflicts.<sup>49</sup>

Buddhist guest speaker Professor Sulak Sivaraksa spoke about the need for engaged Buddhism – i.e., Buddhism which concentrates on Buddha's teaching on social justice and not just ritual and tradition.<sup>50</sup>

The CATS III documents, like the documents from FABC and CCA, stress the needs of women in theology and society.

### **Concept of Mission**

Several ideas regarding mission emerge from CATS III. First, mission has to do with witness – i.e., manifesting the power of love rather than dogmas and creeds.<sup>51</sup>

Second, mission is something that is done with others, especially people of other faiths. Mission today should take the form of co-operatively promoting abundant life.<sup>52</sup>

Third, mission is about working for justice, freedom and peace. The concluding statement of CATS III says, "Our Christian insight that God lives and works in solidarity with the poor must be shared in Asia."<sup>53</sup>

Fourth, mission is not just for Asia; it is for the world. Again, the concluding statement says, "We renew our common commitment to struggle with all the peoples of Asia, believers of all religions as well as non-believers, in search of new life and abundance of life for all people of Asia and for the whole world."<sup>54</sup>

### **World Evangelical Alliance (WEA)**

Originally known as the World Evangelical Fellowship, WEA was formed in 1951. It is another ecumenical body affecting Asian churches. Although global rather than Asian, its view of mission is pertinent to Asian Evangelical churches<sup>55</sup> especially as two-thirds of all professing Christians in Asia belong to such churches.<sup>56</sup> WEA's General Assembly meets every four years. Its 11<sup>th</sup> General Assembly held in Malaysia in 2001 will be looked at, and the issues affecting it at that time.

WEA "exists to foster Christian unity and to provide a worldwide identity, voice and platform to Evangelical Churches and Christians."<sup>57</sup> One of its expectations is to "...enable the global Christian movement to become a renewing and transforming force in families, communities, and nations for growing righteousness, increasing justice, decreasing poverty, and the sharing of resources to meet human need."<sup>58</sup>

Local churches and national alliances are key elements of WEA's work. Its core values are proclamation, scriptural authority, uniqueness of Christ, and the centrality of the church in God's redemptive plan.<sup>59</sup>

The theme of WEA's 11<sup>th</sup> General Assembly in 2001 was "Serving Churches Together." Three key imperatives emerged from the discussions:

- a) The Assembly sought new ways to help refugees, as helping refugees is a Christian obligation.<sup>60</sup>
- b) The Assembly called on the world's industrialised nations to cancel world debt, as many poorer countries were spending more on debt than health and education.<sup>61</sup>
- c) The Assembly denounced abuse of women, particularly abuse within the church.<sup>62</sup>

Because WEA is a global body, its documents and press releases can be general, and seem initially to have little Asian specificity. Yet there are matters relevant to the Asian scene.

First, the three main issues discussed at the 11<sup>th</sup> General Assembly all relate to the Asian realities discussed earlier.

Second, 13 of the 21 WEA July 2001 press releases on religious liberty following the Assembly relate specifically to Asia.<sup>63</sup>

Third, WEA's 2001 annual report to the United Nations on the state of religious liberty around the world gives summaries of countries where religious liberty has improved and where it is being denied. Seven of the 16 summaries relate to Asian countries.<sup>64</sup>

Fourth, the final statement from WEA's Global Congress on Church Ministry and Mission in Thailand in October 2001 following the 11<sup>th</sup> General Assembly alludes to Asian realities: "ethnic conflicts, massive poverty, alarming economic disparity, natural disasters, ecological crises and violence of unmeasured proportion." It also gives a commitment to work for human rights, religious freedom, truth and justice and the relief of suffering.<sup>65</sup>

On inter-faith matters, WEA's position contrasts with those of FABC, CCA and CATS. WEA's key confessional documents<sup>66</sup> affirm the uniqueness and universality of Christ and endorse proclamation of the gospel of Christ as Saviour of all. Asian Christians should respect other religions to facilitate dialogue so that the gospel message can be proclaimed more meaningfully to them.<sup>67</sup>

Although ultimately wanting the world to be Christian, WEA advocates religious liberty and "stresses the right of every person to have and practise his or her own religious convictions, or not to have any."<sup>68</sup>

Like FABC, CCA and CATS, WEA takes a prophetic stance and is concerned to denounce injustice, oppression, corruption, exploitation and violence, and wishes to fight poverty, promote justice and peace, and encourage environmental stewardship.<sup>69</sup>

Relating proclamation to social concern is an important emerging issue for evangelicals. Because they emphasise personal conversion and world evangelisation, evangelicals are often criticised for lack of social concern.<sup>70</sup> However, the several social concerns raised at the WEA 11<sup>th</sup> General Assembly give a different picture.

The need for interaction between the gospel and culture is mentioned in the WEA confessional documents; e.g., "The good news...must be expressed in all the languages and cultures of the world"<sup>71</sup> but little detail is given as to how this might be achieved.

### **Concept of Mission**

WEA's attitude to mission is clear and singular. The mission of the church is to evangelise the world by obeying the Great Commission. This means proclaiming the gospel and holding to the uniqueness of Christ while working for increased tolerance and understanding of other religious communities.<sup>72</sup> God is chief evangelist, the Holy Spirit is the empowering agent, Christians are God's co-workers in this venture,<sup>73</sup> and local churches have primary responsibility in spreading the gospel.<sup>74</sup> Evangelical mission has a particular concern for those who have not heard the gospel.<sup>75</sup>

### **Conclusions**

We return now to Bosch's postmodern paradigm which he sees as being shaped by the new reality marked by seven major changes and identified by thirteen main elements. Are these changes and elements evident in the thinking of the four groups studied? We begin with Bosch's seven main changes.<sup>76</sup>

1. Rationality is now regarded as too narrow a basis on which to build one's life. The FABC, CCA, CATS and WEA documents would agree – rationality is not the basis for life. For FABC, CCA, and CATS, the Asian realities are the starting point for the search for meaning. For WEA, the starting point is the gospel.

2. The Subject-Object schema of the Enlightenment era highlights the need for recognition that people are not objects to be exploited. This is certainly reflected in the documents of the four organisations. They all deplore the negative impact of globalisation on Asian life, especially the poor and powerless. They denounce the exploitation of people, especially women.

3. We are rediscovering that we cannot live without meaning and hope. This is supported by all four organisations. They all want to bring meaning and hope to the lives of Asians.

4. Progress and development are no longer seen as the solution to the world's economic problems. The four organisations agree. They support Bosch's view that progress via colonial expansion has made the West richer and the Third World poorer. The Third World is now rejecting "development" and seeks liberation instead.

5. The Enlightenment dichotomy between fact and values has collapsed. This is especially demonstrated in the FABC documents which highlight the importance of values in Asia, particularly the key values of family and harmony.

6. The Enlightenment view that all problems are solvable is under pressure. The documents from the four bodies support this. They reveal a strife-torn Asia which presents huge challenges to the churches who see their responsibility to the world as working to bring abundant life to all.

7. The Enlightenment creed of selfish pursuit of happiness has had disastrous consequences. The four groups would agree – they seek commitment to others and a new sense of community. From this, we can conclude that the new reality of which Bosch spoke is being reflected in Asia in many ways as seen in FABC, CCA, CATS and WEA in 2000-2001.

Now, we turn to the thirteen elements<sup>77</sup> that constitute Bosch's emerging ecumenical paradigm of mission.

#### Mission as the Church-With-Others

This element is clear in the thinking of all four organisations. Each group is concerned about the parlous state of the world. Mission incorporates commitment to social justice, peace, and the integrity of creation, and local churches are seen as primary agents of mission.

#### Mission as *Missio Dei*

All four groups agree that mission is God's affair and that their task is to assist God in this by representing God in the world. The question is how to do this. FABC, CCA and CATS see *missio Dei* in terms of Matthew 25: 35-46 ("For I was hungry and you gave me food...") whereas WEA see it in terms of Matthew 28:19-20 ("Go therefore and make disciples of all nations...").

#### Mission as Mediating Salvation

FABC, CCA and CATS concur that the traditional idea of salvation as individuals being saved from sin is too narrow and that salvation now incorporates the struggle for economic justice, human dignity, solidarity and hope. The Evangelicals do not agree wholly with this. They criticise mainstream churches for moving from world evangelisation to social reform.<sup>78</sup> Evangelical thinking is that when souls are saved a better world follows.

### Mission as the Quest for Justice

All four groups agree with this. They show considerable concern for social justice, peace, the civil society, human dignity, and the need for Christians to work for these things for all people. WEA sees Christianity as a renewing and transforming force in society which will bring about social justice and abundant life for all. The other groups take a broader view - they see the quest for justice as a joint effort with members of other faiths.

### Mission as Evangelism

Evangelisation is mentioned often and is seen as part of mission, but has particular Asian problems. For FABC, CCA and CATS, a fundamental problem is the traditional Christian claim, offensive to other faiths, that Christ is the only Saviour. These groups see dialogue as the best means of evangelisation and suggest that other faiths might be regarded as co-pilgrims working together to bring in God's Kingdom.

WEA disagrees. The entire world must be converted to Christianity as God has commanded. There is no salvation outside of Christ. Dialogue with other faiths is a means for conversion.

### Mission as Contextualization

This is supported, particularly by FABC, CCA and CATS. The need to break away from Western colonial theology which has made Christianity a foreign religion is emphasised. WEA takes a global view here. It wants the gospel to be relevant to Asians, but does not really want Asian theologies or new theologies.

### Mission as Liberation

Objection to domination, particularly Western domination, is clearly evident in the documents of all four groups. Oppressed groups such as the poor, women, and the marginalised, are mentioned often. The four groups see mission as liberation. WEA sees this primarily in terms of liberation from personal sin. The other three groups would accept liberation as release from the sin of political, social and economic oppression.

### Mission as Inculturation

This element featured in the documents of the four organisations. FABC, CCA and CATS all favour dialogue with culture, but WEA is nervous about this as it fears syncretism. WEA's main purpose in learning about local cultures is to facilitate conversion.

### Mission as Common Witness

All four bodies want ecumenical co-operation. The four conferences discussed ecumenical issues and each body undertakes significant ecumenical ventures.

### Mission as Ministry by the Whole People of God

\

All four groups showed clear evidence of this element. They all want a better informed and trained laity.

### Mission as Witness to People of Other Living Faiths



The documents of the four groups showed considerable evidence supporting this element. Religious plurality is an Asian reality and witness to people of other faiths is vital. WEA holds that there is no salvation outside of Jesus, the Truth. Dialogue is needed to get to know other faiths better to make conversion to Christianity easier. The other three groups have a broader theology of religions – they acknowledge that other faiths can incorporate truth, that salvation may be possible via other faiths, and that God may be working through them. This leads to seeing other faiths as pilgrim partners, without necessarily seeing all religions as being the same.

### Mission as Theology

This element relates closely to mission as *missio Dei*. All four groups agree that mission is integral to theology, but they differ as to starting points. For FABC, CCA and CATS, mission in Asia begins with the Asian realities, and these realities affect and determine Asian theology. For WEA, the chief issue is that most Asians are not Christian. They must therefore be converted in accordance with the Great Commission.

### Mission as Action in Hope

This element is found in the thinking of the four groups, especially in their emphasis on bringing fullness of life to all. WEA sees eschatology and hope in traditional terms - Christ will come to judge. Those found wanting will be condemned; the faithful will be saved.

Having considered Bosch's framework, we now ask if there are any issues Bosch may have missed, as evidenced by our study of the four groups chosen and their reflections on Christianity in Asia.

Bosch, as a Westerner, writes largely from a Western perspective. Most of his bibliographical sources are Western (almost a third are German). Few of his sources are from the Third World, and his comments on Third World theology are confined mostly to Latin American Liberation theology. He uses very few Asian sources. It is not surprising, therefore, to find some issues arising from our Asian study which do not feature in Bosch's thinking. These issues do not necessarily contradict Bosch's thesis; rather they enhance some sections of his postmodern paradigm, and could well reflect changes that have intensified since the publication of *Transforming Mission*.

First, the four groups studied stress the need for due recognition of women in church and society. Although the four organisations are male-dominated, they acknowledge the need to improve this situation. Bosch, however, makes few references to the liberation of women and the role of women in mission<sup>79</sup> and uses very few female sources. This is surprising given the rise of women's movements in the twentieth century. The women's issues raised by the four groups can fit into Bosch's paradigm – e.g., mission as the quest for justice, mission as liberation, mission as ministry by the whole people of God.

All four groups stress the prophetic nature of the church. Bosch makes few references<sup>80</sup> to the prophetic role of the church and does not make an issue of it. This is surprising, given Bosch's anti-apartheid stance in his home country. The prophetic role in mission as seen by our four groups in Asia enhances Bosch's paradigm, particularly mission as the quest for justice, mission as liberation and mission as action in hope.

Ecology is another area emphasised by all four groups. Bosch briefly mentions the ecological crisis,<sup>81</sup> but does not suggest an urgent need for ecological theology as the four groups in Asia do. Given the worldwide cry for healing of the earth in recent years, this omission by Bosch is surprising.

FABC, CCA and CATS all discuss the concept of partnership with other faiths in the quest for social justice and peace. In his comments on mission as witness to people of other living faiths, Bosch contends that a new attitude to other religions is needed. These three groups would agree with that. Whether Bosch would also agree that mission is something done in conjunction with other faiths is debatable. Bosch's coverage of the inter-faith issue is general.<sup>82</sup> He sees the plurality of faiths in Asia as the key regional issue confronting Christianity in Asia,<sup>83</sup> and hints at the partnership approach, but does not pursue this as a mission matter.

Bosch mentions the growth of the Evangelical churches in the twentieth century,<sup>84</sup> but does not comment on their attitude to mission vis-à-vis his postmodern paradigm. This is surprising, given the phenomenal growth of these churches over the past century and their particular attitudes to mission.

One final difference between Bosch and the four groups studied, particularly FABC, CCA and CATS, is one of approach. Bosch, as a Western scholar, uses conceptual language. The FABC, CCA and CATS papers are down-to-earth; their thinking begins with what is happening around them. They express their theology through experience, rather than doctrine and concepts. This difference of approach is to be expected as we are all products of our own cultures. A key issue to ponder here is whether the Asian approach, as evidenced by FABC, CCA and CATS especially, will gain the ascendancy in approaches to mission.

Finally, we can conclude that the changes in reality and the elements of Bosch's emerging ecumenical paradigm of mission are evident in Asia, in various ways and with interesting Asian nuances, at least in the thinking emerging from the 2000-2001 Conferences of the four groups discussed. It will be interesting to see how the views of all four groups develop in time.

## Dangerous memories and mission in Nagasaki

Gwyn McClelland

---

**Gwyn McClelland** is never quite sure how to answer the question about where he is from. Gwyn's mission background goes back to his childhood, when he lived in Mymensingh and Dhaka, Bangladesh. Gwyn has taught Japanese in Victorian high schools since 1995. He has also lived in Kochi, Japan (1998-2000), with his partner, Keren. His son Geordie was born during this period in Japan. Gwyn graduated in 2008 with a Masters of Divinity. This essay is derived from a thesis he submitted to complete his postgraduate degree. Gwyn is currently living in Melbourne and planning his next visit to Japan, taking a school group (15 teenage boys and his daughter Lydia). The trip will include a visit to Hiroshima Peace Museum.

---

This article is dedicated to the 語り部 *kataribe* of the world and in particular to Reiko Miyake and Kiyoshi Nishida.

---

*Remembering suffering is a potential precursor for reconciliation and liberation. In the case of Nagasaki, what is remembered and what has been sidelined or avoided? The implications of the witness of the suffering in Nagasaki are reconsidered, both of the "senpuku hidden Christians" and also of the hibakusha, or nuclear survivors. It is argued that the witness of the suffering in Nagasaki reveals the presence of God. Also, this witness offers gospel hope for the transformation and liberation of a dominating and oppressive society.*

---

*Walking with God through Urakami's nuclear wasteland has taught me the depths of His friendship... God will turn (Jerusalem's) desolation into Eden, and the wasteland into a garden of Yahweh.*

Dr Takashi Nagai<sup>85</sup>

### Suffering

In July, 2008, I visited Nagasaki (9 years after my first visit). I chose Nagasaki as the context for study, having some knowledge of the long history of suffering experienced there by people, who had associated over this period with the Crucified God.

The specific suffering experienced in Nagasaki calls into question dominant powers and the power of the strong as well as a Western attachment to comfort. In Nagasaki, the observer may sense this absence of reconciliation. The memories of the cries of the dead and dying, the catch in the throat of the *hibakusha*, or nuclear survivor, as they relate their narrative(s) and the "not yet" of a world still storing up nuclear weapons are all reminders of a broken world. Further back in history, the experiences of the *senpuku kirishitan*, or hidden Christians, of persecution and abandonment testify to the power of "dangerous memories." The claim of the cross and resurrection's crucified God is that the history of humankind's suffering has no goal, and yet a future.<sup>86</sup> How can this lack of resolution and reconciliation in the cross, and in suffering in general, have a future? It is only by the acceptance of a witnessed faith that a future is envisaged.

### Death revealing a future in God

If the resurrection of Christ sheds light on a hope of an eschatological future in God, suffering reveals the human subject as someone with a past and a future. The ability to remember and to have memories of suffering provides possibilities for concrete historical identity of the human subject. Freedom to suffer gives freedom to hope.<sup>87</sup> Considering those who suffered in history, we are reminded of the future in God, and the eschatological promise.

Ultimately, then, suffering witnesses to a future in God. "God is the fulfillment of history, yet God is neither totally within history, nor totally apart from history, but always dialectically related to history

from the future... This eschatological proviso relativizes all systems and radicalizes the importance of historical activity in relation to God."<sup>88</sup>

### **"God's trial by God"**

Jürgen Moltmann set an initial context for a theology of a suffering God in his book, **The Crucified God**. In the face of Nagasaki, in the face of the Holocaust, how can we speak of God? At the same time, says Moltmann, how can Christian theology not speak of God in the face of Jesus' cry for God on the cross?<sup>89</sup> "My God, my God, why have you abandoned me?" The cry for God from Nagasaki is also transformed to be anticipatory.

Despite the horror expressed in these words by Christ, a faith is also expressed, in the word, "my". What hope is this that the Christian faith expresses, in a crucified God? It is an anticipatory, but tenuous, "not yet" faith.

"The cross of the Son divides God from God to the utmost degree of enmity and distinction. The resurrection of the Son abandoned by God unites God with God in the most intimate fellowship."<sup>90</sup>

The unfinished sufferings of humanity, including those discussed in this essay, but also the Prisoners of War held by the Japanese army, the Korean comfort women, the fire bombing of Tokyo and memories such as Auschwitz are to be significant in the transformation of history. Christians are to be active in re-defining history in the light of sufferings such as these. Remembrance of these sufferings should lead to criticism of the sociopolitical system which legitimates them. As members of Christ's body, followers of Christ are called to protest. Together they cry a cry of bewilderment. Thus, the follower of Christ is called to associate with those who suffer and be liberated from an attachment to comfort and oppressive dominance.

What, then, is the future of suffering? How does mission reconcile the wronged and the perpetrator through the lens of the gospel story?

In suffering specific to Nagasaki, God, as revealed in the Christ story is not a God of the powerful. God is NOT associated with a particular ethnicity or culture. Paradoxically, in the pain of Nagasaki's abandonment, or even crucifixion, by the Western Allies, God, associating with the weak, is experienced in Christ. In the pain of the persecutions of the *senpuku* hidden Christians in Nagasaki, God was experienced in Christ.

Using Nagasaki as a litmus test, is it true that remembering suffering is the beginning of the pathway towards reconciliation and liberation?

### **Dangerous memory**

Metz argues that the memory of the crucified Lord is a "dangerous memory." Truthful history is never only from the standpoint of the successful, but is also from the perspective of the victims and the conquered.<sup>91</sup> Human suffering, says Metz, resists attempts to interpret history and historical processes in the light of nature. Darwinian nature refers to evolution and survival of the strongest. Suffering contrasts nature and history.<sup>92</sup> The memory of the passion, therefore, in opposition to natural selection, associates Christianity in its identity with those who suffer. For, the history of humankind is the history of our suffering. In that history, "the absence of reconciliation between nature and man [sic] is not suppressed, but preserved."<sup>93</sup>

In the case of Nagasaki, what is remembered and what has been sidelined or avoided? As we examine the witnessed stories of the "loser", and the victim in this place, we are called to consider the "dangerous memories", or the story of God, on the side of justice and truth.

We are prompted by this story of suffering, and there is to be no proof of the great hope of resurrection; but only faith; Still, in the narrative of "suffering in Nagasaki", we find testimony to faith, renewal and a future.

### **Witness: dangerous memories of the *senpuku kirishitan***

The *senpuku kirishitan*, or "hidden Christians", concentrated in the Nagasaki region of Japan, originated as a Christian remnant from the Catholic missions of the early sixteenth century. In 1593,

Spanish Franciscans arrived in Japan from the Philippines to join the Jesuits. The Catholic orders did not always work co-operatively and in some cases actually warned the Japanese against each other. Finally, the shogun Toyotomi Hideyoshi called for the expulsion of all missionaries in 1587.<sup>94</sup> Left behind in the late 16<sup>th</sup> century, by the Jesuit and Franciscan missionaries, the new Japanese Christians (largely peasants and numbering in the hundreds of thousands) were bereft. Successively hard-line policies were implemented by Japanese shoguns (such as Ieyasu and Hideyoshi) in persecution of the remnant. Later there followed martyrdoms and persecution of thousands of these Christians. The martyrdoms began in the late 16<sup>th</sup> Century.

Twenty six Christians were crucified in Nagasaki in 1597, including three Franciscans and two Jesuit novices, and fifteen persons employed by the missionaries including two young teenage boys. In mid-winter, they were marched from Kyoto, nearly 700 kilometres to the north, as far as the Nishizaka hill in Nagasaki, and publically executed. They were crucified by the authorities in broad daylight. Father Renzo De Luca SJ, director of the twenty six martyrs' monument in Nagasaki,<sup>95</sup> told me that rather than breaking the spirit of the people, it actually achieved the opposite. The Christian community of Nagasaki took heart from the courage of those executed and supported them to the end, singing and encouraging them. In this way, the "dangerous memory" of Christ informed this Christian community and the martyrs who were faithful despite and through suffering. The parallels between the Nishizaka crucifixions and the story of Christ seem to have actually strengthened the faith of the Christian community in Nagasaki.

It was thanks to their shared memories that many of the *kirishitan* stayed faithful. They remembered the story of Christ through rites which included baptism and communion<sup>96</sup>, whilst they pretended to follow the state imposed political religion (Buddhism). Persecution included "the trampling rite", when the Christians were forced to trample on *fumie* icons such as images of Mary and Jesus (Figure 2 and Figure 1). This would have been a horror for most *senpuku kirishitan*, who esteemed these traditional icons. One community is reported to have developed a ritual of burning the straw sandals worn when treading on the image, mixing ashes with water and drinking the result.<sup>97</sup> The early *senpuku kirishitan* used some new rituals like this one for purification, and practised a form of communion, for cleansing from sin. This transformed the *fumie*, from its imposed function as an object of torture. It gained a liberating function for the mostly peasant people and became literally a "dangerous memory". The story of the martyrs, including the 26 killed at Nishizaka, was a significant part of the remembering which enabled the extraordinary resilience of this community.

Despite the suffering these early Japanese Christians experienced, many held onto the memory of the death and resurrection of Christ. If the death of Jesus is truly the death of God in which "our death becomes the death of the immortal God himself",<sup>98</sup> then the specific torments of the Japanese Christian, seemingly abandoned by God, were also inhabited by God. Without this promised and unproven future of resurrection life, what could have sustained this community through two hundred years of persecution?

The *senpuku* illustrate a difficult path to freedom, despite and through their suffering shared by God. Incredibly, this community emerged out of hiding after the Meiji reforms of the 1880s and established itself as a large group associated with the Christian church in the low socio-economic area of the Urakami suburb of Nagasaki. This suburb was later to be devastated by the United States' dropping of a second nuclear bomb on the 9<sup>th</sup> August, 1945. Urakami is now well known as the "hypercenter" of the explosion and has been renamed "Peace-town, *heiwachou*."

The *senpuku* memories of persecution and suffering set the context for the devastating experiences of the *hibakusha* or nuclear survivors of Nagasaki, of whom tens of thousands were direct descendants of the *senpuku* communities themselves.

### The Dangerous memory of the *hibakusha*

*If anything, the victim would rather pray: "Forgive them not, Father, for they knew what they did!"*<sup>99</sup>

*...freedom degenerates whenever those who suffer are treated more or less as a cliché and degraded to a faceless mass.*<sup>100</sup>

I interviewed two Nagasaki *hibakusha*, or atom bomb survivors, Mr. Kiyoshi Nishida (78 years old) and Mrs. Reiko Miyake (82 years old) in July, 2008. Reiko Miyake and Kiyoshi Nishida and their fellow sufferers are a part of the testimony to the post-nuclear Nagasaki. This testimony is quickly moving beyond living memory – Reiko was twenty years old and Kiyoshi sixteen at the time of the bomb.

Seventy thousand people died almost instantaneously, and seventy thousand more within a year of the atomic explosion in Nagasaki.

The deaths of over 8,000 Christians amongst the 70,000 instantaneous deaths at Urakami in 1945, was yet another martyrdom type event for these Christians acquainted with suffering, of whom the majority were descended from the *senpuku kirishitan*. For the first time, though, instead of the Japanese authorities, the cause of these martyrdoms was from outside Japan.

An artistic expression of Christ's (and David's) cry, "Why have you abandoned me?", may be found in a statue in the peace park. "The Women and Child" statue, depicts the pain and suffering of the moment of the bombing for countless women and children. (See Figures 3 and 4) Seventy percent of the victims of the bomb were women and children. This statue powerfully depicts something of that hellish event in the haggard faces of the women and children.

In this God-abandonment, for the Christian in Nagasaki, what hope, if any, remains?

Christ's cry of bewilderment is similar to cries which have been heard through the valleys of Nagasaki over the years. Reiko Miyake, the second *hibakusha* who I met, spoke of the desperate cry of the abandoned which had in one case already ceased at her school on the day following the atomic bomb.<sup>101</sup>

入り口の所でね、24歳の男の先生の宮本先生がいました。原爆落ちてから、「痛いよ。」とか「殺してくれ」とか「お母さん」とかって言っていたそうです。。。あたしが十日の日に朝、六時ごろで、行ったときに何も言わなかったんです。

*At the entrance, there was a 24 year old male teacher, called Mr Miyamoto. Since the bomb had dropped, he'd apparently been saying "It hurts!", "Someone finish me off!" or "Mum!"... When I went to the school, on the 10<sup>th</sup>, at about 6am, he was no longer saying anything...*

Miyake was a 20 year old teacher at the bustling Shiroyama primary school, in 1945.

The day after the bomb was dropped, she summoned up courage to visit her school, the closest school to the hypocenter, and found a scene of absolute carnage. As I listened again to the audio, as quoted above, of Miyake's story of finding the dead, the maimed and the dying, unidentifiable, I hold onto a hope (as per Metz) that an as yet unrealized meaning is assigned to the 1400 out of 1500 children who died, the 80 or so Junior high school students doing clerical duties at the school at the time who died, the 28 out of 33 teachers who died.<sup>102</sup> Miyake found piled up bodies and heard the cries of the maimed and dying, abandoned and unrecognizable.<sup>103</sup> As the staircase had disappeared, a number of students had jumped from the burning school building.

### **The challenge of dangerous memories**

Hope and freedom is found on an unexpected path, using the example of Nagasaki. Liberation from struggle and pain is a mistaken (unachievable) goal– it is rather by re-imagining history, from the perspective of the suffering and weak, what you might call the "understory" of history, that we may achieve freedom through reconciliation and healing. The path towards liberation from our tendency towards dominion and "power over" opens up as we consider past sufferings. We hope that one day, we may be granted the freedom to forget (or at least not to remember) suffering and death. In Nagasaki the understory challenges the accepted, dominant history.

Let us consider once more the statue of the "Mother and Child" (Figure 1). Who is the woman looking on, with a somewhat serene expression in the background of the statue? It is possible that the woman represents Mary, mother of Jesus, or even Mary, the statue which "survived" the bomb, next to Urakami Catholic Church. Is this a link to the thinking of the *senpuku kirishitan*, to whom Mary was representative of God? The **Tenchi Hajimari** (said to be the "Bible" of the hidden Christians) says that *Maruya* (Mary) was "elevated to be even the third person of the Trinity! Mary, representing

eternally compassionate love and care, even a feminine face of God<sup>104</sup>, must have been incredibly important to those underground Christians as they withstood severe persecutions.”<sup>105</sup> This sculpture, with Mary looking on, suggests an important piece of evidence in the trial of God by God, which is the possibility that God was with the victims of Nagasaki in their suffering.

Remembering the passion and resurrection of Christ is the “dangerous memory” (after Metz), which engages with a Trinitarian God and subverts the everyday pervasive and oppressive systems and powers of the world. “Natural” history (survival of the fittest) is subverted by the history of suffering, pointing humankind towards truthfulness, which is often marginalised by hegemonic powers. The task of mission, then, is to engage in this dangerous and hopeful remembering.

Like the death of Christ, these stories of Nagasaki, demonstrate unutterable suffering and as a result, “dangerous memories.” Jesus’ death does not represent an end point, but was followed by an “unproven”, although witnessed-to event of hope. The risen Christ is the basis of a hope in the forgetting/blotting out of death in an ultimate and non-temporal sense.

### **Implications of suffering**

How does understanding the truth of the suffering experienced in Nagasaki lead to reconciliation? Suffering encourages the remembrance of Christ’s passion and resurrection and therefore initiates hope in an eschatological future promised by God. Liberation is to be revealed in this history of suffering. It is not solely in the Christ-story that God is known as the “suffering God.” Instead, the “suffering God” story has implications for all who suffer, in the offered hope of an unexpected future.

### **“Death in God”**

Moltmann writes that Jesus’ death is not the death of God, but actually “death in God”, and therefore the Son, Father and Spirit have within, the death of Jesus.<sup>106</sup> This is a rift in God. God works in the “killing” of suffering in order to make alive, judging in order to set free.<sup>107</sup> This proves that God is on trial by God, who is intimately involved and present in death. In the dangerous memories already discussed, God has been experienced as intimately involved in suffering experienced in Nagasaki. The witness of the *senpuku* and *hibakusha* Christian community is to the presence of God in suffering.

In what way does this remembering threaten the powers of the world? The rift in God ensures a double take on what humankind expect of God. God works unexpectedly, in the death and suffering represented by the rift in God. Liberation, also taking an unexpected form, is to be experienced as the future of the suffering. This future is not an expected future. The power and control coveted by the crucifying powers is not sufficient to control this unexpected future. Mission should aim to reveal this rift and the future of suffering as hope.

Memories of suffering threaten the powerful in their attachment to apathy and comfort. Followers of Christ remember Christ’s suffering. They are called alongside their companions who suffer.

When we examine the story of suffering in Nagasaki then, we are called to see and even prophesy an unexpected hopeful future.

### **Nagai: the bridge between *hibakusha* and *senpuku***

The third *hibakusha* of Nagasaki, whose story witnesses to a future in God, is Dr Takashi Nagai, (he died in 1950), who became a celebrated peace activist and in whose memory a small museum is still running in modern Nagasaki. Nagai’s hopes for Nagasaki are reflected in the quote at the beginning of this article. A memorial to Nagai is today to be found in the Nagasaki Peace Museum.

Takashi Nagai was a doctor in Nagasaki. Nagai’s story is representative of the link between the *senpuku kirishitan*, and the atomic devastation, as he married the daughter of a *chōkata*, headman in the Moriyama family, and subsequently became a Christian.

Nagai preached soon after the bomb at Urakami Cathedral, on behalf of the martyred.<sup>108</sup> The significance of his sermon was that he used the word *hansai* to refer to the nuclear destruction. In Japanese, this word means holocaust or whole-burnt offering. Some of the congregation shouted in protest that he used pious words which reduced in some way the significance of the atrocity which had been perpetrated on their families. Nonetheless, he continued: “The Christian flock in Nagasaki

was true to the faith through three centuries of persecution. During the recent war it prayed ceaselessly for a lasting peace. Here was the one pure lamb that had to be sacrificed as *hansai* on His altar... so that many millions of lives might be saved.” Towards the end of his sermon, Nagai concluded, “Happy are those who weep; they shall be comforted... But we can turn our minds’ eyes to Jesus carrying his cross up the hill of Calvary... The Lord has given, the Lord has taken away. Blessed be the name of the Lord. Let us be *thankful* that Nagasaki was chosen for the whole-burnt sacrifice!”<sup>109</sup>

Is Nagai correct, that God “needed” innocent victims to die for the justice of World War II? The God of Abraham and the Hebrew scriptures and of Christ does not “need” sacrifices of atonement. God is a God of justice. The condemning of wrongdoing, repentance and transformation and reconciliation are essential components of the path to peace in God. The victims of Nagasaki, whilst associated with Christ, are not Christ.

Despite this, Nagai invoked the dangerous memory of Christ in his sermon at Urakami, reminding his listeners of their long association with Christ in suffering.

Through identity with Christ in the narrative of the passion event, there is hope for meaning against nihilism. The witness of this group of Christians in Urakami, Nagasaki, as represented by Nagai, demonstrates a close acquaintance with deep personal suffering and pain, whilst experiencing the bomb event as intense and horrible suffering. They connected this event with remembrance of the “dangerous memory” of Christ, and recall Immanuel, God with us. This in turn, impacted the Nagasaki response to the atomic devastation. Along with the *kataribe*, such as Miyake, Nishida and Nagai, the people of Nagasaki continue to represent a “dangerous remembering”, and a political and social subversion, both within and outside Japan.

#### **“The truth will set us free” (John 8:32)**

Renzo De Luca SJ<sup>110</sup> regrets an ongoing “loss of memory” amongst the Japanese. De Luca recalled the invasions of Korea of 1592-1598<sup>111</sup>, as well as the annexation of Korea by Japan in 1910, which culminated in Japanese rule until 1945. These periods are largely ignored in modern Japanese school textbooks and the telling of Japanese history.

Importantly, history is not the total sum of the actions and interpretations of the victors, but is also properly the reality of the sufferings of the human victims.<sup>112</sup> The history of Nagasaki linked extreme political executions, that of the 26 martyrs of Nagasaki (and countless lesser known executions) and the nuclear bomb. These series of events, one cataclysmic and others horrific took place within two kilometres of the other. Through the memory of these executions and associated suffering, a path of critique, reconciliation and liberation is opened up. There is a connection between past suffering and a hoped for peace.

#### **“Why should we not prefer “captivity” with power and privilege to “freedom” with weakness and suffering?”<sup>113</sup>**

Will the reality of the sufferings discussed above outlast apparently dominant and humiliating shows of strength? Sixty four years after the nuclear devastation, and some four hundred and sixty years after the crucifixions of the martyrs, the “understory” of sufferings are remembered in tension against the dominating powers. On the dominant side, the powerful nuclear bomb known as the “Fatman” (which dropped in Nagasaki) is popularly known as a bomb which ended World War II in the Pacific.

In tension against this utilitarian interpretation, I offer the subversive testimony of the named survivors, such as Miyake, Nishida and Nagai and the stories of the martyrs of this bomb. If Christ takes all suffering into God’s self, all of these people may represent the body of Christ.

The *senpuku* (hidden) community are known as a somewhat exotic, quaint group of agitators by the average Japanese person looking back on history (if known at all). However, according to estimates, they represented 20-30% of the victims of the atom bomb.<sup>114</sup> Prior to 1945, their existence was defined by their mostly non-violent resistance and suffering due to faith. They personally identified with and belonged to Christ’s body.

#### **Misguided Mission**



Let us contrast this subversive testimony and dangerous remembering with “misguided mission.” Misguided mission tends to fail to remember. In fact, it also selectively fails to remember. The suffering downtrodden are forgotten. Political religions and missions frequently sustain themselves by the use of armed force or violence. False mission has been a department of bourgeois religion (or non-remembering religion), suppressing recollection of the political aspect of Christ’s suffering. This results in a tendency towards “overstory” or remembrance of only the dominant telling of history. False mission avoids the repercussions of the history of suffering. Where mission in Japan has forgotten to pay truthful attention to the history of suffering, it is not a reflection of God. There are four implications for true mission.

### **Mission as reconciliation: absorbing the “other”**

Firstly, mission should demonstrate a fearless openness and an ability to absorb the “other.” I reflected on this with Renzo De Luca SJ, director of the twenty-six martyrs’ museum.<sup>115</sup> One of the main blockages to mission in Japan was the fearfulness and disunity displayed by Christians who initially visited Japan. The early missions (in the 16<sup>th</sup> century) actually warned the Japanese against the other European missions and nation groups. This was one major reason why the Japanese shoguns/daimyos outlawed Christianity. It was, in fact, the persecution of the Christians which ironically brought them together. They became an even more tightly knit community as a result of their shared experience and suffering.

Self-giving mission involves not only sharing the free message of Christ, but also reconciling with the “other.” Reconciliation has occurred in Nagasaki between the *senpuku* and the abandoning Catholic church. New understandings have developed between the US “victors” and the *hibakusha*. The *kakure* modern community and the Catholic believers continue to maintain links. Final reconciliation, says Volf, is to be achieved only where the self, guided by the narrative of the “triune God” is ready to receive the other into itself and undertake a re-adjustment of its identity in light of the other’s alterity.<sup>116</sup> This reflects the Trinitarian God’s perichoretic nature. A genuinely Christian reflection on social issues is rooted in the self giving, perichoretic love of the divine Trinity as manifest on the cross of Christ.<sup>117</sup> This self-giving, re-adjusting process is visible in Nagasaki, where re-adjustment has been a result of absorption of suffering and pain.

### **True mission as truthful recollection**

As well as reflecting the nature of God, secondly, true mission encourages right and truthful recollection. The Nagasaki context demonstrates that truly Trinitarian theology and a right remembering of suffering, will transform mission. If God is present in the humanity of every person, through Christ, who entered godforsakenness, it is the Spirit who creatively communicates God, living amongst us.<sup>118</sup> The Spirit encourages the missional community to right remembrance.

### **Transformational “dangerous” memory**

Third, suffering has implications for the social interactions of followers of Christ. Dangerous memories affect the standing of Christians in the community and impact their relating to others in their own culture. If a mission incorporates “dangerous remembering”, it has an impact on social context. The *senpuku kirishitan*, remembered by ritual, visual props and enculturation. Today, the “dangerous remembering” of the Christian community in Nagasaki includes many constant reminders of suffering. As well as the twenty six martyrs monument, the seared and blackened statues, exposed to the nuclear blast, and now standing in the garden at the front of Urakami Cathedral are a reminder to the community of those they have left behind (Figure 5). The “hypocenter” (*chushinchi*) memorial and Peace Park are reminders for the wider community. These memorials, as well as oral and literate remembrances (the library in the Peace museum) may still impact the social standing of those devoted to truthful remembering.

### **Reconciliation as “Kenotic” mission**

Fourthly, if God’s nature is self-giving, mission should follow. Kenosis, or self-giving, is also known as “creative love” by Moltmann.<sup>119</sup> “Only by self-emptying in encounter with what is alien, unknown and different does man [sic] achieve selfhood... trust in the hidden and guaranteed identity with Christ in God (Col 3:3).”<sup>120</sup> “God is only revealed as “God” in his opposite: godlessness and abandonment by God”, says Moltmann.<sup>121</sup> In the many years of persecution, the *senpuku* community maintained a self emptying trust in God. The *senpuku* were forced to give up most concrete items of religion, as well as

obvious worship services and gatherings in public. "To know God in the cross of Christ is a crucifying form of knowledge, because it shatters everything to which a man [sic] can hold and on which he can build, both his works and his knowledge of reality and precisely in so doing sets him free."<sup>122</sup>

In this way, God's knowledge is to be known through contradiction, rather than through analogy. Shattering through human knowledge, crucifying knowledge enables true knowledge of God. Perhaps it was this to which Nagai was referring, when he spoke of *hansai*, the sacrifice of the Christian quarter in the atomic devastation. Mission rooted in the death and resurrection of Christ is kenotic, self-giving.

So, what is the response of someone committed to right remembrance in mission? The four aspects include the following: 1. Open-ness and alterity in reconciliation with the "other"; 2. Right remembrance through the Holy Spirit; 3. Acceptance of the social repercussions of dangerous memories; 4. Kenotic, self-emptying creative love.

## Conclusions

There is nothing magic about the testimony of suffering. In the story of Christ, and therefore the story of suffering in Nagasaki, the witnesses witnessed more than Christ's death or even death itself; they also testified to future life. Through the witness of suffering such as this, there is revealed a hoped for reconciliation.

Nagasaki has, more than most places (but representative of many places) experienced the depths of despair and hellish death. Without taking away from the ghoulishness of these memories, there is a sense that they shed a spotlight on our God with us. God accepts all, even evil into Godself, and transforms both the victimized and the dominating.

A witnessed understory of memories of suffering in Nagasaki pose a danger (to our apathy) that we may be changed into beings that bring life, rather than death, reversing the "natural" order of things. They, through Metz's *passiona memoria*, represent a revolution which is proposed to be stronger than any of the most powerful technological discoveries. The community wills and hopes in Christ's story that they are stronger even than nuclear power. This revolution brings radical freedom, not to impose, but freedom to embrace, forgive and also to forget.

The hope of the Christ story and equally my hope is that one day will come a time to forget and to blot out the sufferings of Nagasaki. It will be a day when we may celebrate life, including the lives of those who died agonizingly there. We envisage a celebration of meaning renewed, as these lives are taken up in the triune life of God.

The dangerous memory of the history of suffering in Nagasaki (including the *senpuku* and individuals such as Nagai) reveal our God with us and an ongoing transformation of societies built on the premise of domination.

In many contexts, mission has blotted out and avoided particular memories, and has not associated with the *passiona memoria* of Christ. Mission must be "open" to the "other", and accept the likely social repercussions of communicating the true "suffering" God. This will be enabled only by the Holy Spirit in self-emptying, kenotic love. Memories implore the follower of Christ to communicate a particular understory of history, avoiding imprisonment by the tendency towards domination and self absorption.

The story and the trial will continue. Individually and communally, we are called to be drawn into this story. By giving of ourselves, remembering and participating in reconciliation and transformation, individuals and communities may become a part of the resurrected life of God. Thus we become testimony to God's embrace and transformation of suffering. Grappling with the most extraordinary history of Nagasaki, and the ordinary people represented there, we cry out with Christ, and with the abandoned. We also cry out with a tenuous faith, for a future imagined. "My God, my God, why have you forsaken me?"

## Taking the gospel to Melanesia

Ian Breward

---

*Ian Breward* currently is the Archivist for the Uniting Church's Synod of Victoria and Tasmania, a Senior Fellow, School of Historical and Philosophical Studies, University of Melbourne, and a Fellow of Melbourne College of Divinity. Previously he was Professor of Church History, Theological Hall, Knox College Dunedin, 1965-81 and Professor of Church History, Theological Hall, Ormond College, University of Melbourne, 1982-99. His most recent books are **A history of the Australian Churches** (1993) and **A history of the Churches in Australasia** (2003).

---

*Neither Oceania nor animism played an important role at Edinburgh 1910. The view that was expressed in the Report to the Congress by Professors A Cairns and W Paterson, based on missionary reports insisted that missionaries must understand the native conception of reality and the methods of thinking accepted amongst the heathen, recognising that some sought to conceal their real beliefs from missionaries. The contributors to the report were convinced that animism and Christianity could not be combined, but suggested that there were points of contact, such as belief in a higher power, belief in an afterlife, a rudimentary moral sense and the practice of prayer. An evolutionary approach to animist religions was rejected by R H Codrington, who worked in the Melanesian Mission. Later when he returned to England he continued his research on the Melanesians and wrote much on the topic. He was a highly respected scholar who contributed much to the understanding of the Melanesians*

---

### Oceania and animism at Edinburgh 1910

The great missionary conference in Edinburgh during 1910 had little interest in Oceania. Of the 1200 delegates at the conference, 46 came from Britain, 16 from the United States, 41 from Europe, and 26 from southern Africa and Australasia. The Reverend Copland King from Papua New Guinea had a minor role, but basically the delegates were more interested in missionary work amongst the great religions and had much less interest in animism, apart from the work that had been done in parts of Africa and Indonesia.

Many Europeans did not accept that animism could even be classified as a religion. It lacked sacred scriptures and some even argued that it was a degeneration from original monotheism, rather than part of a shared human experience of the sacred world, which was always changing. Others had suggested that ideas of a high god were the result of Christian missionary influence. It was not until the discipline of anthropology gathered momentum that field-work among animists gave important fresh perspectives. Volume 4 of the Edinburgh Conference reports indicated some 25 contributors to the discussions on animism, which were dominated by the work of Bishop Callaway and the French Missionary, Henri Junod. Both had written important books, but those who worked in Oceania for the Melanesian Mission were not so well known, despite the fact that missionaries such as R H Codrington were very perceptive in their assessment of the fundamentals of animist religion and culture and had also produced significant publications.<sup>123</sup> Their mission was small and lacked the financial resources to send a delegate to Edinburgh.

From the beginning, the staff of the Melanesian Mission had accepted the importance of Melanesian culture and sought to develop culturally relevant indigenous Christianity. That was very difficult, given the large number of tribal languages in the region. The Mission opted for teaching and translating the language of the Mota community, even if that placed students from other islands at a disadvantage.

The report from the Edinburgh Conference on animistic religions, edited by Professors A Cairns and W Paterson, had important things to say on missionary attitudes, based on missionary reports. It insisted that missionaries must understand the native conception of reality and the methods of thinking accepted amongst the heathen, recognising that some sought to conceal their real beliefs

from missionaries. A sympathetic enquiry was essential and should build on the elements of good in animistic culture. The contributors to the report were convinced that animism and Christianity could not be combined, but suggested that there were points of contact, such as belief in a higher power, belief in an afterlife, a rudimentary moral sense and the practice of prayer.

They also argued that the Christian doctrine of God appealed to animists, providing them with a unified understanding of the sacred. They noted the importance of convictions about the afterlife and argued that an understanding of sin and the doctrine of redemption were also important. The Christian hope of everlasting life and the way in which Christian life could transform animist societies were also seen as important bridges for communications. There was, however, opposition to the Gospel because of its high moral claims, changes in the status of women and the difficulty of understanding the Christian view of resurrection of the body.

The Reverend R Wardlaw Thompson, from the London Missionary Society, gave an address at the Edinburgh Conference on the changes in the character of the missionary problem among primitive and backward peoples. That demonstrated very clearly the distinction between missionary work among primitive peoples and those who shared the great religions of the East. Missionary work amongst the former was the sole source of their progress. Thompson pointed out how the cultural superiority of the missionaries created problems.

The undeveloped intellectual life of such people, the absence of any sense of sin, the gross materialism and corruption of their natural state have proved further barriers, everywhere operative against the reception of the gospel.<sup>124</sup>

He noted, however, that the numbers of animists becoming Christians was remarkable. Thompson saw it as a long road to develop such peoples' growth in moral perception and Christian character.

We can only take one step at a time, and people who for ages have been sunk in gross materialism, and who have known no moral stimulus and no control of passion, save fear of consequences, have to take many steps before they can reach the most ordinary standard of moral principle and character recognised in Christian lands.<sup>125</sup>

It was not possible to keep such communities from contact with the impact of colonialism and imperialism, but it was difficult for such primitive peoples to quickly adjust to this new world. Thompson argued that Christian work must take broader and fuller forms if it is to prove the means of fitting these primitive races for a new and larger future.

The broad foundation of a civilised state is industry, not as the barbarous man works, fitfully to provide for his individual needs, but steadily in combination with others and for the common interest. The progressiveness of a civilised state is by growth of intelligence – i.e., of growing knowledge applied to the understanding and improvement of the conditions of work and life. The permanent strength and happiness of the civilised state rests in the development of character through the maintenance and cultivation of the fear of God, and of altruistic regard for our neighbours. It is our duty as Christian workers to see that the people to whom God sends us are prepared as well as we can to make them take their places in the new world which is being formed everywhere around them.<sup>126</sup>

In most cases the dignity of labour was an elementary lesson, which needed to be earnestly inculcated. The hunger for knowledge as a source of power and as enhancing man's value to the community had also to be stimulated and met. Above all, Christian principle had to be instilled and cultivated. This was not a new task, but it needed to take new forms because of the social and economic changes that affected the whole world.

The perfect body of a renewed humanity will not be complete until all races have contributed their own special elements of grace or dignity or strength or intellect of spiritual quality by it to its glorious nature. They are surely specially honoured who are trusted by the Master with the task of caring for His little ones, and of winning and leading out into the light those that have gone furthest and sunk lowest in the downward course of degradation. We look for the day when the black man with the yellow man, and the brown man with the white man, shall become one great brotherhood in Christ, and He shall be King of all the earth.<sup>127</sup>

## The contribution of R H Codrington

This evolutionary approach to animist religions was rejected by many on the Melanesian Mission, based first in Auckland and then in Norfolk Island. One of the most important critics of the idea that religion evolved from magic was R H Codrington, who lived from 15 September 1832 to 11 September 1922. He was born in Wroughton, Wiltshire, educated at Charterhouse from 1845 to 1848; and Wadham College from 1849-53. He became a college fellow in 1855, until 1893. He was ordained deacon and priest in 1855 and 1857 respectively and served briefly as a curate in Oxford before going to New Zealand in 1860 to work under Bishop Hobhouse of Nelson. He served in Waitnea and Collingwood and then in 1863 went with British Bishop Patterson to the islands. That led to his joining the Melanesian Mission in 1867. The Mission had been founded by Bishop Selwyn in 1849 and from the beginning sought to develop indigenous leaders.

Codrington agreed to go with the Mission to its new headquarters in Norfolk Island. In addition to teaching the students about the Christian faith, he mentored younger clergy, administered the Mission, cooked, helped with stone-carving in St Barnabas Chapel, taught some students to play the harmonium and experimented with photography. In addition, he made five voyages to the islands, from which students came, despite his dislike of sea travel. He steadily grew in linguistic knowledge and in cultural familiarity, because of the careful ways he checked his impressions with his students. Even though they were not necessarily acquainted with deep cultural knowledge, because of their age, he gradually came to see that the speculations of the early anthropologists needed to be complemented by careful observation in the field.

He was widely read in the writings of pioneering scholars in the emerging discipline of anthropology, such as E B Tylor and Max Muller.<sup>128</sup> At Patterson's request, Codrington contributed to the linguistic researches of the latter, in the *Proceedings of the Philological Society* in 1885, as well as writing on *mana* in a manner which opened up new perspectives on the depth of animistic culture. He was in regular touch with Lorimer Fison in Fiji and with pioneer American anthropologists, such as Lloyd Warner and the Society for Applied Anthropology and was publishing his reflections from 1880. From 1883, he returned to Oxford to complete the translation of the New Testament into Mota, published in 1885. His book on Melanesian languages was published in the same year, which further enhanced his reputation. He also attended some of Tylor's lectures.

In 1887, he retired and returned to England, becoming parish priest of Wadhurst, Sussex from 1887-93 and was Prebendary of Chichester Cathedral from 1887-95. In addition, he lectured in the Theological College there from 1885-95, continuing his work on Melanesia. He returned briefly to Norfolk Island in 1892, while Bishop Selwyn was in England, and published a definitive article *Melanesia* in 1915 in the *Encyclopaedia of Religion and Ethics*. He had previously given an important series of lectures on explaining Christianity to primitive people in 1902, as well as continuing to translate important religious resources into Mota. He continued to correspond with his former students, as well as helping those who had volunteered for service with the Melanesian Mission. He continued his translations into Mota. He was modest to a fault, despite his scholarly and ecclesiastical stature. He rejected the essentialist views of his time, emphasising that Melanesians shared many of the characteristics of the English villagers to whom he ministered. His work is now recognised as having classic quality, though he always acknowledged his debts to others working in the same fields, such as H H Romilly and H Guppy.

The Cambridge expedition to Torres Strait Islands and the writings of W H Rivers, W G Ivens and C Fox filled out his analyses and demonstrated the solidity of his local research by their extensive field-work. Codrington's book, **The Melanesians** (1891), helps us to see the fluidity and adaptability of Melanesians societies. In his account he covers their social regulations, property and inheritance, secret societies and ministries, societies and clubs, religion, sacrifice, sacred places and things, magic, possession, birth, childhood and marriage, the arts of life, dances and music games, miscellaneous, and stories. This admirable account of the richness of Melanesian culture naturally does not deal with some of the questions asked by modern scholars whose insight into relationships and tribal parallels builds on his insight into Melanesian culture.

He rejected the conclusion of some observers that Melanesians lived in tribes ruled by chiefs who had authority by virtue of supernatural powers. Codrington shows that this was not an adequate account

and that, unlike Polynesians, Melanesians had little sense of history. The memory of the past quickly passed away. Nor could *mana* be handed on to sons. He noted also how the islanders shared succession in property matters often in a matrilineal manner and he drew on Fison to show parallels on such issues with Fiji, as well as differences. Codrington argued that the secret societies characteristic of Melanesia had no special religious knowledge. There were links with the ghosts and the dead, but nothing obscene characterised their ceremonial. They had very high admission fees, with the consequence that most men never progressed beyond middle rank, whereas the church was quite different.

He gave a careful account of the place of dance and continually pointed out that Melanesians were not individuals like Europeans, but that their identity was inseparable from their kinship, property and community. He showed the rationality of a pre-literate world view and the way in which this was linked with rank and status. Some of his comments on Melanesian religion indicate that he was very aware of the danger of missionaries developing preconceived ideas about Melanesian religion, because they did not have the cultural and linguistic background to deal with the complexities of the subject. For example, he noted that prayers were not prayers in the Christian sense – they were made to those who have never been men and there was no necessarily rational consistency in native ideas.

As early as 1878, he wrote to Professor Muller about the inadequacies of Tylor's views on religion and how *mana* provided a much more complete explanation of animism than that has hitherto been obtained. Muller used that insight in his Hibbert lectures of the same year entitled "Lectures on the origin and growth of religion." Tylor's views fitted a cultural context, which emphasised evolutionary progress towards the achievements of 19<sup>th</sup> century Europe, which then seemed the peak of hitherto existing culture. Codrington pointed out the limitations of such a viewpoint. He noted that only a minority of any community possessed significant *mana* and that there was no order of priests or magicians, although every person of significance had some knowledge of how to approach some ghost or spirit. Similarly, such men knew different secret and cult practices, which covered sickness, witchcraft, dreams, prophecy, divination, or death with poison, and curses.

Codrington's vivid descriptions of Melanesian culture are still of great value. He insisted that:

...the civilised observer is always ready to assume that the savage takes a childish view and has absurd beliefs, when all the while, if the savage could put him to a close examination, his own conceptions would be found very indistinct and his expressions mainly figurative.<sup>129</sup>

He brings out the richness of Melanesian ideas in ways which are still full of illumination. Later members of the Melanesian Mission did not always share the ability to understand his observations, or to develop their implications for the development of an indigenous church.

Codrington's intellectual achievement still provides a model for understanding other cultures that was considerably in advance of many of those who wrote on the subject for the 1910 Edinburgh Conference.<sup>130</sup>

## Can writing history contribute to the missions endeavour? Reflections from Mongolia's Christian history.

**Hugh P Kemp**

---

**Dr Hugh Kemp** worked in Ulaanbaatar, Mongolia between 1992 and 1996, with ongoing consultancy to various Christian mission endeavours since then. He is currently Head of Mission Studies at Redcliffe College, Gloucester, in the UK.

---

*The Christian church in Mongolia was established and grew rapidly in the 1990s. While much primary material now exists – missionary newsletters, diaries, blogs and the likes – little critical formally published material is available: there is a need for critical reflection on the growth of Christianity in Mongolia in these first twenty years. Moreover, the birth of the modern Christian church has a long historical context. Consequently, I offer in this paper an anecdotal account of the research process over seventeen years (1992-2009) which I have undertaken to explore Mongolia's Christian history. However, this paper goes beyond mere anecdote and description. I offer a theoretical historico-legal lens for addressing Mongolia's Christian history: this is the policy of religious tolerance, found in the Mongol yasa (case law). In doing this, I offer a framework for ongoing critical reflection on Christian history in Mongolia and explain how the Mongolian church is now appropriating its history for pastoral, legal and evangelistic ends.*

---

### Introduction

Today's nation state of Mongolia is the derivative of an empire that some claim to have been the world's largest land empire (from 1206). Mongolian historian L Oyungerel believes the Mongol empire to have been the first example of actual globalisation.<sup>131</sup> Since 1990, Mongolia has slowly engaged with the global community, after sixty-six years of communist politics.<sup>132</sup> Mongolia is asking "who are we?" The answer may well be in how Mongolians remember. Robert Pinsky, the American poet laureate, posited that a people is not defined and unified by blood so much as by shared memory. How we remember ourselves is how we will interpret who we are in the present: a vision of [the] future is sourced from the poetry of [the] past.<sup>133</sup> Concurrently with Mongolia's emergence from 1990, the Christian church was established, and then grew rapidly.

Although not widely known, Mongolia has had a Christian thread woven throughout its history. In 1992, young Mongolian Christians asked me to research and write their Christian history. Most Mongolian Christians – and there were less than 200 in three congregations in Ulaanbaatar in 1992 – did not know they even had a Christian history. Because I had potential access to a broader selection of resources than they had, I agreed. Australasia, despite its historical and political distance from Mongolia, was as well resourced as anywhere, having depositories of relevant material at both the Australian National University (Canberra) and the University of Canterbury (Christchurch). Thus began a seventeen-year journey of research and writing: the specific end in mind was a Christian history in the Mongolian language, for the Mongolian church.

But what might be meant by a "Christian history"? Can a people or nation, formed amongst the transient alliances of the steppe, historically steeped in Shamanism, Buddhism, and Communism, even conceptualise a "Christian history"? By "Christian history" I mean a description and assessment of those elements of Mongolian history where Mongols themselves have been Christian in some sense, and/or have been influenced by nations and people who have been known to be Christian. This paper reflects on the process of researching and writing this history: it is an attempt to answer the question, "In what ways might researching and writing this people's Christian history contribute to

the extension of God's kingdom?" I endeavour to describe that process, to give notice of the emerging resources that have come out of the project, and to bring some initial critical reflection on the mission endeavour in Mongolia.

### The context

During the early 1990s the Mongolian state rapidly began to reinvent itself: it shook off Communism, re-wrote the history books, and replaced Lenin with a reinvented Genghis Khan. The Mongols had a heightened awareness of their place in history: they had an acute sense of the historical moment. A new open door policy allowed a limited entry of new religions and a reinvigoration of old ones. A new statute followed in 1993 regulating the relationship of religion and state. This law enshrined Islam, Buddhism (that is, the Tibetan form) and Shamanism as the three Mongolian religions. The implication for the majority Khalka tribe of Mongols (around 80% of the population) was plain: to be Mongolian, one was either Buddhist or Shamanist.<sup>134</sup> (The inclusion of Islam is generally understood to be a concession to the Muslim Khazaks of the four western provinces.) After all, Genghis Khan (1162-1227) was a Shamanist, and his grandson Kublai Khan (1215-1294) invited Buddhism from Tibet when he ruled China.

The dramatic birth of the Christian church in Mongolia from 1991 caught the authorities by surprise. What was Christianity, and why was it expanding so rapidly? Could one be a Mongolian and Christian at the same time? Perhaps because of this perception of the historical moment, Mongolian Christian leaders requested me to research and write their Christian history subsequent to a short talk I gave in 1992 to the Everlasting Dawn (*Urdeen Gegée*) church on the history of Christianity amongst the Mongols. I demonstrated in my talk that because of significant evidence in the Mongols' history, Christianity was in fact not new to the Mongols. In other words, to address a current religious question was also to address historical and political questions. A documented Christian history could have political and legal ramifications, if Shamanism and Buddhism did not necessarily have historical hegemony. Several key Mongolian queens and civil servants had been Christian in some sense;<sup>135</sup> several of the Mongol Khans had entertained converting to Christianity; Christianity had in fact preceded Buddhism in Central Asia by several centuries. The Prester John rumours in Europe (12<sup>th</sup> – 17<sup>th</sup> centuries) suggested that the Mongols (or pre-Mongol tribes of the steppe) had converted *en masse* to Christianity.<sup>136</sup> This could lead to a rethink at best, or a direct clash at worst with the standard history as understood by the Mongols.

I had gleaned information for the talk at Everlasting Dawn from the first edition of Marku Tsering's book **Sharing Christ in the Tibetan Buddhist World** (Chiang Mai: Tibet Press, 2005), which at the time was the only popular book available which identified a Christian history amongst the Buddhist peoples of central Asia. This became the seed bed for a Master's thesis: **Khans, Keraites, Courtiers and Queens: An Introduction to Christianity amongst the Mongols, with Special Enquiry into the Mongol Imperial Era** (Sydney: Australian College of Theology, 1998). In this thesis, I picked up on the broadly accepted notion that Genghis and subsequent Khans had a policy of religious tolerance. This is generally understood as being encoded in the *yasa*, which was probably a body of case law, of which only portions survive.<sup>137</sup> I argue that because religious tolerance was embedded in the *yasa* and demonstrated in the Khans' pragmatic political policies, Christianity has a right to exist amongst the Mongols. This argument is the backbone of section one of my own book **Steppe by Step** (London: Monarch, 2000). This book sought to give overall shape to the Mongols' Christian history: a Mongolian language edition of this book was published in July 2009 with the title **Tukheen Balarkhai Jimeer**. Thus the invitation from the Mongolian Christian leaders was fulfilled.

### Methodology

In addition to recognising Mongol religious tolerance as political policy, I proposed key Christian historical periods and gave notice of these in the entry *Mongolia* in Eerdman's **A Dictionary of Asian Christianity** (Grand Rapids: 2001). Mongol historical chronology can be understood from a number of different perspectives. In 1990, Mongolia stood at the end of sixty-six years of Soviet-style communism and embraced democracy. Mongolian history from 1368 (the end of Mongol rule in China) until 1911 (establishment of an independent state), had been dominated by neighbouring China. Prior to 1368 the Mongols had been self determining. Mongol history therefore poses a



curious challenge with regard to perspective: Marxist, Chinese, Western or Mongolian perspectives may look quite different.

David Morgan persuasively argues that the dominant aspect in Mongol history is the primacy of the 12th and 13th century imperial period.<sup>138</sup> The main source documents are **The Secret History of the Mongols** written some time between 1228 and 1252,<sup>139</sup> and the Chinese **Yuan Shih** (written by Ming historians, subsequent to the demise of the Yuan empire in 1368). In the modern psyche of Mongolia, the imperial period continues to be primary and iconic. Genghis is invoked at national festivals, and boys and vodka are named after him. A larger than life statue of Genghis now sits overlooking Sukhbaatar Square, Ulaanbaatar.

Within the imperial era (1206-1368), there are three noteworthy aspects with respect to Christian history. Firstly, Nestorians were already in Central Asia when the Mongols rose to power in the thirteenth century. The Mongols as a unified ethno-political group did not exist prior to the rise of Genghis Khan (1206) and therefore it is not possible *a priori* to talk of "Christian history amongst the Mongols". Rather, when the Mongols rose to dominance on the central Asian steppe, there was already some Christian presence amongst the tribes. Secondly, European Christians – specifically the Franciscans – had contact with the Mongols by means of official embassies during this time. Thirdly the Mongols' policy of religious tolerance permitted a socio-political environment within which both Nestorianism and Catholicism were able to gain a tentative profile. Consequently, the imperial period can also have primacy in a Christian history.

Samuel Moffett has provided a broad account of Christianity amongst the Mongols during the imperial period.<sup>140</sup> The context of Moffett's record is the spread of Christianity eastward into Asia up until the rise of European colonialism in the 16th century. Moffett presents Christianity amongst the Mongols as an end result of Christian mission to Asia. I have attempted a different angle, namely, that Christianity was embryonic on the steppe as the Mongols consolidated under Genghis Khan, such that it could be considered to be an indigenous religion as the Mongols took identity. Rather than examining how Christianity spread to the Mongols (as Moffett has done), I explored the significance of Mongol contact with Christianity that occurred during the imperial period with respect to the rise, demise and subsequent independence of the Mongolian nation up until the establishment of the modern Church in 1991. In other words, I sought to examine how Christianity was received by the Mongols – an emic stance – and consequently how that may have been a seed of the modern church. I attempted not so much to examine what Christian mission was undertaken to the Mongols, but rather, how the Mongols responded to the Nestorianism they inherited and the Catholicism that came to them. The difference is subtle, but nonetheless important. It is the difference of a Western perspective or a Mongol perspective: it is an examination of the cultural and religious response of the Mongols to the Christianity they encountered, in whatever version it was.

It is very easy for talk of "Christian history" to slip into notions of Western imperialism, due to the historical coat-tails of colonial expansion on to which the missionary endeavour once clung. James Scherer names political, cultural and ecclesiastical imperialism as real risks when allowing the will of God to be linked too closely to political formulations.<sup>141</sup> Nevertheless, whether an emic or etic stance is taken, a Christian history can be solely conceived of as driven by divine providence. With the explosive birth of the Mongolian church from 1991, there was much talk of "God's timing for Mongolia". In writing a Christian history, there is the risk of "describing over-boldly the outworking of the divine will" and conversely "ignoring details that do not readily fit into the resulting scheme".<sup>142</sup> Ralph Covell rightly reminds us that God's sovereignty sometimes looks very like the Chinese notion of the mandate of heaven:<sup>143</sup> indeed, Genghis Khan understood himself to be chosen by *munkh tengger* (the eternal blue sky) itself to conquer the world.

Whether assuming divine providence or not, due humility must surely be a characteristic of any historian. Is the holy grail of objectivity actually achievable? Isn't all history writing interpretation? Living amongst the people, and having knowledge of language and culture, along with due consultation and qualitative methods – including interviewing Mongolian academics and church leaders – are all fruitful research pursuits. These strategies can and should be used to approximate "what happened" and "why it happened". Nevertheless, to use the words of Melvin Smith, surely a "faithful history" must be possible? Firstly, believers have unique insight into their own faith (that non-believers do not have), and secondly, the "believer's sympathetic posture allows them to use the

whole substance of their historical witnesses' testimonies or statements".<sup>144</sup> In other words, since a transcendent objectivity is impossible, why presume it?

Consequently, I have centred my own interpretation of Mongol Christian history on the *yasa*, a uniquely Mongol political policy which had a religious outcome. Similarly, my interpretation takes Nestorian Christianity at face value, allowing its Asian roots and characteristics to speak for themselves, rather than relegating them to the traditional Western category of "heresy". To see Mongol Christianity as an Asian phenomenon rather than a Western phenomenon is legitimate. If "Asia" is defined in its broadest sense,<sup>145</sup> then Jesus was an Asian, born into an Asian culture. The first Christians to Central Asia were Asians (from Syria). Nestorianism had grown up in an Asian context, distinct from Western – that is, Roman – theology or politics. Both Western Catholicism and Western Protestantism were late arrivals.

A Christian history of the Mongols assumes that the divine will is influencing history, rather than Man (as the Marxist would believe), or karma (as the Buddhist would believe). Mongol Christian history is a linear drama in the context of world history that had a beginning and will have an end: it is part of the overall drama of the history in which "all things hold together in Christ" (Colossians 1:17). Mongol Christian history may well follow the patterns of secular Mongol history, but the Christian historian will interpret these patterns in light of a divine continuum.

### **Revisionism and relevance**

The church in modern Mongolia wants to know what are its Asian-Christian roots. This had been expressed to me many times in Mongolia between 1992 and 2002. Mongolian Christians have responded favourably at the presentation of lectures on Mongol Christian history with questions like "why has no-one ever told us this before?" The study of Mongol Christian history needs to address their questions. To show that Christianity had been on the Central Asian steppe since before the days of Genghis Khan, and to show that it began as an Asian religion is important in the church's self understanding. Mongolian Christians want to be able to address two common accusations that are thrown at them: "Christianity is a Western religion" (therefore one cannot be Mongolian and Christian at the same time) and "Christianity is merely a recent phenomenon" (and therefore irrelevant or illegitimate, as Shamanism and Tibetan-Buddhism are perceived to precede it).

Relevance to the modern church then becomes a criterion for researching its history: it will be the church's questions that govern the direction and content of the church's recorded history. Mongolian Christians want to know "what happened" in the past. Because the present church is still relatively young, the sequence of events, the places, the dates and the people are not known: they need to be catalogued. The answer to the question "why has no-one ever told us this before?" is two-fold: firstly, no one has brought all the facts together, and secondly, Communism over the last six decades has skewed Mongol historiography to favour its own agenda.

A catalogue of the events of the past is needed because the Mongolian church has had no record of "what happened". However, Mongol Christian history should not be limited merely to this. The interpretative role of the historian is crucial in light of a revisionist trend in modern Mongolian historiography.<sup>146</sup> An historian needs to annotate what happened, and then go on to hypothesise about why it happened. Yet an historian's judgement is fallible. John Roxborough reminds us that "history writing takes place within history and is itself subject to critical historical reflection".<sup>147</sup> An historian "will suggest neither that wrongdoing is a permissible option nor that the historian is the final arbiter of right and wrong".<sup>148</sup> Why then should I have written a history other than having been asked, and because I had access to Western libraries? This surely was a good enough reason: in the shadow of Communism, there were simply no written sources within Mongolia itself, other than an eclectic selection of materials located in the Central State Library in Ulaanbaatar, that must have survived the state purges of the 1930s and 1940s.

Because of the historical revisionism that is going on in Mongolia, now is the time to alert both the church and the nation to its Christian history, to make sure Mongol Christian history is written into the emerging revised cultural narrative. Because of the legacy of Communism, the Mongolian church has not known what questions to ask, and whether it could ask them. In these first twenty years, expansion and church growth have been the priorities. Evangelists and church planters have been so

busy getting the church established that they have spent little time reflecting critically on the process. They neglect historical reflection at their peril: now is the time to do so.

The historical reflection which I commenced in my Master's thesis, morphed into the more popular book **Steppe by Step** (2000). Perhaps I have introduced a bias into this book by wanting to find a Christian history that the Mongols can be proud of. I wrote with a destiny in mind: that of a document that would tell truth (there is a Christian history and such-and-such happened) and be encouraging (Christians have been part of the Mongol nation right from its earliest days). I also had a religio-political end in mind: I wanted to demonstrate that there was a legal basis for the existence of Christianity amongst the Mongols (based on the priority and precedence of the *yasa*) and that Christianity was a legitimate Mongolian religion (some central Asian steppe tribes embraced it centuries before Tibetan-Buddhism). **Steppe by Step** was a book "on the way" to **Tukheen Balarkhai Jimeer**, the Mongolian version, finally published in 2009.

This Mongolian edition now allows Mongolia's Christian history to be located in the context of Asian Christian history. James Phillips notes that as early as 1963, Christians in Asia had come to the conviction that a new way of writing their history was needed. This call was for an overall "unified Asian church history".<sup>149</sup> How a Mongolian Christian history fits a bigger Asian history is yet to be conceptualised, and Phillips acknowledges that the "rhythms and dynamics of one nation's [Christian] religious history [will be] different from those of another".<sup>150</sup> Nevertheless, John Roxborough, in the Malaysian context, notes that

...what was written for local Christians was not infrequently translations of Western material ... It is now better recognised that what is needed is not just material which answers the questions of churches overseas about what was going on in countries to which missionaries had been sent, but that which seeks to provide a sense of identity for a local church concerned with questions like 'who are we?', 'where have we come from?' [and] 'where are we going'? ... Writing for a local constituency means national concerns have priority and one of these concerns is how expressions of Christianity can be true both to its universal nature and its local cultural context.<sup>151</sup>

A Church History consultation held in Hong Kong in 1975 suggested that a history of Asian Christianity should be ecumenical, missiological, contextual and chronological. For reasons unexplained, the consultation dropped the chronological characteristic, perhaps wary of reductionist paradigms like "the Age of Exploration, 1500-1800" and the like, which have been characteristic of European histories.<sup>152</sup> For Mongolian Christian history, however, it has been imperative to document a chronological framework.

A chronological component to the Christian history of Mongolia is necessary for three reasons: pastoral, legal/cultural, and evangelistic. In the broader Asian context, it is important to demonstrate that the church was not Western in the first instance. Christianity amongst the Mongols had theological and historical roots in Syrian Christianity (that is, so-called Nestorianism): in other words, it was Asian. For a young Asian church – and specifically Mongolia – this demonstrates that it stands in a long tradition, and that it can have a legitimate place in the wider culture because of that longevity. This hopefully will allow the Mongol to walk tall in a legitimate and relevant identity, and concurrently invite due humility and respect from the missionary. As Samuel Moffett reminds us, "a knowledge of history can do much to soften cultural antagonisms toward the gospel". Indeed, "the church in Asia deserves better ... It has earned the right to know and honour its *own* Asian Christian heritage" (italics in original). Christianity in Asia is not "foreign": it is itself Asian.<sup>153</sup> Because there is a call from various voices that Asians need to take up the challenge of new identities,<sup>154</sup> Mongol Christians can have genuine identity because they now know that Christianity precedes Shamanism and Buddhism on the central Asian steppe.

It follows that if Mongol Christians can have explicit identity, then this has legal and cultural implications. Mongol Christians can have a legitimate role to play in the new Mongolia because they have always been part of the old Mongolia. Regarding the 1993 Law of the Relationship of Religion and State, Christians were not so much excluded from official recognition as merely omitted. When challenged constitutionally because of conversion clauses, the state shifted.<sup>155</sup> At city governance level, Christians have had courage to challenge localised prejudice, with some success. Churches have been able to register with the State, and consequently secure the privileges of a legitimate legal profile. This, I have argued, is because of the inherent religious tolerance embedded in Genghis

Khan's *yasa*. After the book launch of **Tukheen Balarkhai Jimeer** in July 2009, one hundred copies were set aside for personal delivery to Mongolia's members of parliament. The book has already been acknowledged by the leadership of the Democratic Party (personal correspondence, 2009).

Thirdly, because Mongolian Christians do have identity and legality, they can legitimately practise their religion, which includes evangelism. The 1993 law implied exclusion of foreigners in the expansion of foreign religions: presumably the legislators had Christianity in mind. This, in the long term, has forced Mongol Christians themselves to continue to evangelise the nation. Recent documentation of the establishment and growth of the church in Erdenet – Mongolia's third biggest city – bears witness to this.<sup>156</sup> Today, estimates of the Christian number are around 60,000 (2.3% of the population) with a Christian presence in every province.

## Conclusions

The request that came to me in 1992 was simply "please write our history". There was a vacuum – there was no written summative history of Christianity for the emerging church. The task was to discover, collate and describe. Now the task is different: it is to evaluate, contextualise and theologise. Thus I find myself as historian, sociologist and theologian with the invitation to demonstrate God's providence in the history of the Mongol nation. Now that the Mongol church has identity, place and stature in the new national narrative, so its attention can be given to its own shape and future. The marginalised of Mongolia can find identity in Christ in the church, and perhaps just as significantly, in so doing, can also find Mongol identity.

The Mongolian church growth is an example of the shift away from a westernised Christianity. Yet it did risk falling prone to westernisation in the 1990s due to the influence of missionaries, amongst other factors. There is a call for the Mongol church to move beyond strategies of evangelism derived from western modernist assumptions. A more organic relational and incarnational approach with a prophetic voice to the nation is possible, practical and, as I have sought to demonstrate, historically legitimate. If the Gospel is to continue to take root, then it must nourish the nation by speaking into the history of the nation. I have resisted the temptation to look for some "turning point" – some ideal event or time that is deemed so significant that all subsequent history is informed by it.<sup>157</sup> Quite the contrary. Mongolian Christian history has lurched through time without seemingly any major formative event. Rather, using the *yasa* as lens offers an internal cultural principle known to all Mongols through which one can legitimately explain why Christianity has been amongst the Mongols for a considerable time: the religious tolerance embedded in the *yasa* also legitimizes Christianity for the future. Therefore the church can and should lead initiatives in national reconciliation and the new narrative. Mongol Christians are optimistic that they can "win the nation for Christ": a church of 60,000 today – and growing – challenges Mongolia's dominant worldview and introduces a new and real cultural plausibility structure.<sup>158</sup>

A Mongolian public servant on a government scholarship, studying in Napier, New Zealand in 2009 read **Tukheen Balarkhai Jimeer** and commented: "these are my people. This is my tribe. I never knew this" (Personal correspondence). It is precisely because of this expressed openness and curiosity amongst even officialdom – echoes of the religious tolerance in the *yasa* – that Christianity, rooted legitimately in a renewed national narrative, will continue to find voice in Mongolia. In the recent words of Emmanuel Katongole and Chris Rice: "training in Christian hope doesn't start with results. It starts with remembering".<sup>159</sup>

## Notes

## **Inculturation, authority and mission - the experience of James McDonald, Maketenara**

Nicholas Reid

---

**Dr Nicholas Reid** has written biographies of two leading New Zealand churchmen, and has lectured in History and Church History at the Universities of Otago and Auckland. He is currently researching and writing a history of the Catholic Diocese of Auckland, focusing on the impact of significant individuals. He interprets mission in the context of institutional church history.

---

*For many years in the late nineteenth century, the Irishman James McDonald was the only Catholic priest actively running a mission to the Maori in New Zealand's large Diocese of Auckland. His eccentricity and his desire for authority sometimes put him at odds with his superior, the diocesan bishop, as did his active opposition to the introduction of the Mill Hill Fathers as missionaries to the Maori. This article seeks to show, however, that he genuinely became embedded in Maori society, adopted Maori habits of thought, and hence in some ways anticipated what would later be seen as inculturation in the missionary field.*

---

How do we judge the effectiveness of a missionary? By the number of converts made or by the missionary's ability to evangelise in terms that are culturally appropriate? Or do we still applaud a missionary for his/her ability to integrate an indigenous community into a pre-existing European-led church? These questions are relevant in considering the career of the Irish Catholic priest James McDonald (1824-90), who was for many years the only Catholic priest conducting a mission to the Maori in New Zealand's large Diocese of Auckland.

James and his younger brother Walter (1830- 99) were natives of Mooncoin in the south of County Kilkenny. They sprang from a distinctively clerical culture, had many relatives who were in Orders, and were both trained at All Hallows seminary in Dublin. Speakers of both English and the traditional Irish language, they both became fluent in Maori.<sup>160</sup> James arrived in New Zealand in 1852 and Walter in 1855. They were stalwart supporters of New Zealand's first Catholic bishop, the Frenchman Jean-Baptiste Francois Pompallier. The bishop suffered a chronic shortage of priests and rapidly gave both McDonald brothers positions of responsibility in his large diocese. This was home to the bulk of the Maori population and hence Auckland's mission to the Maori should have involved more missionaries than the mission to the Maori in the less populous neighbouring Diocese of Wellington, which was conducted the Marist priests. Within a year of his arrival, James had been made Pompallier's Vicar General and was making pastoral visits to outlying areas, preaching in both Maori and English.<sup>161</sup>

Walter McDonald's career does not concern us here. Although capable of preaching in Maori, he spent most of his life in city parishes ministering to European congregations. James McDonald's career, however, is the story of a man who gradually became the diocese's sole missionary to the Maori.

### **Administering the diocese**

At first, James was Pompallier's right-hand man in running the diocese. For 18 months in 1859-60, when the bishop was absent in Europe seeking personnel, James was diocesan administrator. His surviving letter/book shows that he took on the full range of duties, from supervising priests to trying to find finances for Catholic schools.<sup>162</sup> However, his lack of financial acumen was widely criticised. Ironically, in light of his later career, the biggest criticism that can be levelled against James at this time was the poor advice he gave to his bishop with regard to the Maori mission. The historian Ernest Simmons believed that James encouraged Pompallier to overrate his own potential as a peacemaker between the races when the wars of the 1860s were brewing. McDonald and Pompallier misinterpreted the Maori King Movement as a simple assertion of Maori sovereignty, without considering the driving issues of land ownership.<sup>163</sup>

James was again in charge of the diocese in 1868-69, after Pompallier had left for the last time and before a new bishop was appointed. The diocese was in a state of organisational and financial crisis. James' handling of this was not spectacular. He presided at an argumentative meeting of laity and clergy at which the financial problems of Catholic schools were discussed to little effect.<sup>164</sup> Following the instructions of the absent bishop, an investigating commission was set up.<sup>165</sup> James was constrained to admit that the diocese was virtually bankrupt.<sup>166</sup> He had to contend with a report sent to Rome by disaffected laity annoyed at his administration. Bishop James Goold of Melbourne appointed Apostolic Visitor, investigated Auckland and produced a report endorsing all the criticisms that had been made of both McDonalds. James ceased to be Vicar General and was sent off by Goold to look after the Pukekohe area south of Auckland.<sup>167</sup> This could have taken the heart out of him and effectively ended his career. Instead, it was the beginning of his eminence as a missionary to the Maori.

### **Maketenara - Wikario Henerari**

Well before the departure of Bishop Pompallier, and while he was still a relative newcomer to the diocese, James McDonald had already made a reputation for his work with the Maori. As early as 1858, he was signing Maori-language letters with the Maori transliteration of his name, "Na Maketenara".<sup>168</sup> By the early 1860s, he was frequently making visitations for baptisms in predominantly Maori areas such as Waiheke, Hokianga, Waimahana, Taupo, Wangaroa, Kororareka and Ngaruawahia.<sup>169</sup> When Pompallier formally resigned as bishop, one of his unsuccessful suggestions was that James be made bishop for the Maori, to serve as auxiliary to the new ordinary.<sup>170</sup>

The Catholic mission to the Maori fell apart in the wars of the 1860s. In 1867 James wrote to the rector of his *alma mater* All Hallows. Among other things, he gave his version of the collapse of the Maori mission:

This country has been very much tried by war for the last six years and I need not describe to you the baneful effects of this calamity. Its operation with regards to this diocese has been very injurious, as many of the out-stations were obliged to be abandoned by the priests having care of them. These priests had to come to Auckland to the Bishop where His Lordship had to support them. This indeed was a very heavy burden on the bishop's administration, the funds of which even before the war were so limited and entirely inadequate to the many pressing and necessary wants of His Lordship's diocese. These stations abandoned by the clergy having been either destroyed or fallen into decay, had again to be reinstated and repaired by the Bishop. This work caused a great outlay and much expenditure, too great indeed for the Bishop's administration to bear.<sup>171</sup>

What James did not explain was that the "reinstated and repaired" stations mostly remained without priests to man them. By the mid-1870s, there were only three Catholic priests in the whole diocese who could speak Maori – the two McDonalds and their fellow Irishman Michael O'Hara.<sup>172</sup>

When he was banished from Auckland town after 1870, James McDonald was for a time "pastor of the whole land area between Papakura and Tuakau from the Tasman Sea to the Hauraki Gulf."<sup>173</sup> He also made infrequent pastoral visits to Maori areas north of Auckland. Gradually, he became the diocese's sole recognised Maori missionary. In 1874, he was formally put in charge of the Maori mission by Bishop Croke, though not relieved of his current parish duties.<sup>174</sup> In 1880 Croke's successor Archbishop Steins made James' appointment to the Maori mission exclusive.<sup>175</sup> The Catholic newspaper the *New Zealand Tablet* reported:

Owing to the appointment of the Very Rev. Dr. McDonald to the post of spiritual guide to the Catholic Maoris of this diocese by His Grace Archbishop Steins, he has been obliged, in obedience to the call of duty, to leave the district of Drury, where he has laboured so devotedly during the past twelve years [sic]. The districts of Pukekohe, Maketu, Tuakau, Waipipi etc. were also under his spiritual charge. Dr McDonald left on the S.S. *Wanaka* for Russell last week, in order to commence his new mission, for which his knowledge of the native language and of native character pre-eminently qualifies him.<sup>176</sup>

In 1883, Bishop Luck increased James McDonald's status with the title Vicar General (Wikario Henerari) for the Maori.<sup>177</sup> In the 1870s and early 1880s, then, James was the whole Auckland Catholic diocesan mission to the Maori. Only in 1885, as he brought the Mill Hill missionaries into the diocese, did Bishop Luck confine James' mission to the area north of Auckland.

### **James McDonald seeking authority**

Did James McDonald gain inflated ideas of his own importance, or come to see the Maori mission as his exclusive property? It would be hard for him to think otherwise in the years when there was no other priest helping him in the field. There is some evidence that he occasionally confused his own position with his bishop's authority. In 1869 he had been granted the faculty, usually reserved to the bishop, "of giving Confirmation to the Maori and European flocks of the diocese."<sup>178</sup> He appears to have been behind a letter-writing campaign by Catholic Maori in the 1880s to have him granted this faculty again. In August 1884, a letter signed by 53 Maori (mainly catechists) chided Bishop Luck for suggesting he would invite Canon Benoit to New Zealand to be a Maori missionary. The Maori correspondents said they preferred Father McDonald to a priest who did not know their language.<sup>179</sup> Two weeks later, the Maori catechist Wiremu Puriri wrote to Walter McDonald from James McDonald's station at Purakau on the Hokianga harbour, again criticising Bishop Luck's view of the Maori mission and declaring

...we wish you to know we are most happy and joyful in our hearts at the great work of the Very Rev Dr McDonald in teaching us, the old Catholics, who long since have gone astray – persons who have left the Holy Catholic Church. These strayed sheep have been brought back by the sound and constant teaching of our dear and affectionate father the Very Rev Dr McDonald.... Beloved father I wish to inform you that our holy and sacred father the Very Rev Dr McDonald is energetic, zealous and persevering in teaching us. ...This is another thing which I wish to bring under your notice, the letter Bishop Luck sent to us in November 1883. That man [Bishop Luck] said he would write to Pope Leo XIII to send Episcopal power to our father the Very Rev Dr McDonald. The year is out but the power did not come. We wish that the power of administering the Holy Sacrament of Confirmation be given to our father the Very Rev Dr McDonald, in order that he would confirm us.<sup>180</sup>

Early in 1885 Bishop Luck did grant James McDonald the faculty of confirmation.<sup>181</sup> In no time, James was advising his brother that it would be better for the bishop not to make a planned visitation to one Maori settlement as it would merely provoke jealousy with other Maori settlements; and that it would be better if he [James] undertook any required confirmations.<sup>182</sup> By early 1886, Bishop Luck was petitioned by many hundred Maori with the request that James McDonald

...be our bishop, the bishop of the Maori people in the Roman Catholic Church in New Zealand. The reason that we make this humble request is that we see that the Bishops of this island are too much burthened with the care of the two races – Europeans and Maoris. We would then humbly ask your Lordship to strengthen our petition and to intercede for us with our most holy Father Pope Leo XIII. This is from your truly loving children in the holy Catholic Apostolic Roman Church.<sup>183</sup>

Bishop Luck replied diplomatically that only the pope could make a new bishop and that the incoming Mill Hill fathers would be teaching the same Catholic doctrine that Maketenara taught.<sup>184</sup>

### **James McDonald as an obstruction?**

All these exchanges could be seen as harmless eccentricity or harmless egotism on James McDonald's part, but they did have the negative effect of complicating Bishop Luck's serious endeavour to revive the Maori mission by bringing in the Mill Hill fathers. James was behind the petition to have himself made Prefect or Vicar Apostolic, and hence bishop, for the Maori. From 1883 to 1886 he actively lobbied for this.<sup>185</sup> When Luck returned from an overseas trip in early 1885, the *Tablet* reported him as saying,

...since the Waikato War, and the retiring about the same time of the Marist Fathers to Wellington, the natives had been almost – but for the energetic and indefatigable exertions of Very Rev Dr James McDonald – neglected. This state of things could not be allowed. After a great deal of trouble and negotiation he thought he had succeeded in

securing the labours of missionary fathers of St Joseph's Society for the Maoris. A father of the society would be here in a few weeks. He would make a report to the head of the Order, as a preliminary to the arrival of the missionaries themselves.<sup>186</sup>

This reported statement tactfully acknowledged James McDonald's service while at the same time suggesting its inadequacy. It also hinted at the long and complicated negotiations Bishop Luck had had to undertake to establish the Mill Hill mission. Since 1883 Luck had been involved in a detailed correspondence with Canon Benoit and with Bishop (later Cardinal) Herbert Vaughan, who had founded the Mill Hills (St Joseph's Missionary Society) in the 1860s. Luck sometimes noted James McDonald's obstruction to his scheme and indicated that the Marist Fathers' mission to the Maori in Wellington should be similar to the Mill Hills' model. Shortly before his statement appeared in the *Tablet*, Bishop Luck had written to Bishop Vaughan:

The religious question is at present uppermost in the minds of the Maoris and I believe there is a bright prospect before the missionaries: hopes may now be realised which a year hence would be perhaps irreparably lost. On my side I am doing all I can to prepare for the arrival of the Fathers. I am endeavouring to organise a great gathering of the Maoris...with as much religious ceremony as possible. I have not yet seen Dr James Macdonald [sic] but I have every confidence that I shall be able to overcome any difficulty that may have arisen in this quarter...I will arrange with [Bishop] Redwood of Wellington for the fathers to pay a visit to the flourishing Marist Maori Mission of Hiruharama (Jerusalem) to get initiated to Maori customs and language.<sup>187</sup>

Luck signed Bishop Vaughan's statement setting up the new mission and making over to the Mill Hills property for a Maori school. (Later Luck had to admit that he did not have the legal authority to make over this property).<sup>188</sup> But his problem with James McDonald remained. McDonald persisted in his ambition to become bishop to the Maori. In 1886 he gained the sympathetic ear of Cardinal Moran in Sydney, who in turn persuaded Propaganda in Rome to support James McDonald's plan. Bishop Luck was horrified that he had not been consulted. To Cardinal Moran he wrote:

My Lord Cardinal, I have this day received reliable information from Rome that on Your Eminence's recommendation the Rev James Macdonald [sic], a priest of my Diocese, is to be appointed either Prefect or Vicar Apostolic for the Maoris. I cannot disguise the fact that this information pains me more than I can tell you. As Bishop of the Diocese, however unworthy, it would have been the natural course of things that my opinion should have been ascertained in such a matter as this...Ever since my appointment to this diocese I have felt the final responsibility of the Maori mission weigh upon me. I have laboured and toiled through many disappointments to obtain the services of capable and zealous missionaries to take up this great work...I know the Rev James Macdonald...He himself, however much attached to the Maoris, and whatever his good will in this regard, is wholly unsuited for the office to which you have recommended him: the consequences will be sad and distressing – nothing less than the complete ruin of all the prospects of the Evangelisation of the Maoris.<sup>189</sup>

The bishop went on to suggest that the Mill Hill mission would refuse to enter the diocese if James McDonald were made Vicar Apostolic. Fortunately for the bishop, the diocesan council endorsed his objections, Propaganda withdrew its support, and James' ambitions were not fulfilled. But a compromise was reached. In coming to the diocese, the Mill Hills agreed to confine themselves to Maori south of Auckland city, for as long as James McDonald was active. James would minister to Maori north of Auckland city. This remained his field of activity for the last four years of his life, after which there was a flurry of correspondence between Bishop Luck and Bishop Vaughan in which the latter attempted to firm up their agreements before he would send more missionaries to fill the gap McDonald had left.<sup>190</sup>

Apart from his intervention in the bishop's negotiations, there were other grounds for criticism of James McDonald in the latter stages of his career. Before the establishment of the Mill Hill mission, and when James was still only in his mid-50s, there were already signs of erratic behaviour which could be described as premature senility. In November 1880, Father Anselm Fox wrote to Father Adalbert Sullivan at St. Augustine's Abbey in England, giving his account of the widely-dispersed Catholic community around the Bay of Islands and the Hokianga, and how very difficult it was to service it. Speaking of the Maori people he said they were



...a most abandoned people considering Dr McDonald is supposed to have seen to them. I hear from different quarters that he (Dr McDonald) is becoming childish or foolish – you can form some idea yourself when I assure you that here at Russell the owner of a hotel saw him on a Sunday evening before all the people sit on the altar steps and catechise in the Maori language his two boys, who were the only Maoris in the church at the time. These boys play all kinds of little tricks while serving him – and when Dr McDonald was told of them his answer was “poor boys, they will have sense in time!!” I am concerned about the poor neglected Maoris and I am applying myself to learn the language hoping to do what I can for them. They told me, that the few hours I spent among them, they got more instruction than any priest gave them in their lives. And I was not over two hours with them, and speaking by interpreter. They said they would help to support me and take me from place to place while among them. They would like to know what kind of church bell could be got for 5 pounds. They wanted to ring it for Sunday school and prayers on Sunday. I refrain from mentioning the place where I stopped the day, lest Dr McDonald hear from his brother Walter and become angry with these poor people.<sup>191</sup>

It is of this period of his life that Ernest Simmons characterises James’ letters as becoming “childishly sentimental and naïve” and quotes examples of letters obviously designed to curry favour with the bishop.<sup>192</sup>

### **Maketenara – his legend**

To consider James McDonald only in these terms - as the man who obstructed Bishop Luck and became prematurely senile - is to miss the meaning of his life in the twenty years after 1870. This is one of those cases where a man’s significance may reside more in the legend he created than in any measurable achievement – though it may be that the confidence inspired among Maori by the legend was his chief and real achievement. For the fact remains that for many years it was he who single-handedly took on the Catholic evangelisation of Maori in the northern half of the North Island.

This formidable feat involved his building the first churches in Tuakau and Pukekohe, and years of living in primitive conditions in a *nikau*-thatched hut near Ramarama. It also involved huge amounts of often solitary and difficult horseback travel. An obituary described him as “of powerful physique and an excellent horseman” and explained that at one time his field of activity extended “from the borders of Taranaki and Hawke’s Bay to the North Cape, a district some 400 miles long.”<sup>193</sup> In terms that would now be regarded as patronising, James was praised as one who could identify with Maori culture and become part of it:

Whoever knows the Maoris is aware of the necessity of patience, kindness and forbearance in managing them. These excellent qualities were ever marked traits in Dr McDonald’s character, and by the exercise of these he succeeded in winning their confidence. It was necessary moreover, to live very much like them, to avoid intercourse with Europeans, to require no support from them, and, in one word, to become all in all with them. To this hard rule of daily life Dr McDonald rigidly adhered. Hence his signal success.<sup>194</sup>

Such praise was extended in a memorial written in Ireland, which went so far as to suggest that James in effect ceased to be a European:

...from the day he made his home among the Maoris he never wrote a line to anyone in Ireland. In the most literal sense he gave up all to follow Christ...It was always understood among his friends at home that James became a Maori chief; and that his influence was great in the councils of the nation. A priest who met him towards the close of his life, at one of his mission stations, told me that so Maori had he become as to have lost a good deal of his English. He had even acquired no small share of the mentality of the savage; seeing wonders everywhere, and endowing everything with life and consciousness; so that he told incredible stories with naïve sincerity. He became uncivilised as regards culture of earth; but his life was aglow with love of God and man, with self-sacrifice, tenderness, bravery, simplicity – culture of heaven. He had no house – practically; no property, but the horse or two that carried himself and his acolytes from place to place; no money; and no food but what he received from his wild but loving spiritual children.<sup>195</sup>

In the years following his death, there were many articles and memoirs which described him, with his ragged white beard and ability to rough it in *whare* and hut, bringing the Word to the Maori world. A 94-line effusion in blank-verse was penned as “a tribute of sincere respect and devotion” to James’ memory. Rhetorically addressing Maori, it spoke of how

Years of toil unstinted  
Spent the Rangatira,  
For your welfare only,  
Bringing joy and gladness  
To your scattered whares,  
By the creek and river,  
And in the darksome forest  
Under tent or nikau,  
Or canopy of heaven,  
Was his bed for years long.  
And he loved you dearly,  
More than life he loved you,  
Gave his life to save you,  
Gave you wise instruction.<sup>196</sup>

A Marist publication spoke of James McDonald’s “mighty single-handed effort in behalf of the Maoris and of his lonely death from exhaustion.”<sup>197</sup> Similar terms appeared in an article in the Auckland diocesan newspaper *Zealandia* in the 1960s and in an Auckland Regional Authority pamphlet for tourists, published in 2003, describing the settlement of Te Maketu and its history. Both drew heavily upon descriptions of James McDonald found in the earlier histories by John Golden (*Old Waikato Days*) and J J Wilson.<sup>198</sup>

### **Maketenara – his death**

James was a colourful and picturesque figure with many real admirers. One year before his death, *Tablet* reported him arriving in Kororareka, after months in the exclusively Maori parts of Northland, and preaching in both Maori and English.<sup>199</sup> In September 1889, Bishop Luck sent the Mill Hill Father Becker north to assist him; but because of their different travel schedules the two men never met before James died.<sup>200</sup> After his death, the *Herald* gave a full account of his pastoral journeys in the north in the last weeks of his life.<sup>201</sup>

His death was solitary. According to Bishop Luck’s terse account, on 6 July 1890 he “died at Purakau suddenly (it is thought of accidental asphyxia) & without sacraments.”<sup>202</sup> A much sadder story, which never found its way into print, circulated among Maori and was eventually told years later to Bishop Lenihan by Michael Egan, the parish priest of Coromandel. In his diary in December 1898 Bishop Lenihan recorded

Fr Egan’s story of Dr McDonald’s death as told by natives. Dr McDonald left Rawene for Opanake ten days before he died; the Dr told natives that he would have died of hunger, but for finding a rotten fish. On his way back [he] was refused food by Hauhaus<sup>203</sup> and caught in [a] swamp. His boy left him. Got back to Rawhene in the early morning. No food at home, gathered old clothes around him, went to bed, & was found with arms stretched out, dead in bed. After his death the natives lost all restraint and drink took off great numbers of them.<sup>204</sup>

Given that he was only 66 years old, James was not what later generations would think of as an “ancient of days”. Yet in nearly forty years in the diocese, he had become such a prominent figure that his death was mourned widely. The *Herald* reported that his body was “carried by natives from Dr McDonald’s residence at Hokianga to Kawakawa and then taken by rail to Opuā.”<sup>205</sup> From there, said the *Star*, it was carried to Auckland on the SS *Clansman*.<sup>206</sup> Bishop Luck preached at the requiem mass in the cathedral, forestalling Maori claims to the body by saying that Walter McDonald “earnestly wished” that his brother should be buried at Panmure, where Walter was then parish priest.<sup>207</sup> So he was.

Some criticism of James McDonald seems fully justified. He did make unnecessary difficulties when Bishop Luck was trying to introduce the Mill Hills, who themselves had a strong sense of inculturation and the need to present Christianity in Maori terms. But criticism of his “senility” appears to be overstated. As for what was said of his credulity towards a Maori world-view and his adoption of Maori customs and habits of thought, these now seem things that would make him admirable. In moving far from his Irish roots, he anticipated a church that realised Christianity was not synonymous with being European.

## Leaving and believing: A longitudinal study of the faith of church leavers

Alan Jamieson

---

*Alan Jamieson is senior pastor of Spreydon Baptist Church, New Zealand. His Ph.D. researched the faith of church leavers from a sociological perspective. From this research, Spirited Exchanges, a network of forums and resources for church leavers, was established (see [www.spiritedexchanges.org.nz](http://www.spiritedexchanges.org.nz) and [www.spiritedexchanges.org.uk](http://www.spiritedexchanges.org.uk)). Alan continues to research in the areas of faith development and spirituality and is a member of the International Society for Empirical Research in Theology.*

---

*In recent years there has been much European, and increasingly North American, research and interest in church leavers and the continued faith of previous church attenders. This study contributes to this area of enquiry by offering a qualitative longitudinal study where no similar research exists. Specifically this study indicates that leavers tend to hold a stable faith position and continued non-attendance in institutional forms of church. The research also indicates the powerful influence of post-church groups on the leaver's personal faith and practices. These findings raise serious concerns for church leaders.*

---

During recent years the exodus of people from regular church attendance in western societies has sparked a number of reports, conferences, studies and publications centred on why people leave regular church participation. This research contributes to this enquiry by offering a qualitative longitudinal study where no similar research exists. The research began as a doctoral thesis<sup>208</sup> (1995-1997) based on in-depth interviews with 162 people (54 church leaders and 108 church leavers and prospective leavers). This research has been subsequently developed longitudinally (2002) by returning to the interviewees five years later and asking them to complete a comprehensive open-ended questionnaire focused on their present faith understandings and practices. Comparison of the two sets of data indicates:

- The relative stability of people's faith positions.
- Leavers continued non-participation in established forms of church.
- The almost universal concerns about church leadership held by church leavers.
- The powerful influence of post-church groups on the leavers' journeys of faith.

### **Initial study: Interviewees' demographics and church backgrounds**

The initial study involved interviews with 162 individuals.<sup>209</sup> Ninety of these had left their respective churches for six months or more, eight had left church participation for six months or more and subsequently returned and 10 were on the verge of leaving at the time of the interview. Together these three groupings totalled 108 persons. A further 54 church leaders - pastors, theologians, counsellors and church consultants - were also interviewed to assess the depth of understanding they had of the reasons people left church participation. Data gained from the in-depth interviewing process was supplemented through participant observations of relevant churches and "post-church" groups of leavers.

A criterion of the research was that all interviewees had made adult<sup>210</sup> commitments to their Christian faith and to an evangelical Pentecostal or charismatic church (summarised in this discussion to EPC). The research found that of those interviewed, the majority left the church between the ages of 30 and 45, were married (79%), had children (80%) and were predominantly employed in full-time paid employment (88% of the men and 60% of the women). Sixty-eight percent of those interviewed held tertiary qualifications with 39% having completed a tertiary degree.<sup>211</sup>

Twenty-eight percent of the leavers interviewed had strong<sup>212</sup> church backgrounds as children. A further 40% came from nominal<sup>213</sup> church backgrounds and 30% had no church background in their childhood and teenage years. While a common understanding suggests that strong church beliefs and practice while growing up will influence subsequent adult behaviour,<sup>214</sup> there were no indications of any major differences between the faith outcomes of those who had strong church childhood backgrounds and those who were from nominal and non-church family backgrounds.

The average time of involvement within the church as adults was 15.8 years, with 23% of the leavers over 18 years of age being involved in their respective churches for 20 years or more.

Ninety-four percent of the leavers had been involved in significant leadership positions<sup>215</sup> within their churches. Many, indeed the majority, were involved in more than one such leadership role, again the majority for significant periods of time.

### **Categorisation of the faith positions of leavers**

The formulation of four post-church faith positions formed the principal findings of the research. A summary of these faith trajectories and the characteristics of each category are provided in Table 1.

**Table 1. Four categories of leavers.**

Characteristics of Faith	<b>DISPLACED FOLLOWERS</b>	<b>REFLEXIVE EXILES</b>	<b>TRANSITIONAL EXPLORERS</b>	<b>INTEGRATED WAY-FINDERS</b>
<b>Locus of dependency</b>	Dependent relationship	Counter-dependency	Inner dependency	Inter-dependency
<b>Basis of faith content</b>	Received faith	Deconstruction of faith	Reconstruction of faith	Integrated faith
<b>Critical stance to faith</b>	Un-examined faith	Ongoing reflexivity	Emerging self ownership	Autonomous faith
<b>Sense of Personal faith conviction</b>	Bold	Hesitant	Strengthening	Strong

### **Displaced Followers**

The first category of leavers - the “Displaced Followers” made up 17.5% of leavers interviewed (n=19). They were titled “Followers” because the faith they continue with has not substantially changed from the faith package they followed when they were regularly involved in an EPC church. The title “Displaced” represents the way circumstances have encouraged them to leave established church participation. The Displaced Followers left for two major reasons: either because they were “hurt” or “angry”. The “hurt” left predominantly because of their expectations of care or support from the church body in times of need which they later found were not met at a profound time of personal crisis. The “angry”, on the other hand, left predominantly through conflict with the leadership of their church.<sup>216</sup> Both the “hurt” and the “angry” can be said to have left because of specific grumbles with the church. These specific grumbles<sup>217</sup> centre around the leadership, direction and operating nature of the church.

The Displaced Followers' post-church faith can be characterised under four headings (listed in Table 1 above). The Displaced Followers continue in a **received** faith. That is, they have not disengaged from the faith they received when they made their decision to follow Christ and became committed to their respective established churches. They had retained the same faith package even though they were no longer participating in an established church. Typically this faith is based on an external authority beyond themselves. Their faith is nevertheless **dependent** on the wider evangelical resources including Christian seminars, trans-church based groups (for example Promise Keepers), Christian workshops, books, magazines, TV and radio programmes. They also remained dependent on the personal disciplines common to evangelicals. These included either continued practice of, or the sense of obligation to, quiet times,<sup>218</sup> financial giving (beyond friends and family) and service to others.

The post-church faith of the Displaced Followers reflected an **un-examined** faith. Their discontent centred on the church rather than the underlying taken-for-grantedness of the evangelical faith. Finally they exhibit a **bold** faith. That is, they had a very clear and definite sense of their own continued Christian faith and the correctness of their decision to leave the church.<sup>219</sup>

### **Reflexive Exiles**

The second category of leavers, the "Reflexive Exiles" (n=32), primarily left for different reasons than the Displaced Followers. While the Reflexive Exiles mentioned concerns about the leadership, direction, pastoral care and practice of their respective churches, these issues are not the fundamental reasons for their decision to leave. This grouping of leavers and those we will consider in the later categories on average move through a slower leaving process (18 months or more). This process of leaving begins gradually with feelings of unease, a sense of irrelevancy between church and what happens in the other important areas of their lives, and a reducing sense of fit or belonging to their church community and its "faith package." Their rationales for leaving were focused on "meta-grumbles"<sup>220</sup> rather than church "specific-grumbles." These leavers are titled "Reflexive" because of their reflexive questioning stance towards their faith, and "Exiles" because they are, albeit by personal choice, exiled from an established church community. However, unlike the Displaced Followers, it is not only the church community they are exiled from, but a way of understanding themselves, life and God which has been very important, even foundational, to them in the past.

The faith of the Reflexive Exiles can be characterised as **counter-dependent**. While the Displaced Followers remained dependent on the wider evangelical community the Reflexive Exiles are opposed to most of the EPC church and theological package. One of the interview questions asked the leavers what nurtures their faith now. The Reflexive Exiles' response to this question typically began with "It certainly isn't..." The things they described here were the EPC church and the wider evangelical resources drawn on by the Displaced Followers as well as their personal faith disciplines.

The Reflexive Exiles are engaged in a **deconstruction** of their previous faith. This involves a deliberate and conscious process of deconstructing the faith practices and beliefs they had received, accepted and acted within for so many years. This is a very destabilising process for them as their faith has been an important part of their world view, the foundation of important life decisions and an integral part of their sense of selfhood. Finally and not surprisingly, their faith is very **hesitant**. Many spoke of having put it all (their faith) down for a while. The process of deconstructing often led to confusion, disillusionment and with these feelings came a sense of hesitance about labelling themselves as people of "Christian faith."

### **Transitional Explorers**

The third group of leavers are the "Transitional Explorers" who displayed an **emerging sense of ownership** of their faith. This was evidenced in a growing confidence of faith, a clear decision to

move from a deconstruction of their previously received faith to an appropriation of some elements of the old faith, while giving energy to the re-building of a new self-owned faith. To varying degrees this faith incorporates elements of their previous EPC church-based faith, but these elements of faith have now been tested and found to be valid to the level of satisfaction<sup>221</sup> necessary for the individual involved.

The Transitional Explorers represented 18% of those interviewed (n=19). Alongside these Transitional Explorers were a small group transitioning to alternative faith positions. This grouping was made up of two people who had moved to a more “new age” based faith and five who had so many questions, doubts and issues with the Christian faith that they characterised themselves as agnostic in their present belief system.

### **Integrated Way-finders**

The “Integrated Way-finders”, the final category of leavers, differ from the Transitional Explorers because these people have to all intents and purposes completed their faith reconstruction work. While their “integrated faith” is also still open and being constantly redefined and adapted, their major faith examination is now completed. The term “Integrated” is descriptive of the way they are seeking to integrate their faith into all aspects of their lives. It can be said of these people, like no other grouping previously discussed, that there is a more fully orbed faith that seeks to integrate the physical, mental, emotional, sexual, relational and spiritual aspects of their selfhood in a way which is deeply connected to their faith. The term “Way-finder” signals that people in this faith position have found a way forward in their faith; they are way-finders. Integrated Way-finders made up 28% of those interviewed (n=30).

The reasons why these people left the church and the post-church faith they established need to be understood not only as the personal journeys of individuals but also as the story of groups of leavers in a rapidly changing society. One of the insights of the research was the fact that for the majority of leavers (65% of those interviewed) this was not a solo journey but one which involved them in groups of people in similar faith transitions. The research identified twenty eight “post-church groups.” These groups were made up predominantly of people who had left established forms of church met to discuss, question and re-formulate their faith. Some also included prayer and worship together in ways that the participants said had more immediacy and relevance to their lives than what they experienced in their respective EPC churches. Many of the leavers I interviewed, especially those I categorised as Transitional Explorers and Integrated Way-finders, were finding or forming post-church groups and experimenting with ways of being church. The research pointed to the “liminal”<sup>222</sup> nature of the post-church groups. Such groups are primarily focused on what lies in the future. In faith terms this means looking to develop, build and nurture an ongoing faith.

The four faith categories were provided as a scaffold for understanding and are linked theoretically with the stages of faith developed by Professor James Fowler. Consistent with Fowler’s stages of faith the faith positions described above were not seen as distinct and clear cut categories but as “still-shots” of a fluid dynamic reality. For the individuals moving out of an established church it is more like being adrift on the sea, tossed by the ocean waves, blown by the changing winds and pulled by the hidden currents. In reality each person moves this way and that, perhaps more aware of an overall turbulence than any clear directional path. It is often only in hindsight that they can discern the trajectory they have travelled and are able to make sense of their journey and faith in new ways.

### **Return study: Five years on**

Five years after initially interviewing the church leavers, questionnaires were posted to their last known addresses in order to assess to what degree the interviewees had moved in their faith understandings and practices, their involvement in church and their sense of the faith journey they were on. Thirty six addresses could not be located,<sup>223</sup> forty seven completed interview scripts were

received. These 47 scripts represent 66% of the interviewees where an address was located or 43.5% of the original 108 interviewees.<sup>224</sup>

Six returns came from people who had been on the verge of leaving the church at the first interview or had left for six months and then returned to church involvement. All six have continued in church participation. Below is a summary of the faith category movement across the five-year period.

### **The journeys of the Displaced Followers**

Thirty-one percent of the Displaced Followers returned a completed questionnaire (n=6). Four had no links with any established church and continued to reflect the faith characteristics typical of Displaced Followers. Two had returned to an EPC church similar to the one they had left.<sup>225</sup> These two were categorised as Returnees. Both of these faith trajectories were consistent with anticipated paths and indicate the stability of the Displaced Followers faith both within and outside established forms of church. The four Displaced Followers who were not part of an established church were supported through study groups and Christian books, TV and radio. One gave indications that she had begun to deconstruct her faith:

*Anne-Marie* [I'm] less certain as to the divinity of Jesus Christ, virgin birth and conception. . . more reserved in wanting to make others see things the way I do. . . [and] not so certain that I have answers to all life situations that in earlier life (18-25 years) seemed black and white.

Indications from this sample suggest that the Displaced Followers' faith represents a stable expression of Christian faith. Though they do not belong to an established church community nevertheless they have a committed and clear Christian faith which is nurtured and supported by their involvement in study groups and other faith groups which are not connected to specific churches. A majority of this group mentioned the support they receive from books, seminars and Christian television preachers. They remain highly skeptical of churches and their leaderships and are not looking to be involved in a church community.

### **Journeys of Reflexive Exiles.**

Eleven of the original group of thirty-two Reflexive Exiles returned the questionnaire (34%). Four remained in the same or a very similar faith position; three had moved to adopt an alternative faith position. Three had moved to an Integrated Way-finder's faith position and one had reconnected with an established EPC church and an evangelical faith position. This person was therefore categorised as a Returnee.

This degree of movement (64% of Reflexive Exiles) shows the crossroads of faith that Reflexive Exiles encounter. Here faith has entered a very confusing and disorienting phase; a phase where they are busily de-constructing the beliefs and understandings they had been given while they were part of an EPC established church. The end result of this process of deconstruction is an open one.

### **Journeys of Transitional Explorers**

Seven Transitional Explorers from the original group of 19 returned questionnaires (37%). This group showed a high degree of faith position fluidity. This is consistent with a transitional point in which a new vulnerable rebuilding of a personalised and autonomous Christian faith had begun. Two were characterised as holding a Transitional Explorer's faith stance. Two<sup>226</sup> had moved to a more questioning, less certain and less active faith position and were therefore categorised as Reflexive Exiles. One moved back into a Pentecostal church and their faith position is now best expressed as a Returnee. The remaining two Transitional Explorers moved to a faith position best described by the category Integrated Way-finder.



### Journeys of those transitioning to an alternative faith.

Five of the seven transitioning to an alternative faith completed questionnaires. This, the smallest of the faith categories, represented the highest percentage questionnaire return rate (71%). All five (100%) remained in an alternative faith position; none had moved in the direction of re-involvement in a Christian church or a Christian faith.

### Journeys of the Integrated Way-finders

Thirteen Integrated Way-finders returned questionnaires. Twelve of the thirteen were still reflecting the faith stance of Integrated Way-finders five years on while one was now best described as a Reflexive Exile.

Table 2 summarises the movement of the forty seven people involved in the follow-up questionnaire. The shaded squares indicate no substantial change over the five-year period. For the majority of respondents (68%) there was no substantial change. This is particularly the case for the Displaced Followers - those who had been part of the church when first interviewed (taken together 82% no change), those with an alternative faith (100% no change) and the Integrated Way-finders (92% no change).

The Reflexive Exiles (36% stable – 64% movement) and Transitional Explorers (25% stable – 75% movement) showed greater degrees of faith change over the five-year period. For both the Reflexive Exiles and the Transitional Explorers there was movement in a number of directions. Both groupings showed examples of people who had reconnected with evangelical Pentecostal and charismatic churches as well as those who had become Integrated Way-finders. Three Reflexive Exiles moved during the five years away from a Christian-based faith towards an Alternative Faith.

Faith Category original Study	Faith Category - Five Years On					
	Returnees To EPC <sup>227</sup> Church	Displaced Followers	Reflexive Exiles	Transitional Explorers	Transition to Alternative Faith	Integrated Way finders
Established Church Participation (6)	3					3 <sup>228</sup>
Displaced (8)	2	6				
Exiles (11)	1		4		3	3
Explorers (7)	1		2	2		2
Alternative Faith Explorers (5)					5	

Way-finders (13)			1			9
<b>Total (47)</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>17</b>

The results of the five-year on questionnaire, when compared to the original interview data, indicate that the majority of respondents showed a stability in their faith position. Most did not move faith category over the five year period. This was particularly the case for:

- The Displaced Followers and Returnees – 68% no change
- Transition to alternative faith explorers – 100% no change
- Integrated Way-finders – 92% no change.

The two faith categories where there was substantial movement were the Reflexive Exiles (36% no change – 64% movement) and Transitional Explorers (25% no change – 75% movement). Across all the faith categories 68% (n=32) remained in the same faith position five years on. The stability of these faith positions across the five-year period challenges prevailing views about the faith of church leavers. Looking at the faith stability of the Integrated Way-finders (92%) across the five-year period we find that most (77%) have no connection to any form of church. This raises questions for church leaders who see their own structures as essential to an ongoing maturing of Christian faith. These findings indicate that for many church leavers having made the decision to leave an EPC church, they are unlikely to rejoin one. Only four leavers had returned to regular participation in any form of established Christian church during the five year period.<sup>229</sup>

Fourteen of the seventeen Integrated Way-finders had no regular connection to an established form of church. Despite this many were actively involved in post-church groups. These faith groups were also not connected to any established church.

Taken together these results indicate:

- Having left very few people (over a five year period) return to regular involvement in any form of established church.
- Many supposedly on the verge of leaving an EPC church may in fact not leave.
- Few Integrated Way-finders having left church go on to re-connect with established forms of church. Those who do (3/17) had retained unbroken connections with an established church.

### **Attitudes to church and church leadership**

All the respondents (except the Returnees) held reservations, significant concerns or clear antipathy towards established churches. For most, church was simply irrelevant to their faith and life. Considering the deep and long-term commitment these people had previously made to their churches, this must raise serious concerns for church leaders. Significant concerns were raised across all faith categories with regard to leadership in faith and church groups. Universally the leavers looked primarily for “character” strengths including integrity, vulnerability, willingness to express weakness, etc. The Integrated Way-finders especially pointed to the need for theological and pastoral training, spiritual and psychological maturity, and the deep personal skills of empathy and listening.

### **Post-church faith groups**

Faith groups beyond the established church, be they discussion based groups or groups that take on elements of church worship, teaching and support, are powerful contexts for continued individual faith development. Of the nineteen people described as Transitional Explorers or Integrated Way-finders including those who remained stable in these positions across the five years and those who moved

into them fifteen (79%) were part of faith groups. Such a clear connection adds strength to Professor James Fowler's suggestion that being part of a faith group provides a faith force field that encourages and supports personal faith development.

## **Conclusion**

This longitudinal project both reinforces the findings of the initial study ("A Churchless Faith") and indicates that both the decision to leave active involvement in church life and the faith stance at the point of leaving are firm decisions across a five-year span. These findings indicate a stability of faith positions beyond church involvement and that the decision to leave becomes part of a new way of life. Looking to the future these now long term leavers do not show indications of a desire to return to church activities; on the contrary, they have strong and consistent concerns about established forms of church, ministers and church leaders.

## Chaplains in state government schools: blessing or curse?<sup>230</sup>

David Fuller

---

*David Fuller has been involved in the coordination, lecturing and tutoring of a Combined Theological Colleges, Educational Chaplaincy unit in Melbourne, Australia since 2002. He has worked as a chaplain at Box Forest College (now Glenroy College), a State government secondary college and led the implementation of the National Schools Chaplaincy Programme with ACCESS ministries as their Director of Chaplaincy Services (2007-2009). From 2002-2007 he was the Director of Youth and Children's Ministry at Ridley College and in 2009 he was appointed as the Coordinator of Educational Chaplaincy at Ridley Melbourne: Mission and Ministry College. In early 2009 he was appointed Chaplain to the Plenty campus of Ivanhoe Grammar School where he currently serves. David is an Anglican Priest in the Diocese of Melbourne.*

---

*The announcement of the National Schools Chaplaincy Programme (NSCP) by Prime Minister John Howard in October, 2006 was both warmly welcomed and roundly criticised at the time. Schools could apply for up to \$20K to fund either a new chaplain or enhance an existing program. Schools across the nation took up the offer with enthusiasm, so much so that a second round of funding was made available. Three years after the implementation of the NSCP and much ongoing criticism and concern, how might we assess the program's efficacy and impact? This paper seeks to respond to critics of the program and to argue that it has been overwhelmingly successful in the eyes of both school principals and their communities in the delivery of pastoral care as well as contributing positively to student wellbeing.*

---

### Introduction

When the NSCP was announced by John Howard in October, 2006 it was both warmly welcomed and roundly condemned.<sup>231</sup> The government and supporters saw it as an opportunity to support young people pastorally and to enhance the teaching of values.<sup>232</sup> Critics saw it as part of the Howard government's ongoing "culture wars" and a blurring of the relationship between Church and State. They believed that students needed trained counsellors to give support rather than untrained church workers.<sup>233</sup> Now that the NSCP has been operating for three years, and was extended by the Rudd Government until the end of 2011,<sup>234</sup> it is worth reflecting on the question, has the presence of chaplains in State Government schools been a blessing or curse?

It should be noted, that in the aftermath of the Federal election held on the 21 August 2010, both major parties have promised to fund the program into the future and even extend it.<sup>235</sup> On the other hand the Greens political party has in the past and continues to remain opposed to the program, preferring to fund qualified counsellors for needy students in our schools.<sup>236</sup> The pre-election announcements by the Labor Party and the Coalition to continue funding the program beyond the end of 2011 have now been met with a High Court challenge. A Queensland parent, Mr Ron Williams is organising the challenge with the assistance of a Sydney barrister, Mr Brett Walker SC, arguing that the NSCP contravenes Section 116 of the Australian Constitution.<sup>237</sup> The announcement by Prime Minister Gillard to continue funding and expand the program was met with further criticism from both professional bodies and private citizens.<sup>238</sup>

In this paper I propose to develop my thesis in the following manner. Firstly, I will chart a brief history of chaplaincy in the State of Victoria, my home state. The aim of this section is to give a historical context to the origins of state school chaplaincy and how over time it has proven to be an enduring and welcome part of many schools' welfare programs and educational offerings.

Secondly, I wish to address concerns that the NSCP and the presence of religious chaplains in state schools is a threat to the doctrine of the separation of church and state in our nation and that it contravenes Section 116 of the Australian Constitution. I will argue that the threat is over-stated and that the "State", through its school principals, schools' governing councils and the NSCP policy parameters, has full authority to either implement, suspend or discontinue chaplaincy programs in a school. I will also argue that the voluntary nature of the NSCP and the relevant guidelines protect students from any engagement with the chaplain unless requested and that the chaplain is not permitted to proselytize or push their religious convictions upon any student.

Thirdly, a major criticism of the NSCP has been that students need specialist counsellors and therefore the money spent on the program should have been used to employ such people rather than chaplains. While acknowledging that on some occasions, specialist counsellors are required by students, chaplains function in a different relationship to students and play a vital role in their pastoral care. As front line people, chaplains often identify serious or emerging issues and are in a position to refer them to suitably qualified professionals when required.

Fourthly, I wish to outline the very positive benefits of having a chaplaincy service in a state government school through the evidence that has emerged since the implementation of the NSCP. The program has proven to be well supported by school principals and it will be important to reflect upon their observations from the coalface of their schools.

My paper concludes by arguing for the ongoing presence of chaplains in our state government schools here in Victoria. The benefits to students in particular (blessing) have indeed transpired. The concerns raised by critics of chaplains in our State schools (curses) have rarely, if ever, eventuated. Chaplains practice their craft in an ethical, responsible and professional manner, working in situations under proper scrutiny, transparency and ultimately the authority of the school principal and their employing agencies.

### **A brief history of chaplaincy in Victorian state government schools**

Chaplains representing the Christian faith have been operating in Victorian State schools since 1955 under the auspices of the Council for Christian Education in Schools, an Ecumenical Church agency comprising an extensive number of Protestant and now Pentecostal denominations.<sup>239</sup> In Victoria, chaplains operate under the Education Act, 1957 and 1958, Section 23. This was a later amendment to the 1950 Education Act. These arrangements have undergone several reviews since their inception. The 1974 Russell Commission on Religious Education showed ongoing support for a religious presence in Victorian government schools.<sup>240</sup> Another extensive review was commissioned in 2005 by the Bracks' Labor Government. The outcome of this most recent review, The Education and Training Reform Act 2006, was proclaimed in 2007. The new Act again affirmed in legislation that the presence of Christian chaplains (and chaplains of other religious faiths) operating in the State's schools had ongoing legitimacy.<sup>241</sup>

In the above Acts of Parliament the legal basis for chaplains in Victorian government schools was and continues to be the teaching of Religious Education (RE). Over time though, the role of the chaplain has moved from teaching RE to a greater focus on pastoral care.<sup>242</sup> This growing emphasis on pastoral care has been the experience of chaplains working in government schools in other states of Australia. Shane Scott, Chaplain to Hollywood Senior High School, Perth, wrote as part of his philosophy of chaplaincy:

*I consider that the primary role of chaplaincy is to serve and to care for other people.*<sup>243</sup>

The research work of Judy Salecich and John Watts into the nature and value of chaplaincy services in Queensland state schools suggests a similar theme:

*There is no doubt that these Christian chaplains fulfilled an important and unique role in the provision of support and care in their schools.*<sup>244</sup>

How has this shift from chaplain as religious education teacher to a greater focus on pastoral care come about? Professor of Education, Brian Hill of Murdoch University in Western Australia suggests the following:

*Certainly it would appear that, since the 1960's, growing social fragmentation and family breakdown have led to increasing demands for government schools to engage in remedial moral education and pastoral care, tasks which were not in the past considered to relate to the primary mission of the school.*<sup>245</sup>

One can certainly see this pastoral emphasis in the ACCESS Ministries<sup>246</sup> school chaplains' generic position description. ACCESS Ministries is the main chaplaincy provider service for government schools in the State of Victoria. The key purpose statement for their chaplains is as follows:

ACCESS ministries Chaplaincy is a Christian ministry which exists to provide a Christian educational and pastoral presence and service in state schools. The chaplain is a Christian who lives out a personal relationship with God, modeling their ministry on Jesus Christ.

A school chaplain is appointed at the request of the school and with the support of local churches and community (usually expressed through a local Chaplaincy Committee) and/or the National Schools Chaplaincy Programme with ACCESS ministries as the employer. The key purpose is pastoral care.

The Key Performance Indicator/Measurement of pastoral care is as follows,

- I. The chaplain cares for the spiritual, physical and emotional needs of the whole school community by way of confidential pastoral care. (NOTE: in a Primary School setting, it is recommended that permission be obtained from the parent/guardian after the initial pastoral session with a child for ongoing pastoral support to continue).
- II. Chaplains are prepared to be involved in crisis intervention and trauma support.
- III. As appropriate they offer advice relating to student or staff welfare to the school administration (confidentiality issues must be respected).
- IV. Chaplains will liaise with various local government and state welfare agencies and if required to accompany students to these agencies.
- V. A chaplain has the role of advocate and mediator that reflects notions of reconciliation between members of the school community.
- VI. Through the chaplain's care, individuals are encouraged to reflect on their personal and social lives, including the deeper dimensions of God and spirituality. It is the goal of pastoral care to encourage, equip and empower people to journey towards healing, reconciliation and personal growth.<sup>247</sup>

When a chaplain is appointed by a school, after gaining endorsement by ACCESS ministries, a local position description is then developed. As the chaplain works under the supervision of the principal or their nominee, the school has a strong say in what type of work they wish the chaplain to be engaged in. The principal of Rosebud Secondary College, Greg Edwards, said of his chaplain:

*I think the real benefit of a chaplain is that, unlike teachers or other staff, Ziggy is independent and can operate as a link between the school, the community, parents, and most importantly, with the students.*<sup>248</sup>

A Year 10 student at the newly established John Monash Science School said of their chaplain:

*Chaplains give you that sense that there is somebody there and as much as there are teachers and anybody else you can talk to, it's like this other person that will always be there next to you.*<sup>249</sup>

Most chaplains work in the context of a multi-disciplinary well-being or student welfare team. At my former the school, Box Forest College, the chaplain is listed under Student Services on the front page of the school newsletter along with the Student Welfare Coordinator and the School Nurse.<sup>250</sup>

The Box Forest College principal made it clear to me that she wanted me to "pastorally care for students" and that this was to be my primary responsibility. At a principals' conference in Canberra in 2009, then Education Minister, Julia Gillard told the 150 government, catholic and independent school leaders:

*Schools are being asked to do a lot of things, and bear a lot of weight, because there are things that should be done in families, but aren't happening in families.*<sup>251</sup>

At the same gathering, the principal of Yalata Anunga School, Roxanne Ware expressed concern about the future of the NSCP. Ms Gillard said that the government was considering funding it in the budget and "acknowledged the popularity of the program among principals."<sup>252</sup>

It is probably fair to say that the presence of chaplains in government schools operated “under the public radar screen” until October 2006 when the then Prime Minister, John Howard announced the National Schools Chaplaincy Programme. The initial funding offer of \$90 million was later extended to \$165 million and was delivered across two funding rounds in 2007. The funding was taken up by both government and independent schools with 2,700 primary and secondary schools being successful in gaining the grant.

The first major piece of research into the efficacy of the NSCP would seem to strongly indicate that school principals highly value the aspect of pastoral care that the chaplain brings to their school communities.<sup>253</sup> This is not a surprise to those of us in the Victorian context. We now have over seventy schools in our State that have had chaplaincy services operating continuously from 10-50 years. For example, the two secondary schools in Warrnambool have had a chaplain each for just on 50 years. Frankston Secondary College, Geelong High School and Ballarat High School have had chaplains for 40 years. As the old adage goes, “the proof of the pudding is in the eating” and many schools clearly see value in the services these men and woman provide.

### **Church-State Concerns**

Some critics of the NSCP stated that the government ought not to be funding religious bodies at all and that this was a covert way of promoting religion among young people.<sup>254</sup> Other critics articulated the principle that government schools were founded on the threefold principle of “free, secular and compulsory” and ought to remain that way.<sup>255</sup> In recent times a High Court challenge is being mounted on the grounds that the NSCP contravenes section 116 of the Australian constitution as a violation of the principle of the separation of Church and State. The Australian constitution prevents any law being passed that provides “for establishing any religion, or for imposing any religious observance.”<sup>256</sup>

Bishop Tom Frame in his helpful book, **Church and State: Australia’s Imaginary Wall**<sup>257</sup> makes a very incisive comment concerning the Church and the State in Australia. He states that, “many presume some form of legal preference for Christianity or special status for the Anglican church because European settlers came from a nation with an established church and a formal commitment to Anglicanism. But there is nothing in Australian law which gives any privilege to the Anglican Church or precedence to any religion.”<sup>258</sup> Frame makes the obvious point that public, civic and cultural life in Australia has been shaped by a “long and close encounter with Christianity.” Due to this encounter, Governments have been supporting churches and their agencies through a variety of mechanisms, such as financial assistance, since the beginning of the colony. The valuable work of the churches in the fields of education and welfare is well-established and has had a long history of government funding. Although Christianity has been the major religious tradition in Australia, the reality is that all manner of groups and agencies, with a vast variety of religious and philosophical views, are able to seek government support for their programs.

The desire to gain funding for chaplaincy programs was initiated by a concerned Christian here in Victoria who was a member of his local church and an active member of the Liberal Party. He was a voluntary special religious education teacher in his child’s primary school and served on the chaplaincy committee of a nearby high school. This citizen used his influence, contacts, creativity and political acumen to put a case to government to have chaplaincy gain federal government support. He did this because he saw the value of chaplaincy but how difficult it was to raise funds to support it.

Was the NSCP a covert way to spread the Christian faith among our young people and hence use government money to “promote a religion?” As a person who trains chaplains and has served in both government and independent school settings I am well aware of the privileged position we occupy with respect to our faith perspective and young people who may not share those beliefs and its accompanying values. The chaplain at Brighton Secondary College, Peter Mangold put it in these terms:

*I am well aware that the implicit religiosity of chaplaincy does not give me permission to operate without sensitivity and respect for other ideological positions.*<sup>259</sup>

The chaplain at Boronia Heights and Bayswater North Primary School, Julie McDowell, said many students would be unaware of her Christian beliefs:

*I don’t think they (students) know, I’m somebody who cares. I’m a non-threatening, non-authoritative person. You can care for anyone, whether they’re Christian or non-Christian, and that’s how I’m viewed in the school.*<sup>260</sup>

The code of conduct that all NSCP chaplains must sign is very clear on the matter of actively proselytising your faith to a student in your care. Point nine of the code states:

*While recognizing that an individual chaplain will in good faith express views and articulate values consistent with his or her denomination or religious beliefs, a chaplain should not take advantage of his or her privileged position to proselytize for that denomination or belief.*<sup>261</sup>

While it is true that government schools are founded on the threefold principle of “free, secular and compulsory,” we need to be clear what this meant historically. The word “secular” meant “non-sectarian” with respect to religion through Governor Bourke’s Education Act of 1833. This did not mean schools were to have “no religion” but that it was not to be owned, run or controlled by any particular Christian denomination (Roman Catholic, Anglican, Methodist and Presbyterian at the time). Bourke set out to establish a liberal secular school system. In 1848 the Board of National Education was established but it wouldn’t be until 1880 that the Public Instruction Act was proclaimed creating free, compulsory and secular education for all.<sup>262</sup> Students at government schools come from religious and non-religious homes and deserve an opportunity to explore religious faith issues and spirituality in general with those trained and competent to facilitate and respect such conversations. The recent Victorian Education and Training Reform Act, 2006 reaffirms the right of children in government schools to receive Special Religious Education from those authorised by their religious denomination and educational bodies.<sup>263</sup>

Finally, it ought to be noted that the Howard Government was aware of the potential for controversy concerning Church-State matters and their need to be separate when announcing the NSCP. A prominent supporter of the proposal, Victorian liberal MP, Greg Hunt, parliamentary secretary for the environment and heritage said:

*The issue of the separation of church and state would be avoided because it would apply only to those schools that applied for the funding and would be voluntary for those students who wanted to consult a chaplain.*<sup>264</sup>

Prime-Minister, John Howard said:

*Similarly, a chaplaincy service will be available only to those schools that want it. It will be up to the school community to lodge a funding request for a chaplain.*<sup>265</sup>

In the above opinion piece Mr Howard made it clear that schools from other religious traditions could also apply for funding to ensure that the program was not seen to be discriminating in favor of the Christian religion alone.

Under the NSCP, school principals and schools’ governing councils ultimately decide whether chaplains are to be appointed to their respective schools. The school principal selects their chaplain in an interview process (usually a person who has been approved by a recognised chaplaincy provider service) and the role they will have in the school. Under the NSCP schools had to demonstrate they had strong parental support (reviewed annually) and that student engagement with the Chaplain was voluntary.<sup>266</sup> In primary schools a chaplain can only see a student on an ongoing basis if there is parental or guardian consent. No church leader can insist that a government school take on a chaplain and has no authority, legal or otherwise to do so.

### **Do young people need Chaplains or Specialist Counsellors?**

One of the earliest and ongoing criticisms of the NSCP is that it is at best discriminatory (against schools that don’t see a chaplain as the best resource for their school) or the “wrong response and for the wrong reasons”<sup>267</sup> to the problems facing our young people in schools. Mary Bluett, the Victorian President of the Education Union said the government should instead target funding to public schools, and make money available for all types of welfare workers, not just chaplains.<sup>268</sup> Dr Thielking of the Psychological Society said early intervention programs for children’s mental health were too scarce because of lack of money and government was wasting money on chaplaincy.<sup>269</sup> Melbourne University ethicist Dr Leslie Cannold described the NSCP as “an accident waiting to happen.”<sup>270</sup> The Australian Greens political party has also called for counselors in schools rather than chaplains, with Senator Brown calling the chaplaincy program:



*...a very old idea, very much short of meeting the needs of schools in 2010. It has a religious basis whereas we want to fund the program according to the needs of students.*<sup>271</sup>

In contrast to the above criticism, Gabrielle Leigh, President of the Victorian Principals' Association agreed that money was scarce but said that where chaplains existed, school communities had found it to be a positive and "another dimension" to the services in the school.<sup>272</sup> In response to some of the above criticism the newly elected Rudd Government gave schools the option of employing a "Secular Pastoral Care Worker" rather than a chaplain.<sup>273</sup> So do schools need specialist counsellors rather than generalists such as chaplains?

Firstly, nearly every "on the ground person" working in welfare related roles in a school, whether they be the student welfare officer, the vice-principal, nurse or chaplain are mostly "generalists" with specific training in their discipline. They are rarely trained as specialist counselors or therapists. Counsellors tend to visit schools on a periodic basis and are dependant on referrals coming from "generalist" type workers such as chaplains who are out mixing in the student body and relating to classroom teachers who also observe what is happening among students. Chaplains, like other generalist staff are trained to understand the limits of their own training and skill base. The chaplain at Balwyn High School, the Reverend Roy Hamer (an Anglican Priest), expresses this point well when he said:

*If I'm talking to a kid and I know that this conversation needs to go to the next level, we've unearthed some really deep stuff.....that's where I try to end it and say, 'let's talk to the psychologist.'*<sup>274</sup>

The orientation training of new chaplains at ACCESS ministries emphasises this principle of recognising the limitations of ones training and this same principle is taught in the academic unit I coordinate each year, "Chaplaincy in Educational Settings." This is a Combined Colleges, Graduate/Undergraduate semester unit that gives students the opportunity to explore this complex field of Christian ministry. The unit's content and requirements satisfy such bodies as the Melbourne College of Divinity and the Australian College of Theology and has been running first semester every year since 2001.

Secondly, chaplains like other welfare staff do not work alone. They are part of multi-disciplinary teams who operate under the authority of the school principal or his or her nominee. Complex matters are always brought to a team setting where collective wisdom and experience can be brought to bear. Chaplains bring their perspective, knowledge of community resources and networks to such meetings and their views are valued and appreciated.

Finally, in my experience the vast majority of young people need high quality sustained pastoral care through the presence of an available and caring adult rather than a specialist counsellor, while recognising that a specialist will be required at times. ACCESS ministries in their promotional literature quite rightly say, "we are there" because chaplains understand this principle keenly and the significance of their "ministry of presence" among students and staff alike.<sup>275</sup> This "being there" and the trust that develops with students is critical at multiple levels. In 2006 a Western Australian female teacher pleaded guilty to having an affair with a fourteen year old boy from a South-West school. The way the affair became public was that the boy's girlfriend told the school chaplain, who alerted the principal. The journalist reporting this case asked a pertinent question:

*Now, why did the girlfriend turn to the school chaplain, not her parents, student counselors, social workers, teachers or the principal?*<sup>276</sup>

Critics of chaplains like Ethicist Leslie Cannold and Senator Brown can't seem to understand that a chaplain can care for a student with out "fear or favour" and not have their religious convictions and views get in the way or to put their views and opinions onto a vulnerable student. The West Australian journalist P T Singham who reported on the sexual misconduct issue above wrote in the same article:

*Having attended chaplaincy fundraisers and spoken to chaplains and church leaders, I am convinced there is no overt or covert attempt to establish evangelical missions in State schools but a concerted effort to care for children.*<sup>277</sup>

In my ministry and training work, those of us who specialise in ministry to children and youth are very alert to issues of professional boundaries, the power imbalance in the adult child-relationship and the authority that comes with being seen as a member of the school staff. We are all very aware that we are not to use

our “power” or “personal charisma” to manipulate, coerce or push children into accepting our beliefs or views of the world.

### **The effectiveness of chaplaincy in state government schools**

The ministry of a chaplain is and continues to be seen as a very significant part of the Church’s mission.<sup>278</sup> Chaplaincy has a long history in the church exemplified by the story of a compassionate fourth century soldier, Martin, who would later become St Martin of Tours, a chaplain to the French King and eventually the Patron Saint of France.<sup>279</sup> This historical story contains an important point for critics of chaplaincy to understand. Those of us in the church see nothing unusual about conducting our ministry in a secular, non-parish or church setting such as a government school. Today you will find chaplains serving in the military, hospitals, sporting clubs and even shopping centres!

The reasons and motives as to why a government school might tolerate or even actively promote the presence of a Christian chaplain would vary enormously and might even perplex some critics of the NSCP. These critics will only concede that chaplains are an “extra pair of hands” in an overstretched system and hence appreciated by principals. I have met many principals who allow chaplains to function in their schools. Some were people of Christian conviction, most were quite secular in their outlook and appeared to be simply pragmatic concerning the presence of a chaplain. Whatever the motive, these men and women took a view that the chaplain was benefitting their school community in some real and tangible way. Peter Corkhill, Principal of the newly established John Monash Science School wrote:

*A chaplain adds a different dimension to a school. I’ve been involved in three schools with chaplaincy now, and each time it has been very clear they bring something extra.*<sup>280</sup>

Meredith Iaconese, Principal of Harrisfield Primary School wrote”

*Having a chaplain in a school is incredibly important. The children just love to have Candi out in the school yard with them. She’ll pick up if they’re a bit lonely or she will organize some activities at lunch for those children who struggle to make relationships with other children.*<sup>281</sup>

The government officials running the NSCP out of their Adelaide office often commented to me how well the program was being received by schools nationally. The annual feedback reports from the principals that I read have been very positive, some effusive, regarding how well the program was going in their schools.

In 2009, a national study into the effectiveness of the NSCP was undertaken for the National Schools Chaplaincy Association by Professor Margaret Sims and Dr Philip Hughes as a project of Edith Cowan University.<sup>282</sup> The national study took in 1,626 schools representing 85% of all government schools with chaplains, along with case studies of chaplaincy in 21 schools, selected from urban, rural, primary and secondary contexts. In total 688 principals (out of 1,626) and 1,031 chaplains (out of 1,396) completed the survey. When asked about the most important contribution chaplains had made, most principals wrote of how they provided pastoral care in a non-judgmental way. Secondly, they spoke of modelling and teaching moral values and thirdly in creating and nurturing ties with the community.<sup>283</sup>

Hughes concluded that, “ninety-eight per cent of principals, who responded to the survey, said that chaplaincy is important and want government funding to continue. Many principals want the funding to be expanded to ensure all schools can access the program and that large schools, schools in low socio-economic areas and other schools with high needs can have greater access to the services of a chaplain.”<sup>284</sup>

Outspoken NSW Greens MP John Kaye<sup>285</sup> and the Australian Secular Lobby rejected the findings of the study citing that there was no “control group” and that co-author Dr Philip Hughes was employed four days per week by the Christian Research Association (CRA). Kaye said the research “should be viewed as a piece of advocacy, not as independent scholarly research.”<sup>286</sup> Hughes later responded that a “control group” was impossible for this type of study and that his role with the CRA had “nothing to do with the accuracy of the research.....it was an academic attempt, signed off by the ethics department Edith Cowan University.”<sup>287</sup>

### **Conclusion**

I have outlined something of the history of chaplaincy in Victorian government schools suggesting that long before the advent of the NSCP, chaplaincy had flourished in over seventy schools with up to fifty years continuous engagement in two Warrnambool government schools. Chaplaincy in such settings enjoys support from government through legislation and a modest financial grant, school principals and their communities. Since the NSCP this pattern of chaplains establishing valued roles in schools has continued with precious few examples where a chaplaincy has not worked out in a particular setting.

I have addressed concerns linked to issues such as the separation of Church and State and in particular the potential contravention of section 116 of the Australian Constitution by the NSCP. I make the point that the Church and its agencies have received government support for a very long time particularly in its educational and social welfare work. School chaplaincy expresses both the welfare and educational expressions of the Church's work with children and teenagers. The "State" has long recognised the valuable work of groups like churches and will support their work under strict criteria and the normal political and review processes.

I have suggested that the "State" through its schools ultimately decides whether to implement, suspend or discontinue supporting chaplains in schools. This is not a call any church leader can make as they have no ultimate authority or power in the matter. Chaplains work under strong codes of conduct concerning the proselytization of their faith; their training and professional ethical values also work to prevent them from misusing their position with vulnerable children or young people. Importantly, the NSCP does not promote one particular religion at the expense of another as a school can appoint a chaplain from any recognised religious tradition in this country. Schools can also choose to appoint a secular pastoral care worker under NSCP. Finally, the "State" is not imposing the chaplaincy program on any government school as a school is under no obligation to apply for the funding.

Critics have attacked the NSCP saying that "at risk" students need trained counsellors, not untrained chaplains. The view that chaplains are "untrained" is patently wrong here in Victoria where ACCESS ministries chaplains have both degree level academic training and extensive backgrounds working with children and youth before they can be endorsed. While acknowledging that at times a student will require the assistance of a specialist counselor, the constant presence of a mature caring adult who is not a teacher or authority figure can have a significant positive impact on a student. Katherine, a student at Harrisfield Primary School said:

*With a chaplain, it's so easy to just go to someone and say it, instead of keeping it all in and hiding it. When we need help, we can ask our chaplain and she'll give us help, or if we're in trouble and we need some advice, we can come to her.*<sup>288</sup>

It has been asserted by a multitude of principals across the nation that the ministry of chaplains expressed in pastoral care is having a measurable impact in our school communities.

To use the language of the Church, I want to suggest that overwhelmingly the evidence, both historical and current, suggests that Christian chaplains in government schools have been a "great blessing" to the school communities that they belong to. This has been attested to by the school principals and students who have witnessed first hand the valuable ministry they exercise in the name of the one, "who took on flesh and came to live among us for a while."<sup>289</sup>

**Janice Howard Newham**

---

***Janice Howard Newham originally completed an arts degree in sociology and Spanish at Monash University. During the 1990s she stepped away from a career in university administration and studied theology with the Australian College of Theology (ACT). A current candidate for the Master of Theology by research, she works as an online "e-coach" with the Melbourne School of Theology (MST). She is an elected member of the Baptist Union of Victoria Council.***

---

***By the time of its jubilee celebration, Crossway Baptist Church had become a vibrant, contemporary megachurch of 3500 attenders on four locations in Melbourne, Australia. In the 1970s the church's organisational culture and identity was a people-oriented, "anyone can do it" "cultivation" culture in terms of Schneider's organisational culture model. Around 2000 the culture had become a task-oriented "competence" culture which valued strategic planning, formal structures and professionalism. "The life-saving centre" has moved on to be "the enterprise". Correspondingly, the church's mission strategy shifted. Local mission in the 1970s was inter-personal, diverse and messy, engaging with the local community in creative ways. Nowadays, to attract newcomers, Crossway relies on professional excellence, engagement with popular youth and music culture, a state-of-the-art auditorium, and critical mass.***

---

## **1. Introduction**

Crossway as a contemporary megachurch

Crossway Baptist Church (formerly Blackburn Baptist, or "BBC") began in 1954 in the orchards of eastern suburban Melbourne. This district was a population growth corridor with the characteristic profile of a "Bible belt".<sup>290</sup> Settlers were largely Anglo-Saxons, "white collar" middle class young families, politically and socially conservative. By 2004 Crossway had become a multi-ethnic, well-to-do contemporary "megachurch" of 3500 attenders on four Melbourne suburban locations. With a popular worship style enhanced by multimedia technology, the church attracts large numbers of enthusiastic younger people. Crossway has sustained a substantial commitment to property development and overseas mission, as well as supporting over sixty paid staff, full time and part time. In its jubilee year, the leadership redefined Crossway as a "movement", implying an expectation of continuing growth and a role of increasing external influence.<sup>291</sup>

Inspired by William Carey and others, Baptists have always been at the forefront of world mission. Churches such as Crossway take seriously the four core beliefs associated with evangelicalism – conversion, focus on the Bible, activism (in the form of evangelism and mission), and the centrality of the cross.<sup>292</sup> Crossway's policy and action in evangelism and mission have been shaped by shifts in its organisational culture – the church's self-perception of its identity, purpose and deeply held values. The influence of Crossway's culture and associated leadership style on local mission is illustrated in this paper. The role of other factors such as the "church growth" movement is noted.

"Mission" in this paper means any activity performed by word or deed, aiming to pass on God's love and grace to those outside the church and particularly to non-Christians.

## Crossway's history in five eras

Inspired by Becker's four models of local religious life,<sup>293</sup> I characterised Crossway's five eras as follows.

1. 1954-61 Early years under J E Newnham and George Ashworth:<sup>294</sup> "the extended family"
2. 1962-72 Established growing church under David Griffiths: "the corner store"
3. 1973-82 Growing regional church under Rowland Croucher:<sup>295</sup> "the life-saving centre"
4. 1983-95 Church in transition under Stuart Robinson: "the battlefield" (pre church relocation)
5. 1995-2007 Megachurch under Stuart Robinson: "the enterprise" (post relocation)

This paper concentrates on shifts in Crossway's culture and mission between the third and the fifth eras.<sup>296</sup>

## Crossway's history through the eyes of the participants

Studying Crossway's history as an "insider", I have taken a "critical realist" position. There is a partially knowable, undisputed reality about Crossway's history. At the same time the richness of the church's story depends on the perspectives of "observant participants" who have shaped the church and been shaped by it. To examine the diverse stories about Crossway, a "differentiation" perspective is assumed. This means that conflicting data in this study are not homogenised, yet predictable patterns which reflect the existence of subcultures are acknowledged. Interviews drew out the "official" leaders' views of the church's history, and also those of ordinary members who do not usually have a voice. Exploring this diversity sits comfortably with Baptist history. Baptists like to debate and question.

Forty-two former and current Crossway staff and members were interviewed. To provide anonymity, participants quoted in this paper are referred to by pseudonyms in parentheses.

## Method: Schneider's typology of organisational culture

In this research social theory is used. The term "culture" means the social heritage of a community.<sup>297</sup> Collectively held ideas, meanings and norms are pre-requisite for social integration and group continuity.

The concept of organisational culture is a further aid to understanding Crossway's self-identity. Schein explains organisational culture as existing in three levels.<sup>298</sup> At the surface are the visible artifacts: architecture, products, publications and administrative documents, events, organisational structure, language, rituals, myths and stories. Below these are espoused values, beliefs, symbols and rituals which consciously shape behaviour and are taught so that the culture endures. Below the values are basic assumptions which are taken for granted and are largely unconscious in the life of people in the organisation.<sup>299</sup>

Schneider's typology of "organisational culture" (Table 1), with its present-future and impersonal-personal variables, is a useful "lens" for reading Crossway culture and understanding the changes over the first fifty years.<sup>300</sup> Organisational culture is shaped by two domains, *content* and *process*. With content - what the organisation pays attention to - there is a focus on what is happening in the present time (actualities, the practical demands of the day) or on future possibilities (a visionary, perhaps idealistic, emphasis). With process - how the organisation makes judgments and decisions - the alternatives are a task focus (impersonal), or a personal focus which recognises subjective aspects and personal values.<sup>301</sup> These dimensions render four types of organisational culture which Schneider identifies as:

1. "control": actuality-impersonal<sup>302</sup>

2. "collaboration": actuality-personal
3. "competence": possibility-impersonal
4. "cultivation": possibility-personal

Data gathered from church archives and interviews has been viewed with the aid of Schneider's lens. The results are presented in this paper.

## 2. "The life-saving centre": Rowland Croucher and the "cultivation" culture

### Community engagement

BBC's conscious focus on community outreach under Rowland Croucher<sup>303</sup> gives rise to the "life-saving centre" metaphor. During the time of his pastorate, Blackburn Baptist exhibited characteristics of Schneider's "cultivation" culture. A large section of the church was inspired by Croucher's leadership, focused on people, and excited by the possibilities. The 1970s church culture was "holistic... having a vision, which is sort of the head stuff. Inspiration - spirit stuff. Exploring things together - heart stuff. And empowerment, the body, the communal stuff" (Stephen).

*(We were) so excited, we could see the church growing... It was absolutely not to be missed, and the fact that you could see people's lives being changed and see people come to the Lord, and see people walk in there that had never been in church before... and have a part of that and their discipleship, that was amazing for me. (Sandy)*

### "Unity in diversity"

Non-directive and comfortable with ambiguity, Rowland Croucher encouraged diverse interpretations of the church's purpose and identity. He appointed pastoral staff to reflect the growing diversity within the church community. Through Alan Marr, for example, the church was challenged by "a prophetic call to identify with the under-privileged."<sup>304</sup>

*Alan Marr came (in 1974)... and revolutionised our little staid church... he was a community-minded person, and he started all the youth pathways, the women's refuge, the halfway house for youth, and he got a program going in the church where he would get the homeless, and the marginalised, and put them in church families. (Sandy)*

For an evangelical Baptist church, with an emphasis on Christian conversion and "clean, moral living," this was indeed radical. Participants saw the social ministry as "different from your typical Baptist thing" of that time. Sermons on Christian responsibility towards the poor had their detractors, however. Such a message was a "bit theologically left" for a "right-dominated eldership" (Ces). Some older members were heard to say, "Jesus calls us to preach the gospel, not to set up charities."<sup>305</sup>

Rather than being seen as indicating disloyalty or disunity, however, these differences in theological opinion were actually celebrated. Croucher talks about the church folk of that era in terms of a social justice stream, a contemplative stream, university student groups, progressives, and fundamentalists. To this must be added the budding charismatics, who were being fed by the increasing availability of Pentecostal and renewal literature.<sup>306</sup> "The mantra was unity and diversity... Rowland was this brilliant bridge person" (Ces).<sup>307</sup>

### A "cultivation" culture responding to social turmoil

Croucher is remembered as an engaging and adventurous preacher who liked to challenge people to think about their faith (Ken, Florence, Ces and others).

***Just to say "I asked Jesus into my life, and he came and saved me" wasn't enough for Rowland... So, he would open up the evening service to all sorts of creative panels,***

***discussions, visiting preachers, anything to what broaden our understanding of how we can relate to the world around us.***<sup>308</sup>

The external context for such adventurous diversity was the euphoria surrounding Whitlam's election as Australian Prime Minister, and the decline of social stability and conservatism across the nation. Churches felt repercussions from the "sexual revolution", increasing family breakdown and experimentation with drugs. Down-and-outs struggling with drugs and alcohol – "weird people" – came into the church (Sandy).

Through the 1970s there was a "thriving discipling small group culture" at BBC, especially among the youth (Pip).<sup>309</sup> Expressed as a proportion of total church membership, participation in cell groups has never been as high. The cell groups led by Bill Hallam and Tim Costello brought in many young people including converts.<sup>310</sup> BBC youth were involved in a coffee shop.<sup>311</sup> In 1979 a Chinese pastor was appointed for ministries to people of south-east Asian origin in the community.<sup>312</sup> The "18 Plus" youth group ran bible studies and English tutoring at Eastbridge Refugee Hostel.

Freedom, respect and consensus

The church's structure was de-centralised, a "network of constellations", as Croucher saw it.<sup>313</sup> He was a facilitator-delegator, and this was an "anyone can do it" climate – the body of Christ at work (Sandy, Sam, Gerry). Adrian talks about the effect Croucher had on the church culture:

***A church reflects the strengths and weaknesses of its senior pastor. And if you reflected Rowland, (you would reflect) freedom and respect for people, and love for people... It wasn't so much what he said, but how he acted... Rowland didn't talk about a caring community, he just was the caring community. He made it happen.***

Several participants speak of the church's central message of love and compassion. A refreshing theology of grace opened a door especially to "those of us who've come from a judgmental upbringing" (Leslie). Church folk observed leaders treating each other with warmth and respect, forgiving each other, and pastors and their wives being open and vulnerable (Jesse, Marty).

A basic assumption at BBC seemed to be: "Baptist churches are fair and egalitarian, and everyone must have their say." Decision-making was by consensus. The influx of diverse groups, not used to Baptist traditions of governance, introduced some challenges (Ces). The beginnings of the charismatic renewal were potentially divisive, so to encourage mutual acceptance among church folk, Croucher produced a booklet on it (Jesse).<sup>314</sup>

Participants clearly saw Croucher's facilitative, personable style and non-prescriptive Bible teaching as the primary influence on church culture. Sometimes participants had difficulty trying to describe Croucher because he did shift styles with the circumstances. While he was known for healing rifts and building consensus, some would have liked him to give clearer direction in line with his vision.<sup>315</sup>

### **Church identity and mission**

As for the church's identity, in Croucher's time a strong sense developed that BBC was different, progressive and innovative (Sam).

*(BBC was) a forerunner of church in Australia I would say - we were something that nobody else was, as far as I know... the forerunner of everything where we forgot church and we started to embrace the world. I think. (Sandy)*

The legacy of Christian Endeavour's training of youth continued to influence local mission in the 1970s. Croucher encouraged the church in a thoughtful, reasoned faith which could be shared anywhere, anytime through hospitality and personal testimony. Pastor Robert Colman equipped BBC folk with "The Four Spiritual Laws" booklet and took them door-knocking. The business of witnessing for the gospel of Christ was thus brought within the gambit of the average believers, provided that they were not too terrified to try it! Their starting point was the core evangelical belief in the universality of sin and the need for repentance.

In the 1970s, BBC's approach "...just wasn't the case of saving souls... (but an) emphasis on training, equipping, um, meeting needs within the community" (Stephen). The pastors taught and modeled a radical Christian faith which cared for the down-and-out. The implications of this focus were that the church had to cope with the inconvenience of noise, smoking in the causeway, disrespect and other troublesome aspects of 1970s hippie culture (Sam).

At the end of Croucher's era, BBC had a staff of 25, and well over 1000 attending on a Sunday.<sup>316</sup> A very personal "cultivation" culture with a future "possibility" focus had formed. While Croucher would see relationships rather than buildings or numbers as the indicator of church vitality, as "the spokesperson for the "New Church" ...he was always envisioning something different from what was actually here."<sup>317</sup>

### 3. "The enterprise": Stuart Robinson and the "competence" culture

#### Intentional growth agenda

Stuart Robinson<sup>318</sup> had sensed a call to relocate BBC and prepare it for its role as a "leader" church:

*I believe that in 1982 the Lord showed me that B.B.C. would become a "great" church. From its position within the south east corner of Australia, its influence would radiate out as rays of light throughout Australia and continue on in a north western arc to particularly minister in the south east and southern Asian regions.*<sup>319</sup>

The relocation to East Burwood in 1995 is seen by participants as a watershed in the church's history. In his first twelve years Robinson had taken BBC through a time of conflict over what it meant to be the church. He intentionally challenged deeply held values. A grand agenda was reflected in the change in the church mission statement from "making disciples" to "Crossway... transforming the world."

#### Strong entrepreneurial, visionary leadership

Directional and persuasive,<sup>320</sup> Robinson was a deliberate, goal-oriented thinker. He had been leading a groundbreaking mission project in South Asia in a time of turmoil and danger. Robinson had many of the characteristics of whom Wagner later described as "new apostolic reformation" pastors – in particular, strong, visionary leadership.<sup>321</sup> The language used to encourage the Blackburn church was no longer "unity in diversity", but "with God nothing is impossible"<sup>322</sup> and "Faith is spelled R-I-S-K."<sup>323</sup>

The first Sunday in February each year became "Vision Sunday." In dramatic preaching style, Robinson would itemise calamities and injustices from around the world and move to the missional possibilities of a strong, faithful church. Early on, Robinson had devised a church vision statement, which ever since has been reinforced from the pulpit and in the church literature:

*A caring community of prayerful people empowered and ministering in Melbourne and beyond.*<sup>324</sup>

"Faith targets" were identified for each aspect of this vision statement.<sup>325</sup> To enable the church to reach this calling, a system of stewardship was set up to encourage sacrificial giving.

Robinson considered that a re-focus in BBC's ecclesiology and theological base was called for, to counter what he saw as "chaos and freewheeling disunity" in the previous era. He decided to build on the tighter discipleship training introduced by Rod Denton, youth pastor through the 1980s.<sup>326</sup> Crossway since became known for "very strong systematic exegetical Bible preaching" (Gerry). For the sake of efficiency, Robinson re-configured the role and skill mix of pastoral staff. They were now expected to be "ranchers" rather than "shepherds", emphasising leadership, coaching, training and equipping over one-on-one care.<sup>327</sup>



A tighter theological focus and centralised decision-making was made easier since the “progressives” on staff, Pastors Marr, Keyte and Bissett, had departed for various reasons.<sup>328</sup> Pentecostal teaching on prophecy validated the concept of a leader with a “top-down” style, “who gets God’s message and everyone else follows” (Redmond). Members such as Kelly admired Robinson for standing up and stating “this is what I believe God’s saying.” He has been commended for his hard-line, “politically incorrect” positions on controversial social issues. A strength of Crossway was “clear, sensible applicable teaching, so you could walk away knowing what (you) need to do” ...It was rigorous and “set standards pretty high for people... but probably wasn’t very holistic” (Chris).

The conciliatory, consensus-based model of Baptist decision-making was therefore replaced by governance by a board, which several members saw as distant and non-consultative. A participant suggested that a business model, focused on performance and efficiency, contrasted with a “covenant community” where “as a team we’ve been called of God to... work it through” (Alice).

### **Professional and client-focused**

Marketing and multimedia technology now play an overt role in the drawing of newcomers in the same way that businesses and service industries attract customers and clients.<sup>329</sup> Newcomers are met by a staffer with the title of “assimilation pastor” (Chris). Popular youth culture is reflected in worship to the extent that it is now “cool” for young people to be at church, and even to aspire to enter the ministry (Casey). In 2007 a local newspaper claimed that attenders of Crossway and other Pentecostal-Evangelical megachurches “expect high-energy preaching, contemporary music and song, and perhaps even a healing or two. Worshipers are voting with their feet.”<sup>330</sup>

Since the relocation, however, participants have noticed the disappearance of Pentecostal features in Sunday worship.<sup>331</sup> It may be that a more predictable, less emotional atmosphere is considered more comfortable for newcomers. “The old BBC was carefree spirit, vibrant, rambunctious...” (But the new one is a culture of) “order, cleanliness, um, money orientation, property focus.” Symbolic of this shift in values was a warning given to people on the every first Sunday, “to watch where they put their feet”. (Nicky) Robinson’s personal work ethic set high standards for the church’s professionalism. “We do do things really well, but I think there’s a culture at Crossway of, professionalism and excellence... very performance driven... I actually never felt that it’s OK to fail, at Crossway... there’s more of a focus on *leadership*, rather than *pastoring*...” (Taylor)

There is a Crossway “brand” and a style of doing things. Training of leaders starts early, at “Kids’ Church.” Crossway’s ecclesial model is replicated in its various congregations by transplanting “the Crossway DNA.”<sup>332</sup> A professional class of on-stage song leaders is selected, trained and commissioned to bring the congregation to an experience of God. The annual Crossway conference, run since 2003, showcases Crossway’s structure, ministry expertise and strategies which have led to growth.

### **Property development and “church growth”**

The tenet that “the growth of goldfish is limited by the size of their bowl” had become a rule of thumb for Crossway’s growth strategy. The writings of “church growth” proponents McGavran<sup>333</sup> and Wagner from Fuller Theological Seminary have inspired Crossway leadership. Robinson has also had contact with Rick Warren of Saddleback Church in California, and Bill Hybels of Willow Creek Community Church in Illinois, the prototypical “seeker-sensitive” megachurch.

Attendance at church-run programs, such as Alpha, and multimedia productions at Easter and Christmas have been emphasised over personal outreach and “witnessing” to the lost and down-and-out. Aiming to introduce the gospel in a non-threatening, “relational” way, Alpha has been run in the evenings on site, each semester. Commitment to this program is a recognition by Crossway that unlike former times, people seem to need to feel they “belong” before they can grow to believe.<sup>334</sup>

BBC had long shown interest in sponsoring fledgling churches and planting daughter churches such as the Knox and Stonnington churches. More recently, four Asian language congregations have been meeting at “Crossway Central.” Crossway has used a branch or “satellite” church model to plant Crossway congregations in Cranbourne, Moreland and Craigieburn.

Many church folk were bothered, however, by a perceived over-emphasis on quantitative goals. Church health seemed to be measured by “bigger is better” (Alex, Chris). Some young adults left after experiencing a sense of alienation: “...No one follows them up, no one catches up with them, no one talks to them. The program keeps moving, the train keeps moving and you’re off it...” (Alex)

### **Church identity and mission**

“Church growth” strategies at Crossway since the relocation have tended to result in “transfer growth” from smaller churches, an issue of concern to Crossway leaders (Ces, Pip).<sup>335</sup> In the six years from 2000, there was a considerable number – 262 – who joined Crossway through baptism. More than twice as many professing Christians, however, became members (623).

Leaders’ activities left little time for a life outside of church, for building relationships with non-Christians (Alex). Youth outreach workers were spending a lot of time organising events which ended up attracting large numbers of Christians (Chris). A staff member considered that Crossway was becoming more concerned with growing “a homogeneous community, of a certain demographic,” than being serious about the messy business of conversions (Pip).

Robinson’s empathy for Asian peoples is well known. Enthusiastic attenders of Asian background are attracted to Crossway and make up more than half of the English-language congregations.<sup>336</sup> As with other newcomers, most are not new converts. They are used to well-defined and managed church structure, directive leadership and non-participatory governance.<sup>337</sup>

From 2000, growth in attendance continued but then began to plateau.<sup>338</sup> Some participants suggested that the church was no longer genuinely engaging with society. They saw a gap in ministry in terms of social justice, welfare and pastoral care. The nature of the church seemed “program-driven,” focused on numbers rather than “living out the message in the community” (Alex). One participant thought the “heartbeat” of the church had been lost (Joan).

Increasingly, visible affluence at Crossway means that the dishevelled, drug-addicted and homeless are now less likely to wander in to a Sunday service (Terry). The aid and welfare work begun in the 1970s has floundered for various reasons. Human need is not ignored, and individual members show compassion in creative ways.<sup>339</sup> But financial contribution is now the means by which most Crossway attenders participate in both welfare and mission. “We are a generous church and we are blessed when we give” has become a deeply-held value at Crossway.<sup>340</sup> The monthly “fellowship offerings” in 2007 amounted to \$158,615 and the Christmas appeal raised \$170,000 for a Baptist World Aid Australia community development project in West Papua. Overseas mission is stronger than ever: Crossway’s annual (overseas) mission expenditure in 2007 was \$376,460.

## **4. Conclusion**

While conversionism continued to drive church doctrine, shifts in church culture and identity have shaped Crossway’s approach to local mission. Leadership style, the “church growth” movement, the social milieu, and the sheer size of Crossway are other related factors. By the end of the century Crossway had transitioned from a personal “cultivation” culture to a task-oriented “competence” culture. The “life-saving centre” of the 1970s was messy, diverse and egalitarian. By 2007, Crossway as “the enterprise” had become a flagship for other churches to emulate. Mission activity was professional, institutionalised and programmed, rather than outward, personal and spontaneous.

## **5. The Future**

Despite the increase in church attendance, some pastoral staff expressed frustration with their roles as managers of a structured, client-focused ministry. Evangelism and fostering relationships with non-Christian groups were apparently seen as time-consuming, difficult, and not guaranteed to grow the church. With Dale Stephenson’s appointment as senior pastor in 2008 Crossway has tried to tackle the gaps in personal care and engagement with the local community. Ironically, action began with further property development: the church foyer now includes a coffee shop, to encourage “doing life together.” Variations in Crossway’s church-planting blueprint are also being trialled, with apparent inspiration from the “incarnational” models of “emergent” churches.

It remains to be seen how pervasive a return to the interpersonal values of a “cultivation” culture will be. The strong “competence” culture is held in place by administrative structure and processes. A highly centralised megachurch relies on the attractational force of its state-of-the-art facilities and “critical mass.” But even an on-site coffee shop tends to pull in Christians before the unchurched. Espoused values about community engagement will battle to win over form, and the commitment to position Crossway as a flagship enterprise consumes a major portion of the church's resources.

## The Global Church and World Evangelization

### Missiological Reflections from Lausanne III,

Cape Town, South Africa, 16 to 24 October, 2010

David Turnbull

---

*David Turnbull is Senior Lecturer in Intercultural Studies, Tabor College, Adelaide, South Australia*

---

South Africa is known as the Rainbow Nation. Once divided racially, South Africa has seen transformation and reconciliation resulting in restored relationships. From this land the theme of reconciliation echoed throughout the world again. This time Lausanne III heralded that God has, is and will be reconciling the world to himself (2 Cor 5:19). The beauty of this biblical truth was on show in the Cape Town Convention Centre for nine days when 4,000 leaders from over 195 countries, especially from Asia, Africa and Latin America, came together to explore the implications for world evangelization. Sixty-two percent were from the majority world.<sup>1</sup> The multi-ethnic nature of God's global family in the 21<sup>st</sup> Century reflected a remarkable change since the first Lausanne congress in 1974.

There is much to rejoice about. The event should strengthen confidence in our God and his activity in the world. He is on the move, especially in significantly hard and unreached places. The breadth of the spread of the gospel is unparalleled, with people from the traditional sending and receiving nations all getting involved in going on mission. The reduction in the number of unengaged unreached people groups over the past thirty years is encouraging, especially considering the initial estimate in the early 1980's was 16,570 people groups requiring the establishment of a viable indigenous church.<sup>2</sup> At the congress 632 such groups, over 50,000 people, were submitted to the congress to prayerfully consider a response. As a result of this publicity delegates identified about 100 of these groups that could be targeted in the next three years.

Stories from majority-world contexts featured prominently throughout the week. The power of Bible storytelling in resistant and closed communities has helped to birth new mass movements. God has used and is using courageous individuals to go beyond personal safety. One example is the wife in a Muslim country who challenged her husband to give a Bible to a soldier standing outside a shop because she was convinced it was from God. The soldier then stated that he had had a dream to come to that shop on that day where someone would give him the word of eternal life. Numerous testimonies were shared of the power of God intervening in the lives of those from some of the globally significant faith systems and transforming them into carriers of the gospel in frontier regions. One came from a Muslim background and has seen significant numbers of Islamic leaders and scholars in his region find Christ.

The purpose of assembling was to listen to God through evaluating and reflecting on the recent past in order to discern the way forward. The program was intentional and demanding in doing this through interactive table discussions, inspiring global Christian speakers, dialogue sessions and praying together.<sup>3</sup> The delegates participated in a study of Ephesians in the morning, before exploring a particular core issue which had been identified by leaders in the twelve regions prior to the congress. The key daily themes were:

- 1) Making the case for the truth of Christ in a pluralistic, globalised world

---

<sup>1</sup> Email, Hwa Yung, to Daniel Willis, 8<sup>th</sup> March 2011.

<sup>2</sup> "Penetrating the Frontiers. How small churches can help.", Mission Frontiers, Vol. 5, No. 1-2 (accessed through <http://www.missionfrontiers.org/issue/article/penetrating-the-frontiers>, on 29<sup>th</sup> March 2011.)

<sup>3</sup> Most of the formal plenary presentations in the morning and evening, and some of the multiplexes are available on-line at <http://www.lausanne.org/cape-town-2010/schedule.html>

- 2) Building the peace of Christ in our divided and broken world
- 3) Bearing witness to the love of Christ with people of other faiths
- 4) Discovering the will of God for evangelization in our century
- 5) Calling the church back to humility, integrity and simplicity
- 6) Partnering in the body of Christ toward a new global equilibrium

From this gathering comes the Cape Town Commitment.<sup>4</sup>

Despite the progress there are challenges facing the global church as it participates in the mission of God. Many of these were addressed during the week. Some of these are ongoing and have been common themes within the Lausanne movement in the last four decades, such as engaging people of other faiths and bearing witness to people; the relationship between social action responses and word based evangelism within integral mission; the persecution of believers in the harder places (some of the Chinese delegation were not allowed to leave China, with many being stopped on the way to the airport); caring for diaspora communities; responding to social and economic inequality; and the need for partnership.

I would like to highlight several significant missiological challenges facing the global Christian community in the next decade arising from the deliberations and presentations. These are not comprehensive or exhaustive.

The first challenge is the response to the diversified family of God and multi-ethnic nature of the global Christian community. With the growth of Christianity in the majority world gaining momentum and the decline in the western world the challenge of diversity will only increase in areas such as worship, mission, discipleship and theology. The temptation for conformity and cultural similarity within the Christian faith remains but needs to be resisted. It was pleasing to see eight languages used during the week and the incorporation of different languages into worship. The worship band was multi-ethnic.

The area of local, regional and global partnerships was addressed and there were examples at the congress such as the presence of observers from the Vatican, Orthodox churches and the World Council of Churches and the participation of some excellent international networks which have formed, such as Vision 5:9, which focuses on church planting in the majority world, and the International Orality Network. It was pleasing to hear of the churches in Buenos Aires working together to target every tower block and region of the city. They are over halfway through the goal. This should not be a purely pragmatic and beneficial means of working together but based on believers who are submitting to the lordship of Christ. It is Christ who brings together his people as head of the church.

The issue of managing difference becomes significant in contrast to ethnocentric tendencies. An example is in regards to the nature of contextualization, particularly within a Muslim context. Some who came from a Muslim background shared why they disapproved of contextual practices at the higher end of John Travis' C1-C6 spectrum, yet others could accommodate contextual practices, such as an Islamic-culture church which has seen more than thirty new believers in the past seven years. Context must be recognized. Therefore differences can be overcome and worked through with a kingdom mentality and a cultural paradigm. Competition should not exist.

The second challenge is to address biblical poverty and increase the Scriptural focus in all phases of evangelism and discipleship. More can be done to increase the integration of Scripture into the

---

<sup>4</sup> In the process of being completed by a panel of missiologists and theologians, and currently available from <http://conversation.lausanne.org/en/conversations/detail/11544/0/1>

Church's life and mission, especially through the method of delivery and engagement. Also ways need to be found to help churches and Bible agencies to engage emerging generations with the Scriptures in appropriate ways. A positive change for the conference was the use of 700 table groups of six for the morning plenaries. This provoked much discussion and many stated that they use table groups for future conferences in their regions. Their beauty was allowing participants to meet people from around the world at the table. It was a practical way of listening to each other and learning more about the positives and challenges of ministry in different contexts.

It was highlighted that significant numbers still do not have access to Scripture in their mother language and are missing the Bible's life-transforming message in the process. Of the 6,900 languages, 2,250 have no words of Scripture available and this group is over 350 million people. Two billion people still need Old Testament Scriptures, particularly in the majority world. One of the encouraging developments has been the growth of the oral Bible story-telling as a breakthrough strategy into regions where there has been no access to Scripture or gospel resources.<sup>5</sup> Numerous stories were shared where believers followed from Bible storytelling by God's people. This demonstrates the role that the heart language plays in response to the gospel. Ron Green shared that people are four times more likely to respond to the gospel in their heart language than in a trade language.<sup>6</sup>

The third challenge is to reach the four billion oral learners, something which has implications for evangelism and discipleship. The strong focus on literacy and printed literature needs to be balanced. One of the valuable tools developed has been Megavoice, which distributes Bible stories in digital audio form.

The fourth challenge, as a result of the growth of cities in the past fifty years, is to increase the profile of urban mission. Christian outreach in cities has been unable to keep abreast with the movement from rural areas to urban areas and the expansion of cities. Tim Keller identified six dimensions to urban mission, recognizing that the gospel will reach urban areas only by churches that are contextualized for an urban environment and through citywide gospel movements.<sup>7</sup> These need to be patient with cultural diversity, show people how faith relates to work, be open to disorder and change, be concerned for justice and evangelism, have a strong commitment to the arts and be able to work co-operatively.

The fifth challenge is the preparation of missional leadership which recognizes the costly nature of ministry, is committed to the whole gospel of the cosmic Christ as outlined by Paul in Ephesians 1 to 3, is an authentic witness—demonstrating the good news as well as speaking it—and has a non-reductionist understanding of the truth in the Christian message.<sup>8</sup> Chris Wright emphasized this in his presentation as he called for a return to integrity, simplicity and humility.<sup>9</sup>

Several areas failed to be addressed, such as the role of dialogue in bearing witness to people from other faiths and its connection to evangelism. Being at the table and engaging on matters of religion

---

<sup>5</sup> <http://conversation.lausanne.org/en/conversations/detail/11514>

<sup>6</sup> <http://conversation.lausanne.org/en/conversations/detail/11514>

<sup>7</sup> <http://conversation.lausanne.org/en/conversations/detail/11512>

<sup>8</sup> Os Guinness stated that a high view of truth honours God, recognises the role of God in revelation, empowers the best human enterprises, undergirds the proclamation and defence of the faith, is sufficient to combat hypocrisy and helps transformation in Christ.  
<http://conversation.lausanne.org/en/conversations/detail/11392>

<sup>9</sup> <http://conversation.lausanne.org/en/conversations/detail/11556>

and the gospel were not sufficiently covered. The emphasis on the cross was very evident but the resurrection was less in focus. In overlooking the resurrection, one is overlooking the power that was made available to God's people through the Holy Spirit and its role in spiritual warfare.

Information may be available in printed form but the website, [www.lausanne.org](http://www.lausanne.org), has many of the Bible expository preaching plenaries, issues plenaries in the morning, afternoon multiplexes on particular issues and the evening plenaries.

The legacy of Lausanne III will take time to discern but the congress will provoke much reflection and anticipation of what God will do in the future. Much will depend on individual attendees responding to the big picture and finding their niche in their context. Through technology the broader Christian community can engage too. It is pleasing to see new energy in the Lausanne movement and its priorities.

## Reflections on the Nature of Mission in the Lausanne Congress in Cape Town 2010

Philip Hughes

---

*Philip Hughes is the senior research officer of the Christian Research Association and an honorary research fellow at the Centre for Social Justice Research at Edith Cowan University. He is also chair of the Lausanne Researchers International Network, a group of researchers concerned with church life and mission that continues to meet to serve the Lausanne movement.*

---

### The Congress

The 3<sup>rd</sup> Lausanne Congress was a grand occasion. More than four thousand delegates from all over the world, meeting to consider the mission of the church, was inspiring in itself. Throughout the week, in the Cape Town International Convention Centre, there was great colour and noise, as people from every part of the globe conversed about the Church's mission.

One of the great strengths of the conference was the fact that for most plenary sessions, people were seated at tables of about eight people: the same group throughout the week. People had been assigned to these tables in ways that ensured that conversations occurred across cultures. At my own table were people from Korea, Philippines, India, and Canada. Each of us had very different experiences of the church. We also had different roles in relation to the church. One person was a doctoral student, another a pastor of a tiny immigrant congregation, another a senior minister of a large church, and another, a lay worker. Yet, despite our diversity we found much in our values and concerns about the mission of the church that was common. Our differences, at times, contributed to lively but respectful discussion.

Each day of the Congress started with a Bible study on one part of the book of Ephesians. The Bible study was followed by a second major plenary session discussing some of the practical implications for mission of the Bible theme. In the afternoon, delegates could attend one of several "Multiplexes" which explored related themes at greater depth. In each Multiplex, a range of contributors spoke on a topic, providing the basis for discussion, or at least some questions and responses, among the delegates. Later in the afternoon, most days small groups gathered around just one speaker on a specific topic. The final evening session was again plenary examining some examples of "God at work in the world through his church".

Each day was a marathon. Many of the delegates were bussed into the congress for the day, starting at 8.30 am in the morning, returning to their hotels about 9.30 pm in the evening. Those who had a hotel within walking distance and who could find a place to rest for half-an-hour during the day had a great advantage!

### The Major Themes



Most of the major themes of the conference echoed themes that have been prominent in the Evangelical world over the decades. In brief, and as I understood the major thrust of the Congress, they were as follows.

**Truth** – the Christian faith is “truth” which must be reasserted in the face of pluralism in a globalised world. One of the speakers was the well-known, Os Guinness. I expected Guinness, and the other speakers, to take contemporary understandings of the complex nature of “truth” seriously. The “truth” that is found in scientific theories, for example, has quite different logical properties to the “truth” that is uncovered by empirical observation, or that is described in poetry, or expressed in music, or the moral truths of the Ten Commandments. The Christian faith is founded on a variety of types of truth. The nature of religious truth is complex and that complexity must be taken seriously in a pluralistic world. I was disappointed by the simple superficial reassertions that “we are right”.

There was recognition that different media could be used to express the truth of the faith. One of the multiplexes focussed on film, for example. However, the emphasis was not so much on how Christians could interact with film as a medium for engagement on “truth” in the contemporary world, but how Christians could make their own films to express their own truths. In fact, the session became partly an advertising session for some Christian film makers.

**Reconciliation** – Christian witness involves building the peace of Christ in our divided and broken world. One of the major examples in the plenary consideration of the broken world was the issue of slavery. In particular, it was argued that the caste system of India has, in effect, perpetuated the slavery of millions of Indians.

For me, one of the most poignant contributions to the Congress, was made by Antoine Rutayisire, dean of the Anglican Cathedral of Kigali, Rwanda. Rutayisire serves as a commissioner on the National Unity and Reconciliation Commission. He asked why the Rwandan genocide in which one million people were killed in one hundred days occurred in a country in which 91 per cent claimed to be Christian. He argued that there were four reasons.

1. There had been a lack of contextualisation of the faith. The inequalities between the various tribes and the injustices that resulted from those inequalities had never been tackled by the missionaries.

2. Rather, the missionaries had developed a spirituality which was highly personal. They had taught people to memorise Scripture, but not to incorporate it into their lives. Rutayisire suggested that when trouble came, most Rwandans fell back to their pre-Christian worldviews.

3. The message of faith was not matched by actions. While the missionaries preached love, they themselves caused divisions rather than seeking to have a unifying influence.

4. Church was not seen as part of the political landscape and was never challenged to engage with the political realities of the country.

Rutayisire brought home the need for mission to be contextualised in the political and social realities in which people live their lives. He suggested that only in social and political actions towards unity, the activity of reconciliation, can discipleship really be seen.

In the multiplexes in the afternoon, some other issues which are dividing our world were discussed: issues of Christian witness in the context of the environmental crisis the world faces and of poverty and wealth. In the evening, HIV/Aids and human trafficking were amongst the issues presented in the plenary session.

**World Faiths** – bearing witness to the love of Christ with people of other faiths. John Piper, an American evangelical author, preached a fiery sermon on the domination of the evil powers of this world and how Christians would need to suffer in order to bear witness to Christ. (His central focus was Ephesians 3:10.) There was a suggestion that the participants should build relationships with people of other faiths, but there was little mention in this context of any need for reconciliation or even collaborating on common issues.

**Evangelistic Priorities** – discerning the will of Christ for 21<sup>st</sup> century world evangelism was the theme for Friday. An emotional appeal was made to each person to be personally involved in engaging an “unreached people group.” Some highly dubious statistics were presented naming 632 “unreached people groups” around the world with populations of more than 50,000 people. It is noteworthy that the materials claimed that the one “unreached people group” of that size in Australia was the deaf Australians (99,927 of them) amongst whom, it was said, there was no engagement.

There was some discussion about the need to find new ways of communicating the truth of the Gospel of “oral learners.” One multiplex session discussed Bible engagement and how the Bible now exists in audio-tape format and on cell phone as well as in the large, leather-covered book.

There was a discussion of the need to take the Gospel to children and youth. It was surprising that, within that context, there was no mention of the Churches' involvement in schools and education around the world.

**Integrity** – the call of the Church to humility, integrity and simplicity. While many examples were given of how the church needed to demonstrate humility, integrity and simplicity, one focus was on the problems of the prosperity gospel. Several African speakers spoke about how the teaching that God rewards piety and loyalty with wealth was distorting church life and hurting many people. Again, however, there was no discussion of the injustice in the spread of wealth around the globe.

**Partnerships** – developing partnerships for the sake of world evangelism was the theme of the final day. There was a call to avoid duplication and competition which would result in wasted sources. Some speakers suggested that there was now a great need for Christians of Africa, Latin America and Asia to be involved in evangelism in Europe and North America.

## **The Notion of Mission**

What then was the overall notion of mission underlying the Congress? The dominant paradigm remained that of the notion that the Christian faith consisted of propositional truths and people around the world needed to be challenged to believe these truths. It was asserted that, in order to do this, it was important to have the Bible in different formats and in every language. It was necessary to use a variety of media. However, at the heart of mission was the notion that people were needed to take the challenge of the Christian faith to every cultural group in every nation.

I was disappointed by the general lack of cultural awareness in relation to this sense of mission. The early church produced four Gospels that have received the authorisation of the whole church. Each is written for its own circumstances. Each announces the faith in its own, culturally sensitive, way. In the Congress, the assumption was that there was one single truth that should be taken to every cultural group.

In order for the Gospel to be experienced as credible, it was important that the church engaged in its mission with humility, integrity and simplicity. Christians should work with each other, avoiding duplication and competition wherever possible, to achieve the task of bringing the Gospel to every nation. One of the major internal "threats" to this mission was the prosperity Gospel, another threat noted several times throughout the conference was the lack of recognition of the women's ministry. It was argued strongly that women should be equal partners with men in leadership and in preaching as well as in other aspects of mission. The heart of the credibility of Christian mission, however, was the purity with which the Gospel was held and expressed by the Church.

David Martin, the Anglican priest and prominent sociologist of religion, has argued that evangelicalism is one of the contemporary expressions of secularisation, although in a somewhat ambiguous way. He suggests that:

*The paradox of evangelicalism (in which Pentecostalism is included for present purposes) turns on the way it both embodies secularity and seeks a more thorough sanctification*<sup>341</sup>

He sees this played out as evangelicalism seeks a deeper appropriation of faith at the individual level, but erodes the idea of a Christian society by dismissing the uncommitted majority as not Christian. It emphasises the voluntary involvement of the individual in local church, and, in so doing, participates in the long-term trend of the individualisation of faith and making faith into something that is just the interior state of the person. It focusses on individual virtues and failures rather than on any attempt to Christianise society and caters for consumerist tendencies in a pluralist world<sup>342</sup>.

In many respects, the dominant themes of the Congress well reflected Martin's description of evangelicalism. Yet the dominant notion of mission as being about nothing more than the interior state of the individual was challenged throughout the Congress. From the first day, some of the speakers spoke of the "truth that is lived" and that is demonstrated in working for reconciliation and healing in a world that is divided, for example, where one group of people seeks to control others.

The Congress was reminded most poignantly in relation to Rwanda that the challenge of the Gospel is a challenge not only to believe certain truths but to live them in relationships with others. It is a challenge to seek justice and overcome inequality and to seek freedom for those enslaved by economic structures or ideological constraints. The challenge of the Gospel is to develop social and even political structures in which there is justice and reconciliation, as well as to develop personal relationships which demonstrate God's love.

It was disappointing that the major moral issues which confront humanity and which create inequality, namely, the issue of economic structures and the resultant global divide in poverty and wealth, and the issue of the environmental crisis and global warming, were largely sidelined. Indeed, I found it incredible that in such a large international gathering, the immediate and impending crises of economy and environment could be so easily ignored! There was also almost no reference to the South African context in which the Congress took place - the shadow of apartheid, the huge problems of inequality, unemployment, and poverty and the hope for building a better world for which Nelson Mandela remains the most pertinent symbol. There was discussion about these issues in some of the multiplexes and in a few of the small group sessions, but consideration of them was largely absent from the plenary sessions. To that extent, the challenges to "Christianise" society or the world, or even to consider what this might mean were peripheral to the dominant discussion.

Nevertheless, the concluding service of the Congress did pay its respects to the breadth of the nature of Christian mission. The preacher was Lindsay Brown, the International Director of the Lausanne Movement. He noted that evangelicals had been weak in applying biblical principles to public policy, the media, business and government. They had frequently failed to engage issues such as ethnicity and environment. He called on the Church to apply the Christian faith to government and university, to business as well as personal life. He quoted the words of Abraham Kuyper, the Dutch reformed theologian and prime minister:

*There is not one centimetre of human existence to which Christ, who is Lord of all, does not point and say "that is mine."*

The strength of the Congress was that it gave some place for the dialogue to occur between people who had different visions of Christian mission. It demonstrated that evangelicals have a variety of positions and emphases. In that dialogue, as people from all parts of the broad evangelical spectrum, from every nation and ethnicity, participated, something more of the breadth, length, height and depth of God's engagement with human beings was evident.

## Book Review

### **Blood and Fire: Godly love in a Pentecostal Emerging Church.**

By Margaret M Poloma and Ralph W. Hood, Jr.

*Published by:* New York University Press, New York, USA, 2008. ISBN -13: 978-0-8147-6748-1 and ISBN -10: 0-8147-6748-6

**Reviewed by Rev Wendy Snook**, Cranbourne Regional Uniting Church in Australia, Victoria, Australia. Wendy is a former National president of AAMS (2009-10), and a current member of the AAMS Executive Committee and Journal Editorial Board.

---

An inner-city Atlanta church, Blood and Fire (known as 'BnF'), was founded by David VanCronkhite in May 1991 as an independent offshoot of Vineyard Atlanta. Planted near the international headquarters of Coca-Cola, BnF began as an outreach to the homeless by four people. Within two years, BnF grew to be known as a post-modern visionary church of the poor heralding a revolution in which the marginalised would regain their pivotal place in Christianity. Coming out of the Pentecostal and emerging church movements, BnF began with a neo-monastic community in Atlanta that was to include people of all ages, races, and social strata, offering a vision for the Kingdom of God to be spread through generous orthodoxy, and a lifestyle of extravagant giving in service of the poor. Through its divine destiny, declared David VanCronkhite, its belief in the supernatural forces, its familial relationships and countless stories of divine "signs and wonders", BnF was to usher in the Kingdom of God, first in Atlanta, and then to the nations.

After obtaining permission from VanCronkhite for an in-depth study of BnF in 2003, sociologist Professor Margaret Poloma (Professor Emerita at the University of Akron), who calls herself a "pilgrim" and a participant-observer, enlisted the help of Professor Ralph Hood, a researcher in the psychology of religion, University of Tennessee, to study the presence of "godly love" in word and deed in the life and ministry of BnF. Together with some of their students, Poloma and Hood studied BnF for five years. Over that period, BnF Atlanta expanded to more than twelve other BnF locations in the USA and internationally. This book covers the results of the original project of its authors, and the unexpected story of a leadership battle in BnF Atlanta, church schism, the death of BnF1 and the birth of BnF2 in June 2004.

Through their ethnographic study of BnF, the authors wished to explore the relationships between charismatic encounters with God, sacrificial giving of personal dreams and ambitions, and empowerment for service for the poor and the broken. Personally knowing the love of God and experiencing its energising power is central to what is called "godly love". This term derives from the theoretical concepts of love in Pitirim Sorokin's work in the 1950s and represents an interface between the experience of divine love and human interaction. The authors modified Sorokin's work by embedding it within Randall Collins' theory of interaction rituals, which conceptualises human interaction as a series of rituals. Hood developed a longitudinal, quasi-experimental study based on what at the time was a one-year program at BnF for transforming homeless street drug addicts into committed Christians and teaching them the skills that would assure employment. However by the time of the schism, it became clear to the authors that it was impossible to carry out the original research design of a longitudinal tracking of addicts as they went through BnF's program, as the program collapsed.

In true post-modern style, the authors collected multiple interviews from active community members, church leaders, the Boards, the poor and homeless, the community, as well as later on, the dissidents and other church leaders at large. These accounts are presented as parallel narratives of events within the life of BnF, without claiming one narrative has more privilege or foundational value than any other narrative. Consequently, while the authors could separate their own personal narratives from others, and could present and evaluate specific claims made by BnF with empirical observations found in the data, they do not come to some final assessment or judgement on the BnF story.

Summarising the main issues, BnF struggled to identify the source of its authority, whether that of a vacillating, erratic, charismatic, prophetic leader under God alone, or under the Board of the church, it

clashed in its covenantal and contractual understandings, had poor communication within, and could not resolve the difficulties of the leadership style change needed to shift from a charismatic visionary-based ministry to an institutional, maintenance one, which has fiscal and social responsibilities to the poor and to the community donors and stakeholders over a long time period. Ministers and leaders tended to interpret events more often in spiritual language, rather than see the organisational issues as the challenge. Some saw BnF as a cult. VanCronkhite wrote a "death certificate" for BnF1: "1990-June 2, 2004; BnF died—after 14 years it died; the Lord said it was time to start another". The "birth certificate" for BnF2 read; "God is moving fresh and new; He didn't like what we were doing; we didn't like it either".

After VanCronkhite was returned by one vote to power in 2004, many people left BnF, programs for the poor and homeless were closed, the Board itself was dissolved, and property worth many millions of dollars was sold, with VanCronkhite himself as the recipient. The BnF vision, as it continued into BnF2, shifted from being a church of the mostly black African-American poor, to a church empowering middle class white youth to take Atlanta and then the nations for the Lord.

In Poloma and Hood's assessment, "godly love" was present within BnF family members and homeless beneficiaries, with a direct link found between charismatic and mystical experiences, empathic feelings and service for the poor. However, while some individuals experienced personal transformation through the BnF experience, they were mostly in the ministry team. The homeless and poor, generally voiceless recipients, appreciated the provision of services as a contractual arrangement, but generally were not transformed into committed Christians. The services to the poor were well provided, particularly in the period of the dissidents' management. However, the costs were not well managed. Many people expressed grief and sadness over events, but few expressed regret over the years they had spent in family and ministry.

For me, the BnF story was riveting, saddening and disturbing. It is a challenge for all emerging church and Pentecostal visions for personal and community transformation. I would recommend the book for church leaders who are interested in the emerging church and Pentecostal movements, students of the sociology and psychology of religion, and missiologists.

## Book Review

**Letters and Sketches from the New Hebrides** by Maggie Whitecross Paton

*Published by:* Hodder and Stoughton, London, UK, 1894 (2<sup>nd</sup> edition)

**Reviewed by Ross Mackinnon**, Editor of *Australian Journal of Mission Studies*.

John Paton (1824-1907), a Scottish Presbyterian minister, arrived as a missionary on the island of Tanna in the then New Hebrides in 1858 with his Scottish wife, Mary Ann Robson. After four turbulent years, he left Tanna as a widower. He returned to the New Hebrides in 1865 with Margaret Whitecross, his Scottish second wife, and settled on Aniwa, which became his base for the next fifteen years. Paton spent 1886 onwards mostly touring Australia, Britain and North America as a roving missionary-ambassador. In 1889, he published his story – **John G. Paton D.D. Missionary to the New Hebrides: An Autobiography**. This makes riveting reading, but is at times frustrating as he gives few details about his family. The reader is constantly asking: How did his wife cope? How many children did he have? What were their names? Where were the children educated? What happened when the children were ill?

Originally, Paton's autobiography contained fragments from the second Mrs Paton's letters. These were excised when Parts I and II were consolidated. Readers expressed regret, and **Letters and Sketches from the New Hebrides**, written by Mrs Paton (1841-1905), was published in 1894. This book comprises personal letters to family and friends, in chronological order. The audience for her letters was initially a private one. Mrs Paton fills many of the gaps in her husband's account, and provides a detailed account of the domestic side of missionary life. The letters cover the period from 1865 to 1889.

The reader gets a clear, honest, moving and often entertaining view of life as a missionary wife in the South Pacific in the second half of the nineteenth century. Life was hard, busy and unrelenting. It included learning a new language, coming to grips with a new culture, raising children in an alien culture, deaths of children, isolation and loneliness, slow communication, hurricanes, earthquakes, volcanic eruptions, tidal waves, tribal wars, serious illness, dangerous boat trips, housing refugees from neighbouring Tanna, martyrdom of colleagues on neighbouring islands, separation from children being educated in Australia, murders, running a large household, entertaining visiting sailors and missionaries – the list goes on. But not all is negative. The Patons relished the challenge of being missionaries and were always conscious of their privileged role as gospel-bearers. Mrs Paton is able to write about the things which made her happy as well as the tough times. She loved the natural environment of the islands, she enjoyed running a busy household, she enjoyed helping people in need, conducting Bible classes and teaching sewing, reading and writing. She certainly enjoyed the all too rare occasions when ships called in and when the annual Synod meetings meant she could relax and socialise with the wives of the other missionaries.

Mrs Paton writes about all of these things with a magnificent eye for detail and a wonderful sense of the absurd. Once, she asked her Bible class why Jesus didn't come down from the cross and save himself.

The staggering answer came back, 'Why Missi, because He was *nailed!*' (p335)

Her letters reveal a woman of deep faith who is prepared to let God guide when the way ahead is unclear. She is also a realist. She is scornful of mothers who have a romantic idea of missionary life and want to dedicate their sons to the mission fields, thinking that all they have to do is give them a Bible and put them on a boat and all will be well.

The book illustrates well the nineteenth century approach to mission – that is, Christianity and Civilization went hand in hand. Mrs Paton campaigned to have the Aniwans dress properly, especially for church services and on one occasion went on strike during a service by refusing to play the harmonium until a scantily clad young man left the building. Modern readers might cringe at the constant references to "our Darkies", "Niggers", "Natives" and "the Heathen", but that was how Western missionaries saw things then. The indigenous people were different and needed to be "Civilized"!

The book is well illustrated with photos and reproductions of some of Mrs Paton's paintings. The copy I am reviewing is an 1894 edition. The original book is now rare, but copies can still be obtained from antiquarian bookshops, in scanned versions as paperbacks and by download from Open Library ([http://openlibrary.org/books/OL7149503M/Letters\\_and\\_sketches\\_from\\_the\\_New\\_Hebrides](http://openlibrary.org/books/OL7149503M/Letters_and_sketches_from_the_New_Hebrides)).

The book would appeal to anyone interested in mission history, especially the role of the missionary's wife. It is a delight to read – Maggie Whitecross Paton's sense of occasion is difficult to fault. Although it was written to complement her husband's book, it stands alone and can be read in its own right.

Ross Mackinnon



## Women in Mission. From the New Testament to Today

by Susan Smith

Maryknoll: Orbis Book, 2007

---

**Reviewed by Moyra Dale** who is a visiting lecturer at Ridley Theological College, Melbourne, Victoria, and other institutions.

---

The title of this book sets out the scale of its project in time, offering an overview of women in mission since Christ till now. The immensity of the task is mitigated by restricting the focus to Catholic women: no Orthodox or Protestant efforts are featured, and this might have been helpfully specified in the title or introduction. Smith divides her book into three sections, looking at women in the Bible, women from the 2<sup>nd</sup> to 20<sup>th</sup> centuries, and developments since Vatican II.

Her discussion of women in the Bible moves from an analysis of New Testament epistles which show women as co-workers with Paul (1 Thessalonians, Galatians, 1<sup>st</sup> and 2<sup>nd</sup> Corinthians, Philippians and Romans) to those which she defines as post-Pauline, with more emphasis on women in domestic space (Ephesians, Colossians, 1<sup>st</sup> and 2<sup>nd</sup> Timothy, Titus, and Acts of Thecla). Acts, the canonical and apocryphal gospels are the context for discussing women as disciples and prophets in the early Christian community. Her use of Gnostic material is interesting: but the breadth of her scope offers little space for interacting with wider scholarship on the texts.

The title of her second section, "Women struggling to be missionary," suggests the content. I found this the most interesting section of the book. Moving from 2<sup>nd</sup> to 15<sup>th</sup> centuries, through 16<sup>th</sup> to 18<sup>th</sup> centuries, and finally 19<sup>th</sup> century through to Vatican II, it gives examples of women and women's orders through the centuries, with their struggles to be involved in ministry in the face of restrictive attitudes in society and particularly with (male) church authorities. In the early century women's choice of chastity (offering more self-determination than in marriage) was contested. Many of Smith's examples were well known names (for example, Felicity and Perpetua martyred 203 and Hilda of Whitby) but there were many others new to me. She introduces women abbesses, some of whom had an itinerant preaching ministry, along with the Beguines and women as tertiaries of established orders. For a number of the women she describes, having a male patron was important to their being able to establish orders. She identifies both Catholic and Protestant reformations as retaining a patriarchal character: however the unsettled times gave women an opportunity to develop new identities for themselves. It is an interesting and helpful survey of movements, orders and prominent women throughout that period.

In the period of the 19<sup>th</sup> century through to Vatican II, Smith identifies a number of trends in women's ministries and the orders they established. Most were involved in caring for the poor and in education, but there was little engagement with public policy. Women's involvement in foreign mission by definition was not priestly, so their ministry tended to be holistic rather than more narrowly sacramental. Some of the orders moved from being set up to serve male orders, to more direct involvement in mission and ministry themselves. Different mission focuses included orders set up to work in minority groups, those concerned with medicine, presence or social justice. It was at this time that lay mission orders developed, along with secular institutes, signaling a significant shift in understanding the call to mission as grounded in baptism, rather than in religious profession.

It would have been helpful to relate this section and the following in a wider context to trends in Protestant women missionaries' ministries and the issues they faced, but this was outside the scope of the book.

Her last section shows the optimism of the historian looking at recent past, headed "Women reclaiming their rightful role." Smith discusses the changes brought about by Vatican II, with an emphasis on laity, on recognizing the work of the Spirit in other Christian denominations, and the need for renewal and education in established orders. This renewal was through looking to the Bible, to the contemporary world, and seeking to reclaim the founding vision of orders. At the same time the growth in associates of established orders drew in much greater numbers of women than men. Liberation and feminist theologies and ecological issues have shaped Catholic women's mission understanding and practice, along with a growing understanding of holistic mission as integral rather than merely peripheral to the church's mission.

Smith concludes by suggesting that a Catholic feminist missiology is characterized by a focus on the place of the Spirit, by mutuality and inclusivity. This includes recognizing the work of "Spirit-Sophia" in the wider church (including laity), in other Christian traditions and other religions.

This book is easy to read, and fills in an important gap in our knowledge of mission history. Repeated themes that emerge in the ministry of women from earliest times include care for the sick, poor, education for girls and women, and community. It is a useful point of departure to explore similar issues and varying theologies of mission in other women's mission histories. Often the choice of chastity offers more independence than married life, and a lot of the book is concerned with struggles around issues of the place of women's orders and activities in the context of male authority. The persistence of women in the face of continual opposition is noteworthy. However Smith notes that while "Certainly religious life offered women freedom from patriarchal family life, educational opportunities, and a certain choice regarding lifestyle and work," it wasn't the primary motivation, but rather "Religious reasons – love of God, following Jesus, the wish to serve as missionaries – dominate in all their writings." (p119)

In Smith's beginning section on women in the New Testament, she discusses the need to read the New Testament as androcentric texts, where "silence in the texts about women's roles in the early church should not be interpreted as indicative of women's absence in the mission of the early church." (p48) Smith's book is itself a rereading of what has been an androcentric history of the mission of the church, to make women and women's service visible.

## Book Review

**Facing the Future: Bishops Imagine a Different Church** edited by Stephen Hale & Andrew Curnow

Published by: Acorn Press, Brunswick East, Australia, 2009

**Reviewed by Darren Cronshaw**, coordinator of leadership training with the Baptist Union of Victoria and pastor of Auburn Baptist Church, Victoria.

The Anglican Church in Australia is declining and aging, but there are signs of fresh hope and vitality. In **Facing the Future**, 22 Bishops across 24 chapters grapple with issues facing the Australian church and society. It is not meant to be a unified statement. Each bishop/writer picks up an area of their passion and all contributions are earthed in their local, regional and national context.

The result is a broad panorama of ministry challenges and opportunities. Some chapters describe church mergers, fresh expressions of church, leadership development and denominational structures refocusing on resourcing local church mission. There are contributions on theological education, Catholic Anglicism, liturgical practice and freedom, and parish and diocesan structures. Different bishops discuss the nature of rural ministry, multicultural ministry, military chaplaincy and schools as mission communities. There are some insightful narratives of ministry in an industrial city, dialogue from a place of conviction in a multi-faith context and encouraging the self-sustaining indigenous church.

I collect valuable questions so appreciated a few new ones to help with re-imagining congregational life. Stephen Hale in his chapter on **Renewing Parishes** suggested these questions to develop a simple mission action plan:

- What are you trying to be accountable for? (To formulate long-term purpose)
- What really matters to this church? (To articulate a 3-5 year vision)
- What missional activities will you engage in? (To plan 1-2 year strategies)
- What are your goals for the next year? (To state present goals) (p17).

Glenn Davies, as part of his appeal for **A New Compassion for the Marginalised**, says congregations can ask: "What's going well in our parish? What's not going well in our parish? What's missing?" But more radically, they can ask the same questions of their community: "What's going well in our community? What's not going well in our community? What's missing in this community?" (p230). These are excellent questions for churches prepared to face the future boldly.

My favourite chapter is John Harrower's modelling of **A new openness for change** (pp203-212). It seems the Tasmanian Diocese heard the challenge not to merely try to do what they have done in the past, but with more effort, but to look for a new way of "being church". In the 1990s decade of evangelism, church attendance in Tasmania declined 30%. But in 2000, Harrower started as bishop with a mandate to be a mission bishop. At his first Synod, he declared:

You elected me, trust me.

You elected a missionary, let us be missionaries together.

You elected an innovator, let us be innovators together.

You elected a change agent, let us change together.

You elected a missionary bishop, let us be a missionary diocese (p205).

He shared a vision of “Every Tasmanian committed to Christ”, declared the diocese “The Missionary Diocese of Tasmania” and encouraged every Anglican to be a “Missionary disciple” (p204). He promptly made a public apology to child sexual abuse victims, gave increased authority to rectors, prioritised recruiting new leaders, and farewelled some who did not come on board. Archdeacons became “mission support workers”, archdeaconries became “mission networks”, parish priorities became “Mission Action Plans” and bishop visits included “mission conversations”.

“Mission conversations” became a dominant metaphor and practice for diocesan life: leaders came together to discuss mission and how to join with what God was doing in their neighbourhood. The Bishop’s office resourced creative evangelists and invited schools and agencies to re-examine their mission. And the Bishop modelled honest evaluation by making public three external reviews of his work, to foster a culture of review in the diocese. When many things might divide a diocese, Harrower sought to focus everyone around missiology. This was an exciting chapter of denominational restructuring and resourcing for mission.

My second favourite chapter is Philip Freier’s *A new willingness to connect* (pp213-221). In his first year as Melbourne Archbishop in 2007, Freier was intent not to get absorbed in institutional work and committees. So he went on a “Prayer4Melbourne Quest”, seeking conversations in universities, shopping centres, workplaces, online blogging and in his Federation Square Breakfast Conversations/ public lectures. I am inspired by Freier’s engagement with people in public spaces, and his intent to include listening to not just strong and influential voices but also those uncertain and troubled. The process helped him hear and engage crucial public issues, especially loneliness, justice issues, support for people with disabilities and their aging parents, fear of strangers, homelessness, indigenous Australians becoming more marginalised, the state of childhood, climate change and global poverty.

Freier and Harrower, Hale and Curnow, together with the other Bishops involved in this project, deserve credit for their listening, risk-taking, experimentation, permission-giving and theological reflection. For a post-Christian society, these mission-shaped postures are arguably at the heart of denominational leadership (cf p72). Hopefully the rhetoric is reflected in healthy and mission-shaped reality.

**Facing the Future** deserves a wide reading. It is an excellent resource for Anglicans interested in the future of their church, or those studying Anglicanism. But it is also a valuable and inspirational resource for those of us from other traditions but the same cultural context as we grapple with similar issues of leadership and mission at local, denominational and national levels.

---

<sup>1</sup> BOSCH, David J, *Transforming Mission*, (Orbis: Maryknoll, 2002), 185.

<sup>2</sup> FABC website - retrieved via *Internet*, 22 February 2004, [www.fabc.org](http://www.fabc.org)

<sup>3</sup> These papers are available on the *Internet* - [www.ucanews.com/html/fabc-papers/fabc-0.htm](http://www.ucanews.com/html/fabc-papers/fabc-0.htm)

<sup>4</sup> FABC paper 92q.

- 
- <sup>5</sup> FABC papers 92b, 92k, 92n, 92r, 92l, 92f, 92c.
- <sup>6</sup> FABC papers 92l, 92k, 92n, 92o.
- <sup>7</sup> FABC paper 92r.
- <sup>8</sup> FABC papers 92n, 90.
- <sup>9</sup> FABC papers 92r, 92l, 90, 92n.
- <sup>10</sup> FABC papers 92t, 92l, 92r.
- <sup>11</sup> FABC papers 92h, 92i, 92t, 92j.
- <sup>12</sup> FABC papers 90, 92k, 92j, 92o.
- <sup>13</sup> FABC papers 90, 92i.
- <sup>14</sup> FABC papers 92k, 92l.
- <sup>15</sup> FABC paper 92i.
- <sup>16</sup> FABC papers 92j, 92r.
- <sup>17</sup> FABC paper 92c.
- <sup>18</sup> FABC paper 92b.
- <sup>19</sup> CCA Constitution
- <sup>20</sup> CCA Minutes 11<sup>th</sup> General Assembly, Appendices 2, 5, 6, 7, 10, 11.
- <sup>21</sup> CCA Minutes 11<sup>th</sup> General Assembly, Appendices, 3, 11.
- <sup>22</sup> CCA Minutes 11<sup>th</sup> General Assembly, Appendix 6.
- <sup>23</sup> CCA Minutes 11<sup>th</sup> General Assembly, Appendix 10.
- <sup>24</sup> CCA Minutes 11<sup>th</sup> General assembly, Appendices 11, 13.
- <sup>25</sup> CCA Minutes 11<sup>th</sup> General Assembly, Appendices 14, 6.
- <sup>26</sup> CCA Minutes 11<sup>th</sup> General Assembly, Appendix 2.
- <sup>27</sup> CCA Minutes 11<sup>th</sup> General Assembly, Appendices 14, 10.
- <sup>28</sup> CCA Minutes 11<sup>th</sup> General Assembly, Appendices 3, 4.
- <sup>29</sup> ARIARAJAH, S. Wesley, *Time for Fullness of Life for All*, **CTC Bulletin** XVII/1 (2000).
- <sup>30</sup> CCA Minutes 11<sup>th</sup> General Assembly, Appendix 13.
- <sup>31</sup> CCA Minutes 11<sup>th</sup> General Assembly, Appendices 5, 6, 7, 9.
- <sup>32</sup> CCA Minutes 11<sup>th</sup> General Assembly, Appendix 13.
- <sup>33</sup> CCA Minutes 11<sup>th</sup> General Assembly, Appendix 10.
- <sup>34</sup> CCA Minutes 11<sup>th</sup> General Assembly, Appendix 13.
- <sup>35</sup> CCA Minutes 11<sup>th</sup> General Assembly, Appendix 3.
- <sup>36</sup> CATS Constitution 1997.
- <sup>37</sup> Key addresses and a summary of CATS III proceedings are found in the CCA **CTC Bulletin** Volume XVIII, Number 1, April 2002.
- <sup>38</sup> ARIARAJAH, S Wesley, *Asian Christian Theological Task in the Midst of Other Religious Traditions*, **CTC Bulletin** XVIII/1 (2002).
- <sup>39</sup> CHUNG Hyun Kyung, *Popular Religion and Fullness of Life: An Asian Eco-Feminist Reflection*, **CTC Bulletin** XVIII/1 (2002).
- <sup>40</sup> MICHEL, Thomas, *Towards a Dialogue of Liberation with Muslims*, **CTC Bulletin** XVIII/1.
- <sup>41</sup> LILBURNE, Geoffrey, *Breaking New Ground: CATS III in Indonesia*, **CTC Bulletin** XVIII/1 (2002).
- <sup>42</sup> MICHEL, Thomas, *Towards a Dialogue of Liberation with Muslims*.
- <sup>43</sup> *Discipline Group Report of CATS III: Reflections and Recommendations*, **CTC Bulletin** XVIII/1 (2002).
- <sup>44</sup> ARIARAJAH, S Wesley, *Asian Christian Theological Task...*
- <sup>45</sup> *ibid.*
- <sup>46</sup> Third Congress of Asian Theologians, *Concluding Statement*.
- <sup>47</sup> CHUNG Hyun Kyung, *Popular Religion and Fullness of Life*.
- <sup>48</sup> LILBURNE, Geoffrey, *Breaking New Ground*.
- <sup>49</sup> JOSEPH, M J, *Reflections of a Participant*, **CTC Bulletin**, XVIII/1 (2002).
- <sup>50</sup> LILBURNE, Geoffrey, *Breaking New Ground*.
- <sup>51</sup> JOSEPH, M J, *Reflections of a Participant*.
- <sup>52</sup> ARIARAJAH, S Wesley, *Asian Christian Theological Task...*  
*Discipline Group Report of CATS III: Reflections and Recommendations*.
- <sup>53</sup> Third Congress of Asian Theologians, *Concluding Statement*.
- <sup>54</sup> *ibid.*
- <sup>55</sup> The term "Evangelical" is used to include churches known as "Evangelical", "Charismatic" and "Pentecostal".
- <sup>56</sup> HWA Yung, *Endued with Power: The Pentecostal-Charismatic Renewal and the Asian Church in the Twenty-First Century*, **Asian Journal of Pentecostal Studies** 6:1 (2003).

- 
- <sup>57</sup> WEA, *Introduction*. Retrieved via *Internet*, 31 May 2004, [www.worldevangelical.org/wefinfo.html](http://www.worldevangelical.org/wefinfo.html)
- <sup>58</sup> WEA, *Vision & Strategy*. Retrieved via *Internet*, 31 May 2004, [www.worldevangelical.org/vision.html](http://www.worldevangelical.org/vision.html)
- <sup>59</sup> *ibid.*
- <sup>60</sup> WEA, 11<sup>th</sup> General Assembly News Release - *Church Leaders Get Moving on 'Refugee Highway'*.
- <sup>61</sup> WEA, 11<sup>th</sup> General Assembly News Release - *Official Body of World's Evangelicals Endorses Campaign to Cancel Third World Debt*.
- <sup>62</sup> WEA, 11<sup>th</sup> General Assembly News Release - *World's Evangelicals Call on Churches to Denounce Abuse of Women*.
- <sup>63</sup> WEA, Press releases - *News Items Concerning the Persecuted Church*, July 2001.
- <sup>64</sup> WEA, Religious Liberty Commission 2001 Report, Appendix.
- <sup>65</sup> WEA, 2001 Global Congress on Church Ministry & Mission, *Statement*.
- <sup>66</sup> WEA Statement of Faith, Lausanne Covenant 1974, Manila Manifesto 1989, Iguassu Affirmation 2000.
- <sup>67</sup> ARAGON, Averell U, *Toward an Asian Evangelical Theology of Religion*, **Journal of Asian Mission** 2/1 (2000), 37.
- <sup>68</sup> WEA, Religious Liberty Commission: The Geneva Report 2001.
- <sup>69</sup> Lausanne Covenant, Manila Manifesto, Iguassu Affirmation.
- <sup>70</sup> KÄRKKÄINEN, Veli-Matti, *'Truth on Fire': Pentecostal Theology of Mission and the Challenges of a New Millennium*, **Asian Journal of Pentecostal Studies** 3/1 (2000), 36.
- <sup>71</sup> Iguassu Affirmation.
- <sup>72</sup> *ibid.*
- <sup>73</sup> Manila Manifesto, Iguassu Affirmation, Veli-Matti Kärkkäinen, *Truth on Fire*, 42-43.
- <sup>74</sup> Manila Manifesto.
- <sup>75</sup> *ibid.*
- <sup>76</sup> BOSCH, David J, **Transforming Mission**, 351-362.
- <sup>77</sup> *ibid*, chapter 12.
- <sup>78</sup> PIERSON, Paul E, *The New Context of Christian Mission: Challenges and Opportunities*, **Journal of Asian Mission** 4:2 (2002), 147.
- <sup>79</sup> BOSCH, David J, **Transforming Mission**, 432, 470, 472, 484.
- <sup>80</sup> *ibid*, 386, 401, 402.
- <sup>81</sup> *ibid*, 355, 363, 398.
- <sup>82</sup> *ibid*, 474-489.
- <sup>83</sup> *ibid*, 454.
- <sup>84</sup> *ibid*, 352.
- <sup>85</sup> NAGAI, Takashi, quoted in GLYNN, Paul, **A Song for Nagasaki**, (Hunters Hill, NSW: Marist Fathers Books, 1988), p134
- <sup>86</sup> METZ, Johann Baptist (translated by David Smith), **Toward a Practical Theology**, (London: Burns and Oates, 1980), p.108. Eg. Suffering encourages the remembrance of Christ's passion and resurrection and therefore initiates hope in an eschatological future promised by God. See also CHOP, Rebecca S, *The praxis of suffering*, Orbis Books, *Religion Online*, 1986. Accessed 26<sup>th</sup> Aug, 2008.
- <sup>87</sup> CHOP, Rebecca S, *The praxis of suffering*, in Orbis Books, *Religion Online*, 1986. Accessed 26<sup>th</sup> Aug, 2008.
- <sup>88</sup> CHOP, *The praxis of suffering*.
- <sup>89</sup> Mark 15:34; MOLTSMANN, Jürgen, **The Crucified God**, (Minneapolis: Fortress Press, 1993), p153
- <sup>90</sup> MOLTSMANN, *The Crucified God*, p152. Moltmann also recollects the story of Abraham, who was asked by God to sacrifice his son, Isaac.
- <sup>91</sup> METZ, **Toward a Practical Theology**, p105
- <sup>92</sup> METZ, **Toward a Practical Theology**, p107-8
- <sup>93</sup> METZ, **Toward a Practical Theology**, p108
- <sup>94</sup> FRANCIS, Carolyn Bowen and NAKAJIMA, John Masaaki, **Christians in Japan**, (New York: Friendship Press, 1991), pp 9-10
- <sup>95</sup> Interview with Renzo De Luca SJ, 12<sup>th</sup> July, 2008, Nagasaki, Gwyn McClelland.
- <sup>96</sup> *The senpuku also established their own rituals, such as the following... In front of the officials, the kakure had of course pretended to be practising Buddhists. They belonged to their own parish temples and had their names recorded as Buddhist believers in the religious registry. Like their ancestors, at certain times they were forced to trample on the fumie in the presence of authorities. On the days when they had trodden on the sacred image, they*

---

returned to their villages filled with remorse over their own cowardice and filthiness, and there they scourged themselves with ropes woven of fibres, which they called tempensha. The word originally meant "whip" and was derived from their misinterpretation of the Portuguese word for "scourge"...The kakure had flogged their bodies with such whips... Their prayers... are filled with faltering expressions of grief and phrases imploring forgiveness... "Santa Maria, Mother of God, be merciful to us sinners in the hour of death." ENDO, Shusaku, (translated by Van C Gessel), *Mothers in Stained Glass Elegies*, (London: New Directions Books, 1984).

<sup>97</sup> TURNBULL, Stephen, *The Kakure Kirishitan of Japan*, (Richmond, Surrey: Curzon Press, 1998), p41

<sup>98</sup> RAHNER, Karl, quoted in Moltmann, *The Crucified God*, p201

<sup>99</sup> VOLF, Miloslav, *Exclusion and Embrace*, (Nashville: Abingdon Press, 1996), p120

<sup>100</sup> Metz, *Toward a Practical Theology*, p111

<sup>101</sup> Extract from interview with Reiko Miyake, 11<sup>th</sup> August, 2008, Gwyn McClelland.

<sup>102</sup> Interview with Reiko Miyake

<sup>103</sup> Although, as it was summer holidays, many students died in their homes rather than at the school. The dead at the school were largely students doing the "kuni no shigoto national-jobs" or war effort, including some 80 junior high school female students. (Interview with Reiko Miyake)

<sup>104</sup> The Kannon Buddha was a feminine deity which the *senpuku* and later *kakure* used as a cover for their Christian beliefs. The *senpuku* made statues of Mary and baby Jesus, to look like Kannon Buddha deities for display at home.

<sup>105</sup> FUJITA, Neil S, *Japan's Encounter with Christianity: The Catholic Mission in Pre-Modern Japan*, (New York: Paulist Press, 1991), p239

<sup>106</sup> MOLTSMANN, *The Crucified God*, p207

<sup>107</sup> MOLTSMANN, *The Crucified God*, p212

<sup>108</sup> NAGAI, Takashi, *The Bells of Nagasaki*, (Nagasaki, Kodansha International, 1984), pp106-110

<sup>109</sup> GLYNN, Paul, *A Song for Nagasaki*, (Hunters Hill, NSW: Marist Fathers' Books, 1988), pp134, 117-118

<sup>110</sup> Interview with Renzo De Luca, SJ, 12<sup>th</sup> July, 2008, Gwyn McClelland (26 Martyrs' Monument)

<sup>111</sup> Toyotomi Hideyoshi led these initial invasions between 1592 and 1598. TURNBULL, Stephen, *Warriors of Medieval Japan*, (UK: Osprey Publishers, 2007).

<sup>112</sup> CHOP, *The praxis of suffering*, p8

<sup>113</sup> VOLF, *Exclusion and Embrace*, p253-4

<sup>114</sup> Estimated numbers of dead from the Christian community range between 8,000 to 10,000 out of the 70,000 or so killed upon the bombing, as recorded at Urakami Cathedral and the Peace Museum.

<sup>115</sup> *I am not arguing for a syncretistic faith. Some groups lose their own distinctiveness as a result of watering down their own beliefs to the point that Christ is not central. There is a need to hold on to distinctives and to be aware of what sets you apart in terms of a belief system.*

<sup>116</sup> VOLF, *Exclusion and Embrace*, p110

<sup>117</sup> VOLF, *Exclusion and Embrace*, p23

<sup>118</sup> MOLTSMANN, *The Crucified God*, p276

<sup>119</sup> MOLTSMANN, *The Crucified God*, p28. This he also knows as agape (not fileo) in terms of creative love for what is different, alien and ugly.

<sup>120</sup> GEHLEN, quoted in Moltmann, *The Crucified God*, p16

<sup>121</sup> MOLTSMANN, *The Crucified God*, p27

<sup>122</sup> MOLTSMANN, *The Crucified God*, p212

<sup>123</sup> CALLAWAY, H, *Nursery Tales, Traditions and Histories of the Zulus* (Springvale, Natal: J A Blair, 1868);

CALLAWAY, H, *The Religious System of the Anazulu* (Springvale, Natal, 1870);

JUNOD, H, *Life of a South African Tribe*, 2 volumes, (London: Macmillan, 1927);

FRIESEN, J S, *Missionary Responses to Tribal Religions at Edinburgh 1910* (New York, Peter Lang, 1996);

ETHERINGTON, N (ed), *Missions and Empire* (Oxford: OUP, 2005)

<sup>124</sup> *The History and the Records of the Conference, Edinburgh* (1910), volume 1, pp266-67

<sup>125</sup> *Ibid*

<sup>126</sup> *Ibid*, p269

<sup>127</sup> *Ibid*, pp270-71

<sup>128</sup> TYLOR, E B, *Researches in the Early History of Mankind* (Boston: Estes & Lauriat, 1865);

---

*On the limits of savage religion* in **Journal of the Anthropological Institute** Vol 26, 1892, pp283-99

<sup>129</sup> CODRINGTON, Robert H, **The Melanesians: Studies in their Anthropology and Folk-Lore** (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1891), p248

<sup>130</sup> Useful material on Codrington is found in BEAGLEHOLE, E's entry in **International Encyclopedia of Social Sciences** (New York: Macmillan, 1968) p534 and STOCKING, G W, **Encyclopedia of Religion** (New York: Macmillan, 1987), volume 1, p558

<sup>131</sup> This was reported on February 22<sup>nd</sup>, 2003, in an in-house memo of JCS International (a Christian aid and development group in Ulaanbaatar), translating a Mongolian article which appeared in the newspaper **Udreen Sonin** shortly prior to the memo

<sup>132</sup> BAABAR, B, **History of Mongolia**, D Suhjargalmaa, S Burenbayar, H Hulan and N Tuya, (trans) Cambridge: The White Horse Press, 1999), p257

<sup>133</sup> PINSKY, Robert, *Poetry and American Memory*, in **The Atlantic Monthly** Vol 284, 1999, p60

<sup>134</sup> Article 4.2 states: "Arising from respect for the unity of the Mongolian people, their historical cultural traditions and their civilization, the state will respect the predominant position of the Buddhist religion in Mongolia. This does not prevent citizens confessing another religion". Article 7.5 includes: "... it is forbidden to introduce activities which are... alien to the tradition and customs of the Mongolian people..." See COLLINS, D N, **Mongolian Law on Church State Relations: A Translation from the Russian Text**, Ulaanbaatar, 1993

<sup>135</sup> WEATHERWORLD, Jack, **The Secret History of the Mongol Queens: How the daughters of Genghis Khan rescued his empire**, (New York: Crown Publishers, 2010)

<sup>136</sup> See for example GUMILEV, L N, **Searches for an Imaginary Kingdom: The Legend of the Kingdom of Prester John**, R E F Smith (trans) (London: Cambridge University Press, 1970); HOWARTH, H H *Northern Frontagers of China. Part VIII. Article IV: The Kirais and Prester John*, in **The Journal of the Royal Asiatic Society**, 1889; LATOURETTE, Kenneth Scott, **A History of Christian Missions in China**, (New York: Macmillan, 1929)

<sup>137</sup> For a discussion of the *yasa* see AYALON, David, *The Great Yasa of Chingiz Khan. A Re-examination (Part A)*, in **Studia Islamica**, Vol 33, pp97-140 and *The Great Yasa of Chingiz Khan. A Re-examination (Part B)*, in **Studia Islamica**, Vol 34, pp151-180; JUVAINI, 'Ala-ad-Din 'Ata-Malik, **The History of the World Conqueror**, J. A. Boyle (trans), (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 1958); MORGAN, David, *The Great Yasa of Chingiz Khan*, in **Bulletin of the School of Oriental and African Studies**, Vol 49, 1986, pp163-176; BAABAR, B, (1999). **History of Mongolia**, D. Suhjargalmaa, S. Burenbayar, H. Hulan & N. Tuya, (trans), (Cambridge: The White Horse Press, 1999), p31; and KEMP, Hugh, **Khans, Keraites, Courtiers, and Queens: An Introduction to Christianity Amongst the Mongols, with Special Enquiry into the Mongol Imperial Era**, Master of Theology Thesis. (Sydney: The Australian College of Theology, 1988), p61

<sup>138</sup> MORGAN, David, *Prelude: The Problems of Writing Mongolian History*, in AKINER, S [ed], **Mongolia Today**, (London and New York: Kegan Paul, 1991)

<sup>139</sup> There is some debate as to the dating of **The Secret History**. See ATWOOD, Christopher, *Informants and Sources for the Secret History of the Mongols*, in **Mongolian Studies**, Vol XXIX, 2007, pp27-29; de RACHEWILTZ, Igor, (2008), *The Dating of the Secret History of the Mongols - A Re-interpretation*, in **International Journal of Uralic and Altaic Studies**, Vol 22, 2008, pp150-184

<sup>140</sup> MOFFETT, Samuel Hugh, **A History of Christianity in Asia. Volume I: Beginnings to 1500**, (New York: HarperSanFrancisco, 1992)

<sup>141</sup> SCHERER, James A, *Global Mission in the Twentieth Century*, in **Zeitschrift für Mission**, Vol 26, 2000, pp114-125

<sup>142</sup> BEBBINGTON, David, **Patterns in History: A Christian Perspective on Historical Thought**, (Leicester: Apollos, 1979), p183



---

<sup>143</sup> COVELL, Ralph, R, *God's Providence or Fatalism in China?*, in **Missiology, An International Review** Vol 5, 1977, p321

<sup>144</sup> SMITH, Melville, T., *Faithful History/Secular Faith*, in **Dialogue** Vol 16, 1983, p65

<sup>145</sup> For an Asian scholar's definition see MAHBUBANI, Kishore, **Can Asians Think?** (Singapore: Times Books International, 2000), p19

<sup>146</sup> The elevation of Genghis Khan to national folk hero has been a readily observed phenomenon in Mongolia since 1990. The "opening of the files" of alleged dissidents during the 1930s and 1940s shows a willingness to reassess the past. See KAYE, Lincoln, *Genocide on Display*, in **Far Eastern Economic Review**, Vol 43, 1998, p43. A statement by the Mongolian Prime Minister's foreign affairs advisor S Badral in 1998 regarding the right of the Bible to be circulated in Mongolia, demonstrated a radical shift in official interpretation of the role of Christianity in Mongolia by the Government. See *Government plays down row over Christian videos*, in **The UB Post**, January 13, 1998, p1

<sup>147</sup> ROXBOROUGH, John, *Writing minority history: perspectives on the historiography of Christianity in Malaysia*, Retrieved September 21, 2009, from <http://www.roxborough.com/>

<sup>148</sup> BEBBINGTON, **Patterns in History**, p185

<sup>149</sup> PHILLIPS, James, M, *Project for Writing a Brief History of Christianity in Asia*, in **Northeast Asia Journal of Theology** Vol 16, 1976, p63

<sup>150</sup> PHILLIPS, **Project**, p66

<sup>151</sup> ROXBOROUGH, *Writing minority history*, Retrieved September 21, 2009, from <http://www.roxborough.com/>

<sup>152</sup> PHILLIPS, **Project**, p66

<sup>153</sup> MOFFETT, **A History of Christianity in Asia**, pp244, 250

<sup>154</sup> MAHBUBANI, **Can Asians Think?** p9

<sup>155</sup> LEATHERWOOD, Rick, **Glory in Mongolia**, (Pasadena, CA: William Carey Library, 2006); *Mongolian Press Review*, in **Mongol Messenger**, Vol 16, 1994, p4

<sup>156</sup> HOGAN, Brian, **There's a Sheep in my Bathtub: Birth of a Mongolian Church Planting Movement**, (Bayside, CA: Asteroidea Books, 2008)

<sup>157</sup> NOLL, Mark A, **Turning Points: Decisive Moments in the History of Christianity** (2nd ed), (Grand Rapids, MI: Baker Academic, 2000)

<sup>158</sup> Peter Berger in NEWBIGIN, Lesslie, **The Gospel in a Pluralistic Society**, (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1989), p8

<sup>159</sup> KATONGOLE, Emmanuel, and RICE, Chris, **Reconciling All Things: A Christian Vision for Justice, Peace and Healing**, (Downers Grove: InterVarsity Press, 2008), p96

<sup>160</sup> Biographical details in this paragraph derive from People Files (James McDonald and Walter McDonald), Deceased Priests Files, Auckland Catholic Diocesan Archives [hereafter ACDA], Diocesan Clergy notes in LUC 36 ACDA and E R Simmons' entry on the McDonaids in the Dictionary of New Zealand Biography

<sup>161</sup> In 1869, James McDonald drew up a list of 89 places in the diocese he had visited since 1852 on the bishop's behalf. POM 23-4 ( "Dr McDonald's Letter and Cutting Book 1868-69") ACDA

<sup>162</sup> "Letters and Records of Rev Dr McDonald 1858-59", filed in POM 23-1 ACDA

---

<sup>163</sup> SIMMONS, E R, **Pompallier, Prince of Bishops**, (Auckland: Catholic Publication Centre,1984), chapter thirteen especially pp158ff.; SIMMONS, E R, **In Cruce Salus- A History of the Diocese of Auckland**, (Auckland: Catholic Publication Centre, 1982), pp56ff

<sup>164</sup> *Daily Southern Cross* chronology, People Files (James McDonald) ACDA

<sup>165</sup> SIMMONS, **Pompallier**, chapter fifteen

<sup>166</sup> KEYS, Lilian G, **Life and Times of Bishop Pompallier** (Christchurch: Pegasus Press,1957), chapter thirteen, section 2

<sup>167</sup> LUC 36 (Diocesan Clergy) ACDA

<sup>168</sup> See letter of 8 November 1858 in "Letters and Records of Rev Dr McDonald 1858-59" POM 23-1 ACDA.

<sup>169</sup> Record of baptisms performed by James McDonald 1860-61, People Files (James McDonald) ACDA

<sup>170</sup> SIMMONS, **Pompallier**, chapter fifteen

<sup>171</sup> 16 May 1867 James McDonald to Dr Bennett POM 23-3 ACDA.

<sup>172</sup> SIMMONS, **In Cruce Salus**, p135.

<sup>173</sup> *ibid* p.126.

<sup>174</sup> "Last Journey of the Late Rev.Dr.McDonald" (obituary) *Herald* 4 August 1890.

<sup>175</sup> *ibid*. And see 19 February 1880 Steins to James McDonald STE 1-6/3 ACDA

<sup>176</sup> "Address to the Very Rev.Dr.McDonald" *Tablet* 9 April 1880

<sup>177</sup> LUC 36 (Diocesan Clergy) ACDA and Deceased Priests file ACDA

<sup>178</sup> "Last Journey of the Late Rev.Dr.McDonald" (obituary) *Herald* 4 August 1890.

<sup>179</sup> 4 August 1884 Maori petition to Luck LUC 28 (Maori Mission Letters) ACDA

<sup>180</sup> 18 August 1884 Wiremu Puriri to Walter McDonald, *ibid*

<sup>181</sup> Faculties granted by Luck to James McDonald for 1885-86, *ibid*

<sup>182</sup> 31 March 1885 James McDonald to Walter McDonald, *ibid*

<sup>183</sup> 8 March 1886 Maori petition to Luck, *ibid*

<sup>184</sup> [Undated] draft of letter in Luck's hand, *ibid*

<sup>185</sup> SIMMONSD, **In Cruce Salus**, pp178-179

<sup>186</sup> "Arrival of His Lordship the Bishop of Auckland", *Tablet* 6 February 1885

<sup>187</sup> 3 February 1885 Luck to Vaughan, LUC 25-6 [Correspondence re establishing of Mill Hill Maori Mission, chiefly with Bishop (later Cardinal) Vaughan and Canon Benoit, 1883-1895] ACDA

<sup>188</sup> Undated document written by Vaughan; and 21 August 1885 Luck to Vaughan, LUC 25-6 ACDA

<sup>189</sup> 18 September 1886 Luck to Cardinal Moran, LUC 25-6 ACDA

<sup>190</sup> Correspondence between Luck and Vaughan 1891-92, LUC 25-6 ACDA

<sup>191</sup> 27 November 1880 Fox to Sullivan [typed copy of letter from archives of St. Augustine's Abbey, Ramsgate, Kent], STE 1-11 ACDA

<sup>192</sup> SIMMONS, **In Cruce Salus**, pp178-179

<sup>193</sup> "Death of the Very Rev Dr James McDonald" *Tablet* 11 July 1890

<sup>194</sup> *ibid*

---

<sup>195</sup> McDONALD, Very Rev Walter, **History of the Parish of Mooncoin** (Kilkenny: Kilkenny Journal, 1959) p4 [extract filed in People Files (James McDonald) ACDA]

<sup>196</sup> The poem was forwarded, probably to Ernest Simmons, by Mr J Fahy, with an undated covering letter saying he had found it in a book which had been given to Michael Sheahan JP by Monsignor Hackett People Files (James McDonald) ACDA

<sup>197</sup> "A Forgotten Chapter in New Zealand Church History" *Marist Messenger* 1 September 1932

<sup>198</sup> "There Were Giants on the Earth in Those Days" (article by Robert Wilson) *Zealandia* 10 February 1966; and *Te Maketu – Our History* (Auckland Regional Authority pamphlet) 2003

<sup>199</sup> "Colonial Notes" *Tablet* 26 July 1889

<sup>200</sup> TUERLINGS, W, **Mill Hill and Maori Mission** (Auckland: St Joseph's New Zealand Foreign Missionary Society, 2001), p112

<sup>201</sup> "Last Journey of the Late Rev. Dr. McDonald" *Herald* 4 August 1890.

<sup>202</sup> Luck's notes on James McDonald LUC 36 (Diocesan Clergy) ACDA.

<sup>203</sup> "Hauhaus" were adherents of Pai Marire, the syncretistic Maori religion which combined elements of Christianity with traditional Maori beliefs. In some remoter areas, it challenged Christianity in the later nineteenth century

<sup>204</sup> Diary entry 17 December 1898, Lenihan's diary for 1898, LEN 4-2 ACDA

<sup>205</sup> "Funeral of the Very Rev Dr McDonald" *Herald* 13 July 1890

<sup>206</sup> The Late Rev. Dr McDonald' *Star* 11 July 1890

<sup>207</sup> "Funeral of the Very Rev Dr McDonald" *Herald* 13 July 1890

<sup>208</sup> The thesis was a sociological study from the Sociology Department at Canterbury University, New Zealand. See JAMIESON A, **A Churchless Faith** (1998) PhD Thesis, Sociology Department at Canterbury University, New Zealand.

<sup>209</sup> Interviewees were selected using a snowballing method and comparative sampling techniques. A wide geographical spread was gained with people from both rural and urban areas from a number of regions in New Zealand (including Christchurch, Auckland, Dunedin and Nelson) and a small sample of interviewees from Melbourne, Australia.

<sup>210</sup> Beyond their 18<sup>th</sup> birthday. This is the general age of adulthood in New Zealand, being the age people can legally vote, marry, join the military, and purchase alcohol.

<sup>211</sup> The interviewees listed here were 'well' qualified for those in New Zealand from the same age grouping. In 1991 between 47-55% of male Baby Boomers (those aged between 25 and 44 years of age) and 37-43% of females (in the same age group) had tertiary qualifications. Results from the New Zealand Nation Church Life Survey (taken in 1997) suggest that church attenders hold higher educational qualifications with 21% of all church attenders having attained a tertiary degree. These figures rose to 27% of Baptists and 30% of those who attend Elim churches (a Pentecostal stream of churches).

<sup>212</sup> To be categorised as having a 'strong' church background they needed to have attended children's and youth programmes run by the church and were supported in doing so by their parents' own involvement in the church.

<sup>213</sup> That is, they attended some church-based children's programmes and/or youth programmes but were not supported by the regular attendance and involvement of their parents in a church.

<sup>214</sup> "Train a child in the way he should go and when he is old he will not depart from it." (Proverbs 22:6).

<sup>215</sup> The significant leadership positions included involvement in church governance groups, home group leaders, youth leadership, children's leadership, being in charge of leading worship and evangelistic, community care or prayer ministries.

<sup>216</sup> The basis of such conflict typically revolved around the direction, vision, leadership structure and decisions of either their church or a number of EPC churches in which they had been involved.

---

<sup>217</sup> The level of critique of the “angry” or the “hurt” did not extend to questioning the whole basis of evangelical Pentecostal/charismatic faith itself. On the contrary, it is these understandings of what the church should be that such leavers used as the foundation for their claim that the church had failed.

<sup>218</sup> Quiet times refer to regular (often daily) times of personal prayer, bible reading and reflection.

<sup>219</sup> Of all the groups of leavers the Displaced Followers typically quoted a number of passages from scripture to reinforce their present faith position and the rightness of their decision to leave the church.

<sup>220</sup> Meta-grumbles are focused on the deep rooted foundations of the Christian faith.

<sup>221</sup> To use an analogy from the courtroom, the internal jury has reached a verdict on these faith elements and now sees them as being plausible, “beyond reasonable doubt.” What constitutes “reasonable doubt” varies from person to person. As mentioned earlier, for some the examination process involves rigorous theological and philosophical debate through reading and/or through interaction with others. While for others “reasonable doubt” is based more on personal experience and what is plausible to them at an intuitive, “gut-level.” The transitional faith stance indicates that the internal jury has begun to read its verdict on at least some of the elements of faith and is reporting a verdict of positive personal appropriation.

<sup>222</sup> Anthropologist Arnold VAN GENNEP first used the word “liminal” (from the Latin limen “threshold”) to signify an in-between time. VAN GENNEP says: “Liminality, therefore, can be described as an ambiguous, sacred, social state in which a person or group of persons is separated for a time from the normal structure of society.” (the reference is required here) It is the threshold of the new.

<sup>223</sup> Every attempt was made to find people but some had moved over the five year period without leaving forwarding addresses. Three letters were posted to each address over a six-month period asking people to be part of the research.

<sup>224</sup> A Sixty-six percent return for a detailed questionnaire requiring a substantial amount of each respondent’s time and thought represents a very high return rate and provides a significant basis from which to draw conclusions. The questionnaire is demanding in two respects. Firstly it involves four A4 pages of open questions. This necessitates a large amount of thought and time to answer. Secondly, the questions probe personal issues about faith and the individual’s personal life. Because of the length, the open nature of the questions and the personal nature of the material, the return rate was very positive.

<sup>225</sup> The two who had returned to a church had been out of church for a relatively short period of time - less than one year, and their reasons for leaving were very much focused on the leadership style of one particular church.

<sup>226</sup> In one case the person, Edward, had undergone a substantial geographical, cultural and work shift that had isolated him from many of his friendships and Christian networks. He wrote extensively about this change of faith, lamenting to some degree what he had lost. The other had some involvement in a Pentecostal church because of family reasons. This was a church he attended occasionally. Although attending this church he had a number of major questions about core elements of the Christian faith and was best characterised as a Transitional Explorer.

<sup>227</sup> An abbreviation for an evangelical Pentecostal or charismatic church.

<sup>228</sup> Although these three continue to be involved in an established church it is not an EPC style church either in theology or practice and their participation is limited. These three persons’ participation in church activities will be discussed below.

<sup>229</sup> This does not include the six people who returned questionnaires who never left the church, three of whom were Integrated Way-finders who had never left the church, although they had created some internal distance from it while working through their own personal faith changes. Two of the three, a married couple, were involved in a small main-line traditional church in a marginalised ethnic community. This couple were not themselves part of this ethnic group but were part of the church because of their social-justice and mission convictions. The husband said of church – “I personally relate to a wide variety of churches, from the Christian Gay Stream right through to the pretty fundamentalist fellowships. I try to focus on the positives of each congregation . . . and do not think it appropriate to challenge the ‘immature’ or inconsistent aspects of congregational life, expectant that God in his own time will draw these issues to the attention of the congregations. Over the last five years, I would say that my tolerance for congregations at the edge of orthodoxy has grown, trusting that positives for God’s kingdom will result.” The third said he attended a church on average once a

---

month – “I just attend with no other commitment. My faith life is lived in my daily experience. The Sunday church expression of this is a minimal part of my experience.” These quotes indicate the type and role of established church in the faith of Integrated Way-finders.

<sup>230</sup> This title first appeared as *Chaplains in State Government Schools: Blessing or Curse?*, **Zadok Perspectives** No107, Winter 2010, pp17-18. This paper is an extended version of the original work published in the above journal.

<sup>231</sup> BLUETT, Mary, *God goes to the top of the class*, **Herald Sun**, 1 November 2006. Mary Bluett, the then Victorian President of the Australian Education Union was quoted as saying, “John Howard’s announcement of \$90 million over three years to fund school chaplains seems to be more about the Federal Government’s own agenda than addressing the needs of schools.”

GRIBBIN, Gordon, *Tunnel vision*, Letters to the Editor, **The Sunday Age**, 18 June 2006. This writer was “dismayed” at the proposal and saw it as an opportunity for “all religions to communicate their beliefs and superstitions.”

RICKARD, Peter, *Role models, please*, Letters to the Editor, **The Sunday Age**, 18 June 2006. This writer described the proposal as “misguided” and said that “the development of moral fibre in students is not going to be achieved by a sprinkling of a few chaplains through the state school system.”

O’BRIEN, Geoff, *What’s the problem?*, Letters to the Editor, **The Sunday Age**, 18 June 2010. This writer welcomed the entry of “values” into the state school system and was rather dismissive of the “aging, failed 1970s neo-socialists who run Victoria’s education system...”

<sup>232</sup> HOWARD, John, *This is not an attempt to force-feed religion to our children*, **The Age**, 1 November 2006. “Chaplains already make a valuable contribution to the pastoral care, personal, spiritual and emotional wellbeing of young people and the nation. This program will ensure many more schools will also benefit from the presence of a chaplain.”

KOUTSOUKIS, Jason, *State-school chaplains push*, **The Sunday Age**, 11 June 2006. Education Minister, Julie Bishop strongly supported the idea saying, “This proposal is consistent with the national framework for values education in the Australian schools program.” Her colleague, Greg Hunt MP said there was a “clear need for values based guidance and religious education that a chaplain could provide.”

<sup>233</sup> INGOLDSBY, James, *Neither Republic, nor Secular*, **Zadok Perspectives** No 107, Winter 2010, p16. “A noted culture warrior, our last Prime Minister held strong views on the role of education in transmitting ‘values,’ and was convinced government schools were falling down on the job.”

Editorial *Is it ‘right’ to have God in the classroom?*, **The Sunday Age**, 18 June 2006. The Editor writes, “Ultimately, the proposal raises more problems than it would solve. A wider concern is that it is a continuation of the meddling of religion with conservative politics.”

<sup>234</sup> Herald-Sun Newspaper, **Herald Sun**, 21 November 2009. “...in an announcement today the Prime Minister will say the Government recognises the importance of the chaplain support services and will extend the program to the end of 2011 to all schools receiving funding under the program.” The Opposition education spokesman Christopher Pyne was quoted in the same article that he wants the program expanded.

<sup>235</sup> GORDON, Josh, *Gillard pitches to Christian voters*, **The Age**, 8 August 2010. “Ms Gillard will today announce an allocation of \$222 million to boost the number of chaplains in schools by more than one-third, which will mean 3700 schools will be covered under the voluntary scheme introduced by the Howard government.”

---

<sup>236</sup> HARRISON, Dan, *Greens push for counsellors, not chaplains*, **The Age**, 27 March 2010. The leaders of the Greens Party, Senator Brown said that the chaplaincy program, introduced by the Howard government in 2007, was “a very old idea, very much short of meeting the needs of schools in 2010. It has a religious basis whereas we are wanting to fund the program according to the needs of students.”

<sup>237</sup> BACHELARD, Michael, *Chaplains in schools challenged*, **The Sunday Age**, 5 September 2010. The Australian Constitution prevents any law being passed that provides “for establishing any religion, or for imposing any religious observance.”

<sup>238</sup> *ibid* - The Australian Council of State School Organizations called chaplaincy “the wrong response and for the wrong reasons.” The Psychological Society spokeswoman, Dr Monica Thielking said “early intervention programs for children’s mental health were too scarce because of lack of money, and the government was wasting money on chaplaincy.”

SMITH, Tanya, *Erring on chaplains*, Letters to the Editor, **The Age**, 10 August 2010. The writer said, “I’m disgusted the government has pledged \$222 million of taxpayers’ money for more chaplains. How about counsellors instead?”

STOCKS, Narelle, *Critical Thinking, not Chaplains*, Letters to the Editor, **The Sunday Age**, 15 August 2010. The writer said, “Julia, where are you? Someone really interested in educating children doesn’t waste money on chaplains...”

<sup>239</sup> VENNING, Christopher, *Chaplaincy in the State Schools of Victoria*, **Journal of Christian Education**, Vol 48, No1 May 2005, p9

The Council for Christian Education in Schools (CCES), **Faith for life: 1890-1990**, (published 1990), p12. The CCES appointed its first full time post- primary school chaplains to three inner-city technical schools, Collingwood, Footscray and Brunswick in 1955.

<sup>240</sup> VENNING, Christopher, *Chaplaincy in the State Schools of Victoria*, p10

<sup>241</sup> See **Education and Training Reform Act 2006** Division 2 **Instruction in Government Schools** 2.2.10. Education in Government schools to be secular and 2.2.11 Special Religious Education, [www.education.vic.gov.au](http://www.education.vic.gov.au)

<sup>242</sup> VENNING, Christopher, *Chaplaincy in the State Schools of Victoria*, p11

<sup>243</sup> SCOTT, Shane, *Chaplaincy in a State High School*, **Journal of Christian Education**, Vol 41, No 3, November 1998, p46

<sup>244</sup> SALECICH, Judy and WATTS, John, *The Nature and worth of chaplaincy services in Queensland state schools*, **Journal of Christian Education**, Vol 49, No 3, December 2006, p14

<sup>245</sup> HILL, Brian, *Editorial: Chaplains in State Schools*, **Journal of Christian Education**, Vol 48, No 1, May, 2005, p4

<sup>246</sup> The Council for Christian Education in Schools is now trading as **ACCESS ministries**. The new name was launched in June, 2007

<sup>247</sup> ACCESS ministries, *Chaplains Generic Job Description*, 2010

<sup>248</sup> KOUTSOUKIS, Jason, *A dream of a job-and in a class of its own*, **The Sunday Age**, 18 June 2006

<sup>249</sup> ACCESS ministries publication, **We are there**, 2010. See also MONAHAN, Luke, and RENEHAN, Caroline, **The Chaplain: A Faith Presence in the School Community** (Dublin: The Columbia Press, 1998), pp22-33

<sup>250</sup> **College News: News and Information from Box Forest College**, February, 2006

<sup>251</sup> HARRISON, Dan, *Poor parenting alarms schools*, **The Age**, 12 November 2009

<sup>252</sup> *ibid*

---

<sup>253</sup> HUGHES, Philip and SIMS, Margaret, **The Effectiveness of Chaplaincy: As Provided by the National School Chaplaincy Association in Government Schools in Australia** (Perth: Edith Cowan University, 2009)

<sup>254</sup> GRIBBIN, Gordon, *Tunnel vision*

SMITH, Tanya, *Erring on chaplains*. This writer's letter started with, "I'm DISGUSTED."

<sup>255</sup> COLE, Jean, *They can't be serious*, Letter to the Editor, **The Sunday Age**, 18 June 2006.

<sup>256</sup> BACHELARD, Michael, *Chaplains in schools challenged*, **The Sunday Age**, 5 September 2010. See also MURPHY, D, *With God at their side, the lesson beginneth*, **The Age**, 15 November 2010. This journalist makes the point that as the NSCP was not put in legislation it will be very difficult to challenge on such grounds. This recent article is in many respects a summation of the various criticisms of the NSCP since its implementation.

<sup>257</sup> FRAME, Tom, **Church and State: Australia's Imaginary Wall**, (Sydney: UNSW Press, 2006). The basic thesis of this book is that both the Christian community and the broader secular community have a very poor understanding of the nature of the relationship between the Church and State in this country. Frame suggests too that there are ambiguities in the relationship that need to be clarified. This ambiguity is in part due to what Maple suggests that "in Australia the separation of church and state has never been as complete as it has been in the United States." See MAPLE, G, *Religious Education in Australia and New Zealand* in FELDERHOF, M, THOMPSON, P and TOREVELL, D, **Inspiring Faith in Schools: Studies in Religious Education** (England: Ashgate Publishing, 2007)

<sup>258</sup> FRAME, pp7-8

<sup>259</sup> MANGOLD, Peter, *Making sense*, Letters to the Editor, **The Sunday Age**, 18 June, 2006.

<sup>260</sup> TANG, C, *School chaplains master the art of just talking to students*, **The Age**, 15 November 2010

<sup>261</sup> **National Schools Chaplaincy Programme Guidelines** see The Department of Employment, Education & Work Place Relations website at [www.deewr.gov.au/Schooling/NationalSchoolChaplaincyProgram](http://www.deewr.gov.au/Schooling/NationalSchoolChaplaincyProgram) p18

<sup>262</sup> JACKSON, David, *The Evangelical Christian School: some critical issues*, **Journal of Christian Education**, Vol 52, No 2, September 2009, p20

<sup>263</sup> See the Victorian Government website [www.education.vic.gov.au](http://www.education.vic.gov.au)

<sup>264</sup> KOUTSOUKIS, Jason, *State-school chaplains push*

<sup>265</sup> HOWARD, John, *This is not an attempt to force-feed religion to our children*

<sup>266</sup> **National Schools Chaplaincy Programme Guidelines**, p3

<sup>267</sup> **The Australian Council of State School Organisations** quoted in BACHELARD, Michael, *Chaplains in schools challenged*

<sup>268</sup> LEUNG, Chee, *School chaplains to choose between preaching and pay*, **The Age**, 27 December 2006

<sup>269</sup> BACHELARD, Michael, *Chaplains in schools challenged*

<sup>270</sup> CANNOLD, Leslie, *The National Schools Chaplaincy Program is an Accident Waiting to Happen*, 15 August, 2010 - see [www.cannold.com/media/2010-08-15](http://www.cannold.com/media/2010-08-15)

<sup>271</sup> HARRISON, Dan, *Greens push for counsellors, not chaplains*

---

<sup>272</sup> BACHELARD, Michael, *Chaplains in schools challenged*

<sup>273</sup> **National Schools Chaplaincy Programme Guidelines**, pp19-21

<sup>274</sup> BACHELARD, Michael, *Chaplains in schools challenged*

<sup>275</sup> HOLM, Neil, *Toward a Theology of the Ministry of Presence in Chaplaincy*, **Journal of Christian Education**, Vol 52, No 1, May 2009. See also MONAHAN, Luke and RENEHAN, Caroline, **The Chaplain: A Faith Presence in the School Community**

<sup>276</sup> SINGHAM, P T, *Suffer the chaplains in schools*, **The West Australian**, 9 October 2006, p21

<sup>277</sup> *ibid*

<sup>278</sup> See the following Australian books and articles that outline in detail the nature of this mission - BERLACH, Richard and THORNBUR, Brian (eds), **Pastoral Care: The First Ten Years in Western Australian Government Secondary Schools**, (Perth: Edith Cowan University, 1993)

BROWN, Adrian, JOHNSTONE, David and MORDINI, Anthony (eds), **Managing the Ministry: A Handbook for School Chaplains**, (South Australia: Australian Association for Religious Education, 1997)

CRONSHAW, Darren, **Credible Witness: Companions, Prophets, Hosts & Other Australian Mission Models**, (Springvale: Urban Neighbours of Hope, 2006) pp43-57

HUGHES, Philip, *Shaping Australia's Spirituality: A Review of Christian Ministry in the Australian Context*, **Christian Research Association**, August, 2010

KABAMBA, Joelle, **The Chaplaincy Phenomena**, (Brisbane: Spencer Publishing, 2007)

PIETSCH, Michael, *Dietrich Bonhoeffer's Christology as a Framework for School Chaplaincy*, An adapted version of a theses submitted for the degree of Master of Theology with Melbourne College of Divinity (Hawthorndene: Mike Pietsch, 2008)

ROBINSON, Stephen, **Ministry in Disaster Settings: Lessons from the Edge**, (Rossmore: Artex Printing, 2006)

<sup>279</sup> PAGET, Naomi and, McCORMACK, Janet, **The Work of the Chaplain**, (Valley Forge: Judson Press, 2006) pp2-3. Christian chaplaincy has its roots in the story of St Martin of Tours. Martin was a compassionate 4<sup>th</sup> century soldier, who encountered a shivering beggar on a cold winter night. Having no money in his purse, he took off his cloak and slashed it with his sword to give half of it to the beggar. Later that night Martin saw a vision in which Jesus was wearing the half cloak. He became a believer, was baptized and eventually left the army to join the Church. Martin would eventually become a Bishop and the Patron Saint of France. He became a Chaplain to the French King and his cape became a sacred relic of the church that was taken into battle to symbolize the presence of God.

<sup>280</sup> ACCESS ministries publication, **We are there**

<sup>281</sup> *ibid*

<sup>282</sup> HUGHES, Philip and SIMS, Margaret, **The Effectiveness of Chaplaincy**

<sup>283</sup> *ibid*, p5

<sup>284</sup> HUGHES, Philip, *Review of Chaplaincy in State Schools in Australia*, **Pointers: Bulletin of the Christian Research Association**, Vol 20, No 1, March 2010, p1. The National Schools Chaplaincy Association is a body comprising all the major government school chaplaincy provider services in each state and territory of Australia.

<sup>285</sup> See Hon John Kaye MLC, a NSW Greens parliamentarian who has been a strident critique of the NSCP <http://www.johnkaye.org.au>



---

<sup>286</sup> The Hon John Kaye quoted in HASTIE, David, *Its high tide for school chaplains*, **Eternity Newspaper**, April 2010, p8

<sup>287</sup> *ibid*

<sup>288</sup> ACCESS ministries publication, **We are there**

<sup>289</sup> John 1:14 - The incarnation of Christ is one of many biblical models that informs chaplains about the nature of their ministries.

<sup>290</sup> A "Bible belt" occurs with expanding urbanisation. "...People in those newer suburbs more readily adopt different lifestyles which include church attendance in their initial years until sociological structures are more solidified." Robinson, Stuart, *email*, 20 Feb 2006. See definition by DAVISON, Graeme, *Suburban Character*, in *People and Place*, Vol 7, No 4, Nov 1995.

<sup>291</sup> The term "Crossway Movement" first appeared in a confidential discussion paper on the church's future, prepared by Robinson for a Crossway board retreat in 2004.

<sup>292</sup> Bebbington's "quadrilateral." BEBBINGTON, David, *Evangelicalism in Modern Britain: A History from the 1790s to the 1980s*, (London: Unwin Hyman, 1989), p3.

<sup>293</sup> BECKER, Penny E, *Congregations in Conflict: Cultural Models of Local Religious Life*, (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1999), p15.

<sup>294</sup> There was an interim moderator, E T Laxton, from Oct 1961 to May 1962, between Pastors George Ashworth and David Griffiths.

<sup>295</sup> Discussion of the third period includes an additional eighteen months after Croucher left, when Kevin Forbes was interim pastor.

<sup>296</sup> An analysis of the relationship between leadership style and Crossway's organisational culture from 1954-2007 can be found in PARSONS, M and COHEN, D J [eds], *Beyond 400: Explorations in Baptist Ecclesiology*, (Eugene: Wipf & Stock, 2011). For a full history of all five eras, see NEWHAM, J H, *Counter-cultural and Popular: Crossway Baptist Church's Ecclesiology and Culture in Its First Half-Century*, Thesis, Master of Theology, Australian College of Theology (pending).

<sup>297</sup> FLETCHER, Ronald, in BULLOCK, A and STALLYBRASS, O [eds], *The Fontana Dictionary of Modern Thought*, (London: Fontana Books, 1977), p150.

<sup>298</sup> SCHEIN, Edgar H, *Organisational Culture and Leadership*, 2<sup>nd</sup> ed, (San Francisco: Jossey-Bass, 1992), p12.

<sup>299</sup> *ibid*, pp16-25.

<sup>300</sup> For the use of the cultural lenses of Schneider and Becker, see PUGH, Jeffrey, *Fantasyland Faith: The Redemptive Role of Ethical Leaders in Neurotic Church Cultures*, (Saarbrucken, Germany: VDM Verlag Dr Muller, 2007), pp44-50.

<sup>301</sup> SCHNEIDER, William E, *The Reengineering Alternative: A Plan for Making Your Current Culture Work*, Reprint ed, (New York: Richard D Irwin Inc, 1994).

<sup>302</sup> An example is the "role" culture, which assumes that employees are rational and that roles can be defined and discharged within clearly defined procedures. BNET Business Dictionary, <http://dictionary.bnet.com/definition/role+culture.html>

<sup>303</sup> The Reverend Dr Rowland C Croucher BA BD MEd LTh DipRE DMin. He was educated at Bathurst Teachers' College, the Universities of New England and Sydney, the Baptist Theological College in NSW and Fuller Seminary, California. When Croucher arrived at BBC in 1972, the family-oriented church under Ashworth and Griffiths had grown to 365 members and about 500 worshipping on a Sunday.

<sup>304</sup> Annual Report, BBC, July 1978

<sup>305</sup> Adrian, Ces. One of the pastors was possibly too radical even for the diverse 1970s BBC culture and his resignation seems to have been connected with this issue.

<sup>306</sup> The remnant of a nearby fractured Baptist church also joined BBC during Croucher's time.

<sup>307</sup> At an evening debate on the charismatic movement, all seven pastors presented their own perspectives before the topic was thrown open to the congregation.

<sup>308</sup> Sandy. A number of participants recalled in particular one Sunday evening debate involving a Palestinian Arab and a rabbinic Jew.

<sup>309</sup> In 1979 there were 489 people in 41 cell groups; in 1980, 502 in 36 groups; in 1981, 545 in 43 groups; in 1982, there were 40 groups, and in 1983 at the time of Robinson's arrival, 46 groups including 14 young adult groups. From BBC Annual Reports.

<sup>310</sup> Sandy, Pip etc. Costello writes about his 1975 meeting of Bill Hallam, whom he calls a "mature age (all of twenty-seven) hippie", which led to "impassioned conversations" and sowed for both men

---

seeds for future work in faith and justice. Costello, Tim, *Streets of Hope: Finding God in St Kilda*, (St Leonards: Allen & Unwin, 1998), p36

<sup>311</sup> The style of management of the coffee shop project in nearby Forest Hill shopping centre and a drop-in centre on the church property reflected the permission-granting, experimental style of Croucher.

<sup>312</sup> Annual reports, 1979, 1980. Within a year, under Daniel Tse's leadership a Chinese Baptist fellowship was meeting weekly at Whitley College.

<sup>313</sup> CROUCHER, R, interview, 13 September 2006

<sup>314</sup> CROUCHER, R, *Charismatic Renewal: Myths and Realities*, <http://jmm.aaa.net.au/articles/12475.htm>.

<sup>315</sup> Croucher says he twice used a directive approach: to propose an experimental format for the evening service, and to ask for "extra pastoral staff before we could afford them." Croucher, R, *Email*, 15 September 2010.

<sup>316</sup> In 1982 there were 772 church members and 25 salaried staff. The pastoral team consisted of seven salaried pastors and two unpaid team members, Ralph Wilkins and Bert Waddell. Croucher, 13 September 2006.

<sup>317</sup> Sam. Croucher himself was aware of "church growth" principles. In an essay he cited McGavran and Wagner: see CROUCHER, Rowland, *Church Growth*, in *On Being*, Aug-Sep 1976.

<sup>318</sup> Now Rev Dr Stuart M. Robinson BA BD DMin. He was educated at the University of Queensland, majoring in psychology, the Baptist College of Queensland (ordination), the Melbourne College of Divinity and Fuller Seminary.

<sup>319</sup> See ROBINSON, Stuart, *Confidential: Something Christian Community (A regional church of the Baptist Union of Victoria)*, "Knowing Christ and Making Him Known", BBC paper, 17 May 1984.

<sup>320</sup> Kenneth, Jesse, Nicky, Redmond.

<sup>321</sup> WAGNER, C Peter, *Churchquake! How the New Apostolic Reformation Is Shaking up the Church as We Know It*, (Ventura: Regal, 1999).

<sup>322</sup> From Luke 1:37 and 18:27.

<sup>323</sup> "Faith is spelled R-I-S-K" was apparently first coined in 1985 or 1986 by John Wimber, founder of the Vineyard movement.

<sup>324</sup> Until this point, BBC was organised under a statement of purpose "Knowing Christ and Making Him Known."

<sup>325</sup> First set in 1993, "Faith Targets" for 2000AD: "2000 members, 1600 (80%) in small groups, 300 (15%) in weekly corporate prayer, 100 (5%) deployed cross culturally, 3 new daughter churches, all facilities built and debt free" (emphasis original). Senior pastor's "vision" file, 1993.

<sup>326</sup> ROBINSON, Stuart, information paper, 17 May 1984. Also, JESSE, Redmond.

<sup>327</sup> As recommended by GEORGE, Carl F, *How to Break Growth Barriers: Capturing Overlooked Opportunities for Church Growth*, (Grand Rapids: Baker, 1993), pp91-2.

<sup>328</sup> "Progressives", including evangelical progressives, have a focus on the intellectual integrity of their faith, willingness to question tradition, acceptance of human diversity, and an emphasis on care for the marginalised.

<sup>329</sup> Robinson had written to the church council as early as September 1992, mentioning a Hybels (Willow Creek) seminar and his intention to review BBC's service formats "aiming to make some of them more contextualised and seeker sensitive."

<sup>330</sup> HENDRIE, Doug, *Youth Crusade*, in *Melbourne Weekly Bayside*, 27 June 2007.

<sup>331</sup> In the 1980s and 90s, BBC's worship was influenced by Pentecostalism, with accompanying displays of the more contentious spiritual gifts such as messages in tongues, "words of knowledge" and prophecy.

<sup>332</sup> For the ethnic congregations, and plants such as Crossway Moreland, Crossway South, Crossway North. The concept of Crossway "DNA" refers to home-grown pastors and leaders who have been trained in Crossway's style of worship, ministry and governance. See *Crossway – A Movement*, 2002, and *The Crossway Network*, Nov 2004. Church council papers.

<sup>333</sup> McGavran was Founding Dean of the Fuller School of World Mission, 1965. McGAVRAN, Donald A, *Understanding Church Growth*, 1<sup>st</sup> ed, (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1970).

<sup>334</sup> STEWART, G, VENZ, S, WILKINSON-HAYES, A and WOFF, A, *Two Perspectives on Church Membership*, Baptist Union of Victoria, 8 Oct 2009. Conference paper.

<sup>335</sup> The marketing principle of focus on the client, reflected in "seeker-sensitive" worship for example, can encourage a culture of "shopping around" to find a church that suits.

<sup>336</sup> ROBINSON, Stuart, interview, 24 Aug 2009.

<sup>337</sup> ROBINSON, 24 Aug 2009, and others.

---

<sup>338</sup> Average weekly attendance (all services, age groups and campuses) was 3505 in 2005, 3646 in 2006, and 3516 in 2007. Over the 54 years to Dec 2007, 3632 adults joined BBC/Crossway; 1426 members remain, a loss of 2,206.

<sup>339</sup> An example was signing for the deaf, and the Hawkins family's "Living Waters" home and practical care for "wheelies."

<sup>340</sup> ROBINSON, Stuart, 24 Aug 2009, and others.

<sup>341</sup> MARTIN, David, *On Secularization: Towards a Revised General Theory*, (Farnham: Ashgate, 2005), p134

<sup>342</sup> *ibid*, p135